

**Minutes of the 1162<sup>nd</sup> Meeting of the  
Town Planning Board held on 25.5.2018**

**Present**

Permanent Secretary for Development  
(Planning and Lands)  
Ms Bernadette H.H. Linn

Chairperson

Professor S.C. Wong

Vice-Chairperson

Mr Lincoln L.H. Huang

Mr H.W. Cheung

Mr Sunny L.K. Ho

Dr F.C. Chan

Mr David Y.T. Lui

Mr Peter K.T. Yuen

Mr Philip S.L. Kan

Dr Lawrence W.C. Poon

Mr Wilson Y.W. Fung

Mr Alex T.H. Lai

Professor T.S. Liu

Miss Winnie W.M. Ng

Ms Sandy H.Y. Wong

Chief Engineer (Works)  
Home Affairs Department  
Mr Martin W.C. Kwan

Principal Environmental Protection Officer/Strategic Assessment,  
Environmental Protection Department  
Mr Raymond W.M. Wong

Principal Assistant Secretary (Transport) 3  
Transport and Housing Bureau  
Mr Andy S.H. Lam

Director of Lands  
Mr Thomas C.C. Chan

Director of Planning  
Mr Raymond K.W. Lee

Deputy Director of Planning/District  
Ms Jacinta K.C. Woo

Secretary

**Absent with Apologies**

Mr Ivan C.S. Fu

Mr Stephen H.B. Yau

Dr Frankie W.C. Yeung

Dr Lawrence K.C. Li

Mr Stephen L.H. Liu

Mr K.K. Cheung

Dr C.H. Hau

Mr Thomas O.S. Ho

Mr Franklin Yu

Note: The following Members newly appointed to the Town Planning Board with effect from 1 April 2018 were not invited to this meeting as the hearing sessions took place before their appointment:

Mr Stanley T.S. Choi

Mr L.T. Kwok

Mr Daniel K.S. Lau

Ms Lilian S.K. Law

Mr K.W. Leung

Professor John C.Y. Ng

Dr Jeanne C.Y. Ng

Professor Jonathan W.C. Wong

Mr Ricky W.Y. Yu

**In Attendance**

Assistant Director of Planning/Board

Ms April K.Y. Kun

Chief Town Planner/Town Planning Board

Mr Kepler S.Y. Yuen

Senior Town Planner/Town Planning Board

Mr Eric C.Y. Chiu

**Tuen Mun and Yuen Long West District**

**Agenda Item 1**

[Open meeting]

**Confirmation of Minutes of the 1162<sup>nd</sup> Meeting held on 30.1.2018, 1.2.2018 and 7.2.2018**

[The item was conducted in Cantonese.]

1. The minutes of the 1162<sup>nd</sup> meeting held on 30.1.2018, 1.2.2018 and 7.2.2018 were confirmed without amendments.

**Agenda Item 2**

[Closed Meeting (Deliberation)]

Consideration of Representations and Comments in respect of Draft Hung Shui Kiu and Ha Tsuen Outline Zoning Plan No. S/HSK/1  
(TPB Paper No. 10378)

---

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese and English]

**Deliberation Session**

2. The meeting noted that, other than the minutes of meeting, the video recording of the hearing sessions held on 30.1.2018, 1.2.2018 and 7.2.2018 were sent to Members on 17.5.2018.
3. The Secretary said that Members' declaration of interests on the item was reported in the minutes of hearing sessions of the meeting on 30.1.2018, 1.2.2018 and 7.2.2018. The declaration of interests, updated to reflect the change in membership which took place on 1.4.2018, as shown on the visualiser, was as follows :

- Mr Raymond K.W. Lee  
(as Director of Planning)
- being a member of the Strategic Planning Committee (SPC) and Building Committee of Hong Kong Housing Authority (HKHA)
- Mr Thomas C.C. Chan  
(as Director of Lands)
- being a member of HKHA
- Mr Martin W.C. Kwan  
(as Chief Engineer (Works),  
Home Affairs Department)
- being an alternative member for the Director of Home Affairs who was a member of SPC and Subsidized Housing Committee of HKHA
- Mr Thomas O.S. Ho
- having current business dealings with HKHA and Mass Transit Railway Corporation Limited (MTRCL), personally knowing the co-founder and Chief Executive Officer of Designing Hong Kong Limited and having past business dealings with AECOM Asia Company Limited (AECOM)
- Mr Ivan C.S. Fu
- having current business dealings with AECOM, MTRCL and Masterplan Limited, and past business dealings with HKHA
- Dr C.H. Hau
- having current business dealings with HKHA; being a member of Hong Kong Bird Watching Society; a life member of Conservancy Association (CA) and his spouse being the Honorary Secretary of the Board of Directors of

CA; and a past member of the Conservation Advisory Committee of World Wide Fund for Nature Hong Kong

- |   |   |   |
|---|---|---|
| Mr K.K. Cheung                            | ] | their firm having current business  |
| Mr Alex T.H. Lai                          | ] | dealings with HKHA and MTRCL  |
| Mr Stephen L.H. Liu                       | ] | having past business dealings with  |
|   | ] | HKHA and MTRCL  |
| Mr Franklin Yu                            | - | having past business dealings with HKHA, AECOM and MTRCL  |
| Professor S.C. Wong<br>(Vice-Chairperson) | - | having current business dealings with AECOM and being a member of the Advisory Committee for Accredited Programme of MTR Academy          |
| Dr Lawrence W.C. Poon                     | - | his spouse being a civil servant of Housing Department (HD) but not involved in planning work   |
| Mr Peter K.T. Yuen                        | - | being a member of the Board of Governors of the Hong Kong Arts Centre, which had collaborated with the MTRCL on a number of arts projects |

4. The Secretary reported that Members' interests for having affiliation/business dealings with HD/HKHA were indirect as the proposed public housing developments in the draft Hung Shui Kiu and Ha Tsuen Outline Zoning Plan No. S/HSK/1 (the draft OZP) were related to housing sites in general. Members noted that Mr Ivan C.S. Fu, Mr K.K. Cheung, Mr Thomas O.S. Ho, Mr Stephen L.H. Liu, Dr C.H. Hau and Mr Franklin Yu had

tendered apologies for being unable to attend this session of the meeting. The meeting agreed that the interests of other Members were indirect as they had no involvement in the Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area Study (the HSK Study) and representations of the draft OZP hence they could stay in the meeting.

### Deliberation

5. To facilitate deliberation, the Secretary briefly recapitulated the background in respect of representations/comments on the draft OZP as follows:

- (a) the HSK Study was commissioned jointly by the Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) and Planning Department (PlanD) with a view to formulating a planning and development framework for the implementation of the Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area (HSK NDA). On 26.5.2017, the draft OZP was exhibited for public inspection under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance); and
- (b) during the exhibition periods, a total of 117 valid representations (including 3 support and 114 oppose) and 338 valid comments were received.

6. The Secretary then went through the major points made by the representers and commenters in their written and oral submissions, and the responses of relevant government departments, as recorded in the relevant TPB paper and the minutes of meeting.

[Mr David Y.T. Lui, Miss Winnie W.M. Ng and Ms Sandy H.Y. Wong arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

### Supportive Representations

7. The meeting noted that representers R1(Part) to R3(Part) supported the HSK NDA development and R4 and R9 supported development of the proposed refuse

collection point (RCP) between Hung Yuen Road and Hung Ping Road. The supportive grounds had been noted by relevant government departments.

### Adverse Representations and Comments

#### *Role and Positioning of HSK NDA*

8. The meeting noted that some representers/commenters had raised that the role and positioning of HSK NDA in the long-term development of Hong Kong and Pearl River Delta Greater Bay Area should be clarified.

9. The meeting also noted the response of relevant government departments that the HSK NDA fell within the Western Economic Corridor which sought to capitalise on the location advantage and was positioned as the “Regional Economic and Civic Hub” for the whole North West New Territories (NWNT) region.

#### *Economic Development and Employment Opportunity*

10. The meeting noted that some representers/commenters had made the following main points and proposals:

- (a) there were queries on the development of logistics operations, port back-up and Enterprise and Technology Park and the estimation of the 150,000 new employment opportunities to be provided by HSK NDA;
- (b) HSK was not a strategic location suitable for development of Enterprise and Technology Park;
- (c) land utilisation should be maximised by increasing the plot ratios (PR) and building height restrictions (BHR) of Logistics, Enterprise and Technology Quarter and “Industrial” zone; and
- (d) to rezone “Other Specified Uses” (“OU”) annotated “Logistics Facility”,

“OU(Enterprise and Technology Park)” and “OU(Port Back-up, Storage and Workshop Uses)” zones to “OU(Business)” with higher PR and relax the permissible uses in the “OU” zones.

11. The meeting also noted that the relevant government departments had made the following responses:

- (a) given its strategic location on major freight and passenger routes between Hong Kong and Shenzhen, the HSK NDA was considered suitable for accommodating economic uses;
- (b) the estimation of employment opportunities had taken account of the proposed gross floor area (GFA) for various economic, retail and government, institute and community (GIC) uses, as well as employment assumptions adopted from the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG);
- (c) the size of individual logistics sites had been increased (ranging from 3.5 ha to 4.8 ha) based on feedback from logistics operations during the Stage 3 Community Engagement (CE) of the HSK Study. The development parameters were adopted after going through technical assessments and Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) processes. The proposals to further increase PR and BHR were not supported by technical assessments and might cause adverse impacts; and
- (d) “OU(Port Back-Up, Storage and Workshop Uses)”, “OU(Logistics Facility)” and “OU(Enterprise and Technology Park)” zones were to cater for demand of specific industries and not for general business uses. There was no strong planning justification to rezone these sites to “OU(Business)” or to revise the list of permissible uses within these zones.

*Development Intensity*

12. The meeting noted that some representers/commenters had made the following main points and proposals:

- (a) development density and BHR should be optimised to better utilise land resources. In particular, taking the transit-oriented development approach, high density development should be located within 500m radius from the railway stations to maximise the development potential. Also, an increase in domestic PR of all residential zones and “OU(Mixed Use)” zone would help meet the continual housing need of Hong Kong;
- (b) the PR and BHR of specific sites as well as the Regional Centre should be increased;
- (c) development density should be amended to accord with the HKPSG and the Building (Planning) Regulations and the cap on domestic PR for “OU(Mixed Use)” zone should be removed;
- (d) various sites should be rezoned for residential, commercial or “OU(Mixed Uses)” purposes; and
- (e) the proposed tertiary education and related uses should be relocated from Planning Area 31A to “OU(Enterprise and Technology Park)” in Planning Areas 44A, 44B and 46, which should be rezoned to “OU(Education, Enterprise and Technology Park)”.

13. The meeting also noted that the relevant government departments had made the following responses:

- (a) in formulating the PR and BHR on the OZP, relevant planning considerations including land utilisation, infrastructure capacity, visual and urban design considerations, as well as development density as laid

down in HKPSG etc. had been taken into account. The development parameters had been confirmed by relevant technical assessments and statutory EIA Ordinance (EIAO) process;

- (b) the proposed increase in PR and BHR on specific sites was not supported by any technical assessments or justifications. There was also no strong planning justification/supporting technical justifications or assessments provided for the proposed rezoning; and
- (c) the “OU(Mixed Use)” zone would provide commercial GFAs to help support the role of the HSK NDA as an economic hub and there was a need to impose a cap on the domestic PR.

#### *Urban Design and Land Use*

14. The meeting noted that some representers/commenters had made the following main points and proposals:

- (a) more land should be provided for private housing so as to achieve a public-private housing ratio of 63:37, or 60:40 when taking into account Tin Shui Wai (TSW);
- (b) all residential developments should be designated for affordable housing. More land should be reserved for subsidised housing and the provision of elderly housing should be specified in planning documents;
- (c) the framework of the NDA is fragmented. The eastern node which would be the extension of TSW new town, and the Regional Plaza in the west were separated by “Village Type Development” (“V”) and “OU(Logistics Facility)” zones;
- (d) the pedestrian linkage around the Regional Plaza was not well-planned. Except for the Regional Plaza and the shopping streets, there was no

further proposals for pedestrian linkages;

- (e) the pedestrian walkways serve to connect the open space to the north, and that between Planning Areas 59 and 60, and the Regional Park and sports ground were considered excessive as it would divert pedestrians to various routes and would not help enhance vibrancy along major routes;
- (f) there was a need for more comprehensive pedestrian network connecting Locwood Court and shopping streets so as to create an accessible and walkable neighbourhood;
- (g) the area around the pedestrian street connecting Light Rail Transit (LRT) Chung Uk Tsuen station and HSK Station should be reserved as a commercial area;
- (h) Yuen Long and Tuen Mun was already overcrowded and there was abundant supply of commercial land in Kowloon East. The six proposed hotels in the HSK Town Centre were considered excessive;
- (i) it was not fair to the non-indigenous villagers as all indigenous villages would be retained while the five non-indigenous villages had to be removed. The land planned for commercial and private residential developments should be reduced in order to preserve the existing five non-indigenous villages;
- (j) the Sha Chau Lei Tsuen (II) should be retained and the “V(1)” zone should be extended to accommodate the village houses and temporary structures to be removed from Yick Yuen Tsuen;
- (k) there was concern on the adverse air ventilation impact on Ha Tsuen area caused by the surrounding high-rise buildings (about 40 to 60 storeys);
- (l) land resumption would affect existing graves in the area;

- (m) the proposed high-density developments in Planning Area 19B to the north and west of Kiu Tau Wai with BHR of 160mPD were excessive; and
- (n) the district open space, local open space and amenity areas around Ha Tsuen Village should be enlarged to provide a buffer and a stepped BH profile ascending away from the villages should be adopted.

15. The meeting also noted that the relevant government departments had made the following responses:

- (a) the currently proposed housing mix in the NDA is considered appropriate to provide a wide range of housing choices for different social sectors. Taking into account the existing housing mix in TSW, the overall public-private housing mix of the area would be about 70:30;
- (b) a comprehensive, vibrant and pleasant pedestrian walkway and cycle track network had been planned to facilitate good connectivity within the Town Centre, between the major activity nodes and the surrounding areas. Commercial uses were allowed along the pedestrian street connecting LRT Chung Uk Tsuen station and HSK Station;
- (c) impact on certain existing communities, including the five non-indigenous villages was unavoidable due to their locations in the proposed Town Centre of the HSK NDA. However, there would be rehousing arrangements for eligible clearerees affected by NDA development. Local rehousing sites had been reserved;
- (d) the planning intention of “V(1)” zone was to provide land for reprovisioning the affected village houses eligible under the Village Removal Terms (VRT) due to the NDA development;

- (e) compensation for the graves affected would be arranged according to prevailing policy;
- (f) to restrict the BH in Planning Area 19B to 3 storeys would jeopardise the realisation of the planned District Commercial Node in the area and hinder the efficient use of land resources;
- (g) appropriate measures including buffer areas, visual and wind corridors, view corridor ('fung shui lanes'), stepped height profile and open space had been proposed to facilitate integration between the new developments and the existing villages; and
- (h) responses to other area/site specific proposals were detailed in the Paper.

#### *Traffic and Transportation*

16. The meeting noted that some presenters/commenters had made the following main points and proposals:

- (a) the road network in the Regional Centre was not comprehensive and lacked local roads to divert the traffic. The Regional Centre relied only on Road D7 to connect with the Hong Kong-Shenzhen Western Corridor. A single entry point at Road D7 for the Regional Centre should be avoided;
- (b) additional accesses in Planning Area 32C connecting the internal road to Road P1 should be provided;
- (c) additional roads and junctions connecting different major roads were proposed;
- (d) to review the design of the cul-de-sac roads in the NDA and comprehensively plan the transport infrastructure;

- (e) opposed to the deletion of Tin Ying Road as it was a major access road to the northern part of TSW. Deletion of Tin Ying Road would bring about adverse traffic impact to the already congested road network in the area;
- (f) the Environmentally-Friendly Transportation System (EFTS) should be made available to tie in with the population intake of the NDA;
- (g) there were reservations on the EFTS as its passenger capacity was limited. An elevated EFTS design would incur high maintenance cost while an at-grade design would occupy road space. Noise impact of the EFTS and visual impact of the elevated structure should also be considered. Public consultation on the EFTS should be conducted prior to implementation;
- (h) the West Rail (WR) had insufficient capacity to cope with the additional population. The proposed HSK station should be deleted and the railway stations in the NWNT should be re-planned; and
- (i) a new mass transit system should be developed to connect HSK with other districts and the Tuen Mun-Tsuen Wan Railway and Tuen Mun-Ting Kau Railway should be further explored.

17. The meeting also noted that the relevant government departments had made the following responses:

- (a) the Traffic and Transport Impact Assessment (TTIA) concluded that the HSK NDA development was technically feasible from traffic and transportation point of view and the proposed road network would be able to cope with the future traffic demand;
- (b) proposals on provision of an additional road/access to Road P1 could not

meet the requirement under Transport Planning and Design Manual or were not technically feasible;

- (c) the “cul-de-sac” designs were adopted to discourage bypassing traffic to minimise air quality and noise impact in the Town Centre;
- (d) re-planning Tin Ying Road could release land for a more efficient land uses and a better integration between TSW New Town and the HSK NDA. The transport arrangement was sufficient to cope with traffic demand after re-planning of the road;
- (e) according to the TTIA, there was a need for EFTS to cope with the traffic demand of the NDA. The detailed design and mode of operation of EFTS would be subject to further feasibility study;
- (f) the WR carrying capacity would be enhanced and the anticipated patronage of WR in 2031 had already taken into account the existing population and the future population brought by the developments in HSK, Yuen Long South, Kam Tin South. It was expected that the WR would be able to cope with the additional demand. In the long run, the Government would explore the feasibility to provide additional railway linkages in the NWNT; and
- (g) HSK Station was essential to developing the NDA as a “Regional Economic and Civic Hub” and meeting the railway passenger demand arising from the NDA development. There was no ground to withhold the implementation of the HSK NDA for traffic reason.

#### *Provision of GIC Facilities*

18. The meeting noted that some representers/commenters had made the following main points and proposals:

- (a) the increase in population would increase the demand/ aggravate the existing shortfall on the public services;
- (b) there were many “Government, Institution or Community” (“G/IC”) sites in HSK NDA and specific uses of some undesignated “G/IC” site should be indicated;
- (c) the location of the proposed market in Planning Area 26A was not supported as it was located at the south of HSK and could not serve the residents in northern part of TSW and there was concern on the issue of management of the markets. A market site should be identified in TSW area; and
- (d) education facilities should be provided in Kiu Tau Wai.

19. The meeting also noted that the relevant government departments had made the following responses:

- (a) GIC facilities in HSK NDA were proposed with reference to HKPSG, advice of the concerned bureaux/departments and public views received from CE of HSK Study. There was no shortfall for major GIC facilities, except hospital beds, library and swimming pool, the provision of which would be monitored by relevant bureaux/departments;
- (b) there was a need to reserve undesignated “G/IC” sites to cater for possible future needs;
- (c) three new markets were proposed within the HSK NDA. One of them would be a public market to be provided in Planning Area 26 adjacent to the proposed HSK Station, which was convenient and easily accessible by the community. The management and mode of operation of the markets were outside the scope of OZP; and

- (d) adequate education facilities were planned and a “G/IC” zone for education purpose was planned in Planning Area 21 to the southwest of Kiu Tau Wai. The proposal for an additional education site in Kiu Tau Wai was unnecessary and might jeopardise the realisation of the planned District Commercial Node.

*Environmental and Ecological Considerations*

20. The meeting noted that some representers/commenters had made the following main points and proposals:

- (a) tall buildings in close proximity to the nesting colony of ardeids in Planning Area 45 might affect the ardeids and potentially block the flight paths to their feeding grounds. There were agricultural lands to the south of San Sang Tsuen and to the north of Tsing Chuen Wai and they should be preserved as a buffer zone from the Town Centre;
- (b) a stepped BH profile was proposed and agricultural lands in Planning Areas 44A, 44B and 46 should be retained to protect San Sang San Tsuen egretty; and
- (c) there were concerns on the spreading of brownfield operations to the nearby farmland which would result in general degradation of the rural environment.

21. The meeting also noted that the relevant government departments had made the following responses:

- (a) the approved EIA, which included an Ecological Impact Assessment, concluded that the proposed development would be environmentally acceptable with proposed mitigation measures implemented. A 100m-wide eco-corridor, comprising “Open Space” (“O”) and “Green Belt” (“GB”) zones, would be provided to protect the flight paths to the

egretry;

- (b) the eco-corridor would be flanked by lower buildings (90mPD) while taller buildings (e.g. 200mPD in Town Centre and 110mPD for the logistics sites) would be located further away; and
- (c) the Government was exploring reprovisioning arrangement for the affected brownfield operations to avoid their proliferation to the rural areas. Any unauthorised development would be subject to planning enforcement action.

#### *Coverage of the OZP*

22. The meeting noted that some representers/commenters had made the following main points and proposals:

- (a) the coverage of the OZP should be extended to include areas between Castle Peak Road and Yuen Long Highway in order to maximise the development potential of land around the railway station;
- (b) to include Ngau Hom Shek, Sha Kong Tsuen, Hang Tau Tsuen and Deep Bay Grove into the HSK OZP and to review the land uses of the local area so as to safeguard the conservation and agriculture areas from brownfield operations;
- (c) to incorporate the area covered by Ha Tsuen Fringe OZP into the planning scheme area of the HSK OZP and to adopt uniform compensation rate in land resumption; and
- (d) to rename the OZP as “Ha Tsuen OZP” as majority of land felled within the area of Ha Tsuen Heung.

23. The meeting also noted that the relevant government departments had made the following responses:

- (a) the planning scheme area of the HSK OZP was drawn up having regard to the boundary of the HSK NDA development and was considered appropriate;
- (b) the surrounding rural areas were covered and protected by appropriate zonings; and
- (c) the name of the OZP reflected the general geographical coverage and it was necessary to align with the administrative demarcation.

*Miscellaneous*

24. The meeting noted that some representers/commenters had made the following main points and proposals:

- (a) there was a lack of social, environmental and economic impact assessments in the preparation of the OZP; and
- (b) development restrictions should be relaxed for areas surrounding the HSK NDA, such as Ha Pak Nai and Deep Bay to provide development sites for the brownfield operators in the interim.

25. The meeting also noted that the relevant government departments had made the following responses:

- (a) comprehensive technical assessments, including socio-economic impact assessment, EIA were conducted to confirm the feasibility of the HSK NDA development; and
- (b) the Pak Nai and Deep Bay area was situated in the western part of

NWNT along the south-western coast of outer Deep Bay. Given the extensive and unspoiled natural Deep Bay Coast and a hilly backdrop in the area, it was considered appropriate to preserve the scenic and rural area from urban sprawl.

*Site Specific Proposals –RCP near Hung Fuk Estate*

26. The meeting noted that some representers/commenters had made the following main points and proposals:

- (a) there were concerns on the visual impact of the RCP, its proximity to Hung Fuk Estate and the associated air pollution, odour, health, hygiene and environmental problems;
- (b) there was insufficient public consultation with the affected residents, particularly residents of Hung Fuk Estate on the proposed RCP;
- (c) the location of RCP should be reconsidered or swapped with the planned school adjacent to Shek Po Tsuen in Planning Area 15; and
- (d) the Government should design multi-use RCP cum resource recovery facilities or other community facilities in order to better utilise the land resources.

27. The meeting also noted that the relevant government departments had made the following responses:

- (a) the proposed RCP near Hung Fuk Estate was to replace the existing village type design RCP at Hung Tai Road;
- (b) the subject site was the only available and suitable site for the purpose. Alternative sites proposed by representers were either reserved for other purposes or considered not suitable for various reasons, for example

being located outside the catchment area;

- (c) the RCP would be properly designed to meet all applicable hygiene standards and would not create unacceptable impacts on the surroundings; and
- (d) the proposed RCP would incorporate office uses of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD).

*Site Specific Proposals – Others*

28. The meeting noted that some representers had made other site specific proposals which had been covered in detail in the Paper and in the Q&A sessions. Some of the proposals included:

- (a) expansion of “V” zone /village ‘environ’ (‘VE’);
- (b) rezoning proposals for various sites in Planning Areas 8, 10, 17B, 19C, 20, 27A, 36, 42, 43B and 49; and
- (c) some existing structures and development such as Hung Shui Kiu Merchants’ Association, CNEC Good Tidings Church, village office, archway and pavilion, ancestral halls, shrines etc. should be preserved in-situ.

29. The meeting also noted that the relevant government departments had made the following responses:

- (a) the boundaries of the “V” zones were drawn around existing village clusters with regard to the ‘VE’, local topography, existing settlement pattern, site characteristics, approved applications for Small House development, outstanding Small House applications, as well as the estimated Small House demand. There was no strong planning

justification to expand the “V” zones as the proposals would affect the public housing production, planned GIC development and the planning concept of the NDA;

- (b) there was no strong planning justification or technical assessment to support/ascertain the feasibility of the proposals or possible impacts associated with the site specific proposals from the representers; and
- (c) the possibility of retaining the existing developments/structures at the fringe of the planned development without affecting the integrity and planning of the NDA development could be explored at the detailed design stage.

*Other Views/Proposals not directly related to the OZP*

30. The meeting noted that some representers/commenters had made the following main points and proposals:

- (a) there were concerns on the stringent requirement for in-situ land exchange under the Enhanced Conventional New Town Approach (ECNTA) which required the future project proponent to acquire all land within a site for developing commercial and mixed commercial/residential development;
- (b) land owners should have the priority to develop their lots and public-private participation should be encouraged for early implementation of the NDA;
- (c) there were concerns on compensation package, accommodation of affected brownfield/industrial operators, villagers and land owners, and other issues on implementation arrangement including streamlining of the land exchange system, more flexibility in implementation phasing, or implementing the proposal at the same time instead of separating into

phases;

- (d) it was unfair to deprive the development right of the non-indigenous villagers in the development of HSK NDA, which was against their fundamental rights under the Basic Law;
- (e) additional public consultation on the NDA development and appropriate compensation and re-provisioning proposals (e.g. MSBs) should be conducted before implementation of the NDA and resumption of brownfield sites; and
- (f) detailed urban design studies should be conducted to promote walkability and connectivity, secondary commercial alleyways and green linkages.

31. The meeting also noted that the relevant government departments had made the following responses:

- (a) the issues on compensation and implementation arrangement were not directly related to the OZP which was to show the broad land use framework of the NDA;
- (b) the statutory planning control under the OZP did not appear to be inconsistent with the protection of lawful rights and interest of indigenous inhabitants of the New Territories under the Basic Law;
- (c) feasibility studies on accommodation of brownfield operations into multi-storey buildings (MSBs) had been commissioned and relevant stakeholders would be consulted in due course;
- (d) extensive public consultation had been conducted for the HSK Study and the HSK OZP had also gone through the statutory public consultation process under the Ordinance; and

- (e) detailed urban design studies would be conducted during the design and construction stages.

32. The Chairperson said that the draft OZP was to outline the land uses in the HSK NDA and provide a land use framework for its implementation. The draft OZP would serve as a basis for relevant government departments to carry out subsequent necessary procedures, such as land resumption, to realise the development proposals. Notwithstanding, some of the details related to implementation, such as whether specific residential sites should be used for public or private housing development, would still be subject to confirmation in the implementation process. Members could consider taking a holistic approach in considering the representations and comments and relevant proposals. Considering the issues raised by representers and commenters in their written and oral submissions, the Chairperson suggested and Members agreed to deliberate by main issues for a more structured, effective discussion.

#### *Development Intensity*

33. The Chairperson said that some representers had suggested increasing the PR of various sites so as to fully utilise land resources. In response, Mr Raymond K.W. Lee, Director of Planning (D of Plan), said that currently the domestic PR of the HSK NDA, which ranged from 3.5 to 6, had generally followed the principles set out in the HKPSG. A domestic PR of 6 was adopted for the town centre and the PR would gradually decrease as it got further away from the town centre and transportation node. If infrastructure capacity allowed in the long run, there was scope to further increase the PR as appropriate at detailed design/implementation stage. At this stage, the proposals by the representers to increase the PR or relax other development restrictions were not supported by any comprehensive technical assessments.

34. Two Members opined that since the draft OZP would form the basis for future development of the HSK NDA which would take 20-30 years to realise, consideration should be given to increase the domestic PR at this stage so as to create capacity to cater for any future demands that might arise from the growing population in Hong Kong.

Increasing the domestic PR in HSK NDA would provide a much needed relief to the acute housing land shortage in Hong Kong. In this regard, the standards in HKPSG should also be reviewed as appropriate. Another Member concurred with this view and said that it would be more appropriate and effective to increase the domestic PR in the NDA to accommodate more housing units, rather than to infill single-block public housing development into built-up urban areas.

35. Another Member said that the Government should strive to make available new land to address the acute demand for housing units. Infrastructure and public transport system would also need to be upgraded to cope with the additional population. Employment should be created in the area to encourage local employment and capture the opportunity to integrate modern industries with the rich heritage background of the area.

36. A Member said that besides housing, there was also a strong demand of land for other important community facilities, such as residential care home for the elderly (RCHE). The Government should adopt a more proactive approach to tackle the shortage of land.

37. The Chairperson said that in formulating the draft OZP and the development parameters, due consideration had been given to provision of transport and other infrastructures necessary to support the HSK NDA development. In particular, the Government had considered the capacity of the transportation system, include planned/committed road and railways links to be constructed in the future, in ascertaining the technical feasibility of the HSK NDA development. An arbitrary increase in PR without supporting technical assessments on feasibility and associated impacts might not be appropriate and would likely attract criticism and be challenged. However, as a more pragmatic approach, Members' views on increasing domestic PR could be conveyed to the Government to urge relevant government departments to review development restrictions at appropriate time to commensurate with the infrastructure upgrade so as to further optimise land utilisation in the long run. In this regard, Mr Raymond K.W. Lee, D of Plan, supplemented that the population in Tuen Mun and Yuen Long was about one million. Other developments in the NWNT including Yuen Long South, Tong Yan San Tsuen, Wang Chau and additional public housing in Tuen Mun had also been planned to

accommodate an additional population of about 300,000. Based on the current proposal, the average population density for HSK NDA would be about 30,000 persons/km<sup>2</sup>. For comparison, the average population density of Hong Kong was about 6,800 persons/km<sup>2</sup> and that for highly populated areas such as Mong Kok and Kwun Tong was about 48,000 to 59,000 persons/km<sup>2</sup>. Before further increasing the PR for HSK NDA, additional study would be required to confirm the technical feasibility.

38. Another Member said that transport capacity was a crucial consideration in determining the appropriate PR in the HSK NDA. At the moment both the East Rail and WR were quite congested. It might be hasty to increase the PR without a comprehensive feasibility study on traffic impact or a plan to increase the capacity of the public transport network in the region.

39. A Member said that instead of going through the statutory procedures repeatedly to amend the statutory plan in stages, it might be more time-efficient if the PR on the draft OZP was increased first then followed by a technical feasibility study to be conducted by the Government. Another considered otherwise and said that amending the statutory plan in a step-by-step manner was more appropriate as it would allow more opportunity for the local community to react and participate in the process. In this regard, the Vice-Chairperson said that he generally supported to increase domestic PR as appropriate to increase housing supply, but various infrastructures including drainage, sewerage and transport would need to be able to cope with the associated population increase. Based on his experience, conducting a detailed technical feasibility for large scale development was often a complex and lengthy process and might take years. It was inappropriate for the Board to increase the PR arbitrarily without duly considering its technical feasibility or else the Board's decision would be subject to challenge. A Member supported the Vice-Chairperson's viewpoint and said that given the lack of further information on technical feasibility, it might be prudent not to pursue a further increase in PR at this stage. Another Member said that given the HSK NDA development might take some 20 to 30 years to be fully realised, there was scope to further optimise the PR as the development of the NDA proceeded.

40. A Member asked whether it was feasible to increase the permissible PR on the OZP so that the Government could choose to go for the maximum PR only when supporting technical assessments became available. The Chairperson said that this suggestion might not be practicable as the PR, once promulgated on the OZP, would take statutory effect and would be expected to be achievable. A Member opined that the Board should indicate clearly its support for making best use of land resources and the PR as shown on the draft OZP should be a basis for future review. The relevant departments should explore the feasibility to increase the PR and expedite the progress of any necessary technical assessments.

41. Members generally considered that the current development parameters stipulated on the draft OZP, in particular the PR, were appropriate and there was no strong justification to vary them without sufficient information on technical feasibility. Nevertheless, Members agreed that the Explanatory Statement (ES) of the OZP should be revised to reflect Members' expectations for possible further increase in development intensity subject to technical feasibility study in the long run.

#### *Public- Private Housing Mix*

42. In response to the request of the Chairperson, Mr Raymond K.W. Lee, D of Plan, elaborated that in formulating the draft OZP, the government policy to strive for a public-private split of 60:40 for the overall supply of new housing units in the territory over a 10-year timeframe under the Long Term Housing Strategy had been duly considered. This notwithstanding, the residential zonings on the draft OZP had not specified whether it was for public or private development. As such, there was scope to adjust the housing mix in the implementation stage taking into account the latest housing demand. Sufficient flexibility had been provided in the statutory planning framework in that there was no need to amend the OZP should some of the residential sites currently intended for private housing needed to be converted for public housing development, provided that the development complied with the restrictions such as PR and BHR stipulated on the draft OZP. However, relevant technical assessments might need to be updated by relevant departments to ensure the conversion to public housing would not result in any adverse implications to the provision of infrastructure facilities. The Secretary supplemented that

as explained by the District Planning Officer/Tuen Mun and Yuen Long West, Planning Department during the Question and Answer session, one of the planning objectives of the NDA was to achieve a balanced community and avoid creating a homogenous residential character dominated by public housing. The ratio of public to private housing in HSK NDA had been maintained as 51:49 so that when considered together with TSW New Town, the overall ratio would be 69:31. If considered appropriate, the ES of the OZP could be revised as appropriate to reflect the Board's view that consideration could be given to use more residential sites for public housing development subject to the actual demand and community aspiration at the time of implementation.

43. The Vice-Chairperson said that the HSK NDA and TSW New Town were physically in close proximity to each other and there was no strong reason that the housing mix in these two areas needed be considered independently simply because they fell onto two different OZPs. The current proposal to provide more private housing in the eastern part of HSK NDA near TSW New Town would create a better interface with the existing developments in TSW New Town. On the other hand, the 150,000 employment opportunities to be created by the HSK NDA would greatly benefit the residents of TSW New Town as currently there were insufficient employment opportunities in the area. A Member concurred with this point and said that the lack of sufficient employment was one of the most criticised aspects in the development of TSW New Town. The HSK NDA development and the local employment opportunities it provided had great prospect to revitalise TSW New Town as well as the NWNT area. Another Member further said that the development intensity of the commercial sites could also be reviewed as appropriate to facilitate more commercial activities in the region.

44. A Member noted some representers and commenters had requested to further increase public housing provision in the HSK NDA so as to meet the housing needs of the grassroots. However, the Member opined that a bias towards further increasing public housing provision in HSK NDA and other new towns might be misinterpreted as a strategy to move the less-affluent to remote areas and might not be desirable in terms of fostering a harmonious community.

45. A Member said that it appeared the land area zoned for residential purpose was relatively low compared to the size of the whole NDA. In response, Mr Raymond K.W. Lee, D of Plan, said that the proportion of land zoned for residential use in the HSK NDA was comparable to that for other NDAs, such as Kwu Tung North NDA. While there was a pressing demand for additional housing land, it was necessary to reserve land for other suitable uses within the NDA in order to create a liveable community. Many of the other land uses within the HSK NDA would perform economic function and provide employment opportunities for the local community.

46. A Member said that priority should be given by the Government to resolving the housing issue, otherwise it would create many other profound social problems. Given the current market trend in property prices, private residential units provided in the HSK NDA would likely be unaffordable by most people. The focus of the HSK NDA development therefore should be on provision of more public housing units. Consideration should also be given to further reviewing the policy on public-private housing mix and adjust the ratio of 60:40 as required, in favour of public housing in the Long Term Housing Strategy.

47. Another Member said that one of the problems in TSW New Town was the concentration of public housing in an area of the new town which had resulted in social segregation and a lack of interaction between people from different economic backgrounds. Based on overseas experiences, many developments comprising public and private housing elements in order to facilitate social interaction and avoid a labelling effect. In response, Mr Raymond K.W. Lee, D of Plan, said that there might also be scope to investigate the incorporation of different types of public or subsidised housing into developments subject to government's housing policy.

48. In response to a Member's question, the Chairperson explained that for private land that was earmarked for private housing development, the relevant land owners could apply to the Lands Department for a land exchange under the ECNTA. If the application for land exchange was not approved or the applicant had no intention to participate in the development, the Government would resume the private lots and be responsible for the subsequent land disposal arrangement.

49. Members generally agreed that the ES should be revised as appropriate to reflect the Board's view that flexibility should be given to revise the public-private housing mix in HSK NDA in order to meet the social aspiration for more affordable housing.

*Transportation and Deletion of Tin Ying Road*

50. A Member said that the HSK NDA was strategically located and could benefit from the economic integration between Guangdong, Hong Kong and Macau. However, traffic congestion was a common problem in cities with a thriving economy. Another Member said that the Government should strive to promote the use of public transport as in the recent years there was an upward trend on private car ownership. Another Member opined that the Government had not taken proactive steps to discourage car ownership.

51. The Vice-Chairperson said that quite a number of representers and commenters expressed concerns on the transport capacity, in particular the carrying capacity of WR to cope with future population given that it was already congested at the moment. Despite the findings of the technical assessment that the transportation system would be able to cope with the future demand, the Government should consider carrying out further comprehensive study on possible enhancement to the strategic transportation system in the future. It was important for the Government to present a clear blueprint to the public regarding the future development of the transportation system and how it could tie in with the long-term development of Hong Kong to meet the needs of the community.

52. In response to the request of the Chairperson, Mr Andy S.H. Lam, Principal Assistant Secretary (Transport) 3, Transport and Housing Bureau (PAS(T)3, THB), explained that it was the policy of the Government to encourage the use of the public transport and it was not practical to solve road congestion by simply constructing more roads. The Government had attempted, on various fronts, to manage the demand for private cars, for example by increasing the first registration tax. At the same time, the Government had also undertaken various studies to assess the future transport needs. For example, the Railway Development Strategy 2014 (RDS-2014), undertaken by the Highways Department (HyD) and announced in 2014, had set out the blueprint for territory-wide railway development. The RDS-2014 had recommended that seven new

railway projects be completed in the planning horizon up to 2031. On the other hand, the Government was planning to take forward the “Strategic Studies on Railways and Major Roads beyond 2030” (RMR2030+ Studies) to examine the transport demand of the whole territory from 2031 to 2041 in a comprehensive and holistic manner. The RMR2030+ Studies would also take into account the recommendations of the planning study “Hong Kong 2030+: Towards a Planning Vision and Strategy Transcending 2030” being conducted by the Development Bureau and the Planning Department, including the transport demand of the two strategic growth areas for planning the necessary strategic transport infrastructure network including railways and major roads. The need to construct a new heavy rail for connecting NWNT and the urban areas would also be examined in the studies.

53. Regarding the concern on carrying capacity of WR, Mr Andy S.H. Lam, PAS(T)3, THB said that the WR originally operated with 7-car trains. Under the Shatin to Central Link (“SCL”) project, MTRCL had increased the number of train cars of WRL from 7 to 8 since 2016. Comparing with 2015, the carrying capacity of WR was expected to increase by at least 14% when it was fully operated with 8-car trains in the second half of 2018. After the commissioning of the “Tai Wai to Hung Hom Section” of SCL in mid-2019, the WR would be operated with 8-car trains and provide train services with maximum hourly frequency of 24 at each direction, which would represent an increase in carrying capacity of about 37% when compared to that of 2015. Subject to the actual patronage, the WR could further increase its carrying capacity by increasing its fleet size. It was expected that the ultimate carrying capacity of WR, with train services of 8-car trains at an hourly frequency of 28 at each direction, would amount to a 60% increase when comparing with that in 2015. Regarding capacity of road networks, the Government had in recent years completed the improvement works for widening of Tuen Mun Highway and relieved the traffic congestion to a certain extent. Upon completion of Route 11, it was expected that some traffic in Tuen Mun area would be diverted to Lantau Island. Furthermore, an investigation study on the Tuen Mun Western Bypass had also been recently commissioned by HyD. The Government had also conducted a Public Transport Strategy Study in 2014 which aimed to further enhance the existing strategic arrangements of public transport services so as to ensure the long-term, balanced, efficient, multi-modal and sustainable development of public transport services other than heavy rail

and enhance the coordination among various public transport services and their complementarity.

54. A Member said that the Government should act proactively to ensure that the transportation system, as a whole, had sufficient capacity to meet the daily needs of the commuters, instead of responding to congestion issues independently. The Member further said that while the railway and bus networks would form the backbone of public transport in the area, without sufficient level of services, people would have no choice but to utilise minibus and private cars for commuting. Another Member said that in designing the future railway links, the proponent, possibly MTRCL, should take into account the potential for further increase in PR in the region and ensure the railway had sufficient capacity.

55. A Member noticed that many new residents moved into Yuen Long area in recent years had utilised private cars for commuting as the LRT service in the area was inefficient. There was a need to strengthen the cycle path network and enhance walkability in the area, in particular in TSW as many residents often need to get to the market in Yuen Long. Furthermore, it was the tradition for some indigenous villages in Ha Tsuen to hold a parade and visit other villages during festivals. Many sections of the traditional parade route had already been cut off by the LRT. Due consideration should be given to the need to preserve these cultural legacy in early stages of transport planning. It was particular important to preserve the route to Ling To Monastery and ancestral halls. Mr Raymond K.W. Lee, D of Plan, said that the well-connected pedestrian and cycling network, which would link up different major nodes within the fringe areas of HSK NDA, could be utilised by the villagers for parade purpose, if required.

[Mr H.W. Cheung and Mr Philip S.L. Kan left the meeting at this point.]

56. The Chairperson said that there were also concerns among some representers and commenters on the deletion of Tin Ying Road. A Member expressed concerns that the deletion of Tin Ying Road might cause diversion of heavy vehicles onto Ping Ha Road which was currently quite narrow. In response, Mr Raymond K.W. Lee, D of Plan, said that Tin Ying Road was proposed to be deleted to make way for the proposed EFTS and a

riverfront promenade. The detailed design of the EFTS, including whether it would be at-grade or elevated, was still subject to further study. The views of Members regarding the design of EFTS and connectivity would be duly considered by relevant departments. Suitable facilities to complement the EFTS such as bicycle parking facilities along cycle path and EFTS station would also be provided. On the concern of Ping Ha Road, improvement works would be carried out to widen Ping Ha Road to increase its capacity. Given that brownfield operations would be restricted within the HSK NDA, traffic impact caused by heavy vehicles should not be substantial.

57. A Member had reservation on the deletion of Tin Ying Road which was a major elevated highway and enquired whether there would be technical difficulties in deconstructing it. The Vice-Chairperson said that based on overseas experience it was technically feasible to demolish large-scale elevated road structure and successful example could be found in South Korea.

#### *Cultural Heritage*

58. A Member said that some of the representers had expressed objection regarding the misalignment of the 'fung shui' lane from TSW Park to Tang's Ancestral Hall. However, that was mainly a result of the development in TSW New Town which had not fully followed the alignment of the 'fung shui' lane. Mr Raymond K.W. Lee, D of Plan, said that the view corridor (i.e. 'fung shui' lane) extending to Tang's Ancestral Hall in Ping Shan had been preserved and the "O" zone in front of Tang's Ancestral Hall in Ha Tsuen on the draft OZP had been expanded to further protect the view corridor.

59. The same Member further said that despite there was a pressing need for development, there was also a strong need to preserve the intangible cultural heritage of Ha Tsuen area such as the tradition for "Da Jiao" (打醮). Venues suitable for carrying out such traditional activities and other festive ceremonies should be preserved so as to ensure these important traditions could continue to be passed on. The Antiques and Monument Office of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department should also conduct detailed study regarding the cultural heritage of Ha Tsuen as appropriate. In response, Mr Raymond K.W. Lee, D of Plan, said that public open space had been planned in the HSK NDA. As

the detailed design of these open spaces and management arrangement were still yet to be formulated, there was scope to further examine these requirements in the urban design study to be conducted. It might also be possible to incorporate the views of relevant stakeholders, as in the case for the development of Kwun Tong Promenade, in designing the public open spaces.

*Proposed RCP near Hung Fuk Estate*

60. The Chairperson said that one of the most controversial issues raised by representers and commenters were the location of the proposed RCP near Hung Fuk Estate due to concerns on potential impact on hygiene, odour and traffic aspects. There was also an urge for better utilisation of the proposed RCP by incorporating recycling and community facilities on the upper floors. A Member said that the concern of the residents regarding the proximity of the proposed RCP to Hung Fuk Estate was understandable. In response to the Chairperson's query, Mr Raymond K.W. Lee, D of Plan, explained that the proposed RCP would incorporate suitable designs and management measures to ensure full compliance with all environmental hygiene requirements. There was also scope to consider incorporating other uses on the upper floors, in addition to the FEHD's office, subject to further discussion between relevant government departments. A Member echoed this viewpoint and said that it was not uncommon for RCP to be provided near or within major developments and many similar examples could be found in Hong Kong. Provided suitable designs were adopted, the associated impact would be minimal. Two Members said that proposal to co-locate other suitable uses on the upper floor of the proposed RCP was generally supported. By incorporating suitable environmentally-friendly/community facilities into the proposed RCP, the locals would be more likely to support its development.

61. Members generally agreed that the location of the proposed RCP was appropriate and there was no strong justification to warrant relocating it to another site.

*Compensation/Reaccommodation Arrangements*

62. A Member said that there were concerns from the logistics sector on the possible impact on the brownfield operators in the HSK NDA. Being one of the economic pillars in Hong Kong, the contribution of the logistics industry should not be ignored. Many of the smaller operators in HSK NDA area were worried about the cost of relocating into MSBs, the potential high rent as well as the associated operational constraints. Proper compensation and reprovisioning arrangement for affected brownfield operations should be put in place so that these operations would less likely to spread into other surrounding rural areas and cause environmental damage. Another Member considered that there might be scope to concentrate brownfield operations in a smaller, designated area to enhance their synergy while making best use of available land resources. Mr Raymond K.W. Lee, D of Plan, said that land had been reserved within the HSK NDA for logistics use. There were also on-going studies being carried out by the Government, including the Study on Existing Profile and Operations of Brownfield Sites in the New Territories being conducted by PlanD and the Study on Proposed Multi-storey Buildings in Hung Shui Kiu New Development Area for Brownfield Operations being conducted by the CEDD. Regarding the spill-over of brownfield operations into environmentally sensitive areas, such operations, if not in line with the provisions of the relevant OZP, would be subject to enforcement and prosecution action under the Ordinance.

63. Another Member said that while the issue of compensation and reprovisioning was outside the scope of the OZP, the Government should endeavour to ensure that the affected clearerees were properly taken care of. In response, the Chairperson said that the Government had announced earlier in May the proposed enhancements to the general ex-gratia compensation and rehousing arrangements for eligible domestic occupants in squatters and business undertakings affected by Government's development proposals. The enhanced arrangements were generally well-received by the public, though some stakeholders asked for further adjustments. In relocating affected residents, best effort would be given by the Government to preserve the social fabric.

### *Other Site Specific Proposals*

64. Members generally considered that after going through the relevant written and oral submissions, there was no strong justification to accede to any of the site specific proposals submitted by the representers.

### *Other Issues*

65. A Member expressed concern on whether there was sufficient provision of elderly facilities in the HSK NDA. The Chairperson said that currently a number of sites in the HSK NDA had been zoned “G/IC”, on which development of RCHE was always permitted. Notwithstanding, if required, Members’ concern regarding provision of sufficient social facilities to meet the needs of the ageing population could be conveyed to the Labour and Welfare Bureau for their reference.

66. After taking into account the above discussion, the Board:

- (a) noted the supportive views of R1(Part) to R3(Part), R4 and R9;
- (b) decided not to uphold the remaining view of representations No. R1(Part) to R3(Part), R5 to R8, R10 to R104, and R106 to R118, and considered that the draft OZP should not be amended to meet these representations. The reasons were re-capitulated and summarised below:

### *Role and Positioning of HSK NDA*

- “(i) the HSK NDA is positioned as the Regional Economic and Civic Hub. Upon full development, it will provide homes for about 218,000 residents and about 150,000 new employment opportunities. The NDA development will be the major source of land supply to meet the development needs of Hong Kong in the medium- to long-term and also help reduce the imbalance in the spatial distribution of population and jobs in the territory (R6);

*Economic Development and Employment Opportunity*

- (ii) the NDA, located on the major freight and passenger routes between Hong Kong and Shenzhen, is considered as a suitable location for accommodating modern logistics, innovation and technology, and testing and certification uses to foster Hong Kong's development as a regional logistics hub and a supply-chain base (R6, R7 and R30);
- (iii) the estimation of the employment opportunities in the HSK NDA Study has taken account of the proposed GFA for various land uses as well as employment assumptions adopted from the HKPSG (R19, R22, R26, R29, R31 and R117);
- (iv) the "OU(Port Back-Up, Storage and Workshop Uses)", "OU(Logistics Facility)" and "OU(Enterprise and Technology Park)" zones are intended to serve specific purposes but not for general business uses, with Schedule of Uses specifically formulated to tie in with their planning intentions. There is no strong planning justification to rezone these sites to "OU(Business)" or to revise the list of permissible uses as proposed (R7);
- (v) it is considered inappropriate to move 'Social Welfare Facilities' and "Petrol Filling Station" to Column 1 of the "OU(Logistics Facility)" zone since there is a need to assess the environmental and/or traffic implications of these two uses through planning application system (R2);

*Development Intensity*

- (vi) the PRs and BH profile of the NDA have taken into account relevant planning considerations including land utilisation,

infrastructure capacity, visual and urban design considerations, development density as laid down in HKPSG, etc. The development parameters on the OZP are confirmed by relevant technical assessments and statutory EIAO process. However, the proposed increase in the PRs and BHs is not supported by any technical assessments or justifications to ascertain the feasibility and possible impacts (R1, R3, R7, R108 and R109);

(vii) the “OU(Mixed Use)” zone is intended to provide commercial GFAs to help support the role of the NDA as an economic hub. There is a need to impose a cap on the domestic PR otherwise the aforesaid planning intention may be jeopardised (R7 and R108);

(viii) there is no strong planning justification for rezoning the “O” site in Planning Area 34C, the youth facilities site and the tertiary education site for commercial and/or residential development. The proposal is not supported by any technical justification or assessment to ascertain the feasibility or possible impacts (R7 and R109);

#### *Housing mix*

(ix) the currently proposed housing mix in the NDA is considered appropriate to provide a wide range of housing choices for different social sectors (R6, R7, R15 and R16);

#### *Pedestrian walkway and cycle track networks*

(x) a comprehensive, vibrant and pleasant pedestrian walkway and cycle track network has been planned to facilitate good connectivity within the Town Centre, between the major activity nodes and the surrounding areas. The details will be further examined at the detailed design stage. Commercial uses are

allowed along the pedestrian street connecting LRT Chung Uk Tsuen station and HSK Station (R5, R6, R7, R29, R34 and R118);

*Preservation of Existing Non-indigenous Villages*

- (xi) the planning of the HSK NDA has minimised impact on the existing developments as far as possible but impact on some existing uses cannot be avoided due to their locations. There will be re-provisioning arrangements for eligible clearances affected by NDA development, including two local rehousing sites to the west of Hung Fung Estate for the eligible affectees (R15, R16, R19, R20, R24 to R27, R30 and R31);
- (xii) the “V(1)” zone is to provide land for re-provisioning the affected village houses eligible under the Village Removal Terms (VRT) due to the NDA development and it is considered inappropriate to accommodate the village houses and temporary structures to be resumed in Yick Yuen Tsuen in the “V(1)” zone (R32 and R33);

*Integration with existing villages*

- (xiii) appropriate measures including buffer areas, visual and wind corridors, view corridor (‘fung shui lanes’), stepped height profile and open space at intersect point will be adopted to facilitate integration with the villages (R34, R85 and R86);
- (xiv) the view corridor (‘fung shui lane’) extending to the Tang's Ancestral Hall in Ping Shan has been incorporated in the OZP and will be maintained in the future development of the area around TSW Station. The “O” zone in front of the Tang's Ancestral Hall in Ha Tsuen has been expanded to further protect the view corridor. There is no strong planning justification to swap the Regional Park with the development sites in Planning Areas 57, 58 and 59 to

maintain the view corridor (R34 and R84);

- (xv) the proposal to restrict the BH in Planning Area 19B to 3 storeys will jeopardise the realisation of the planned District Commercial Node in this area and hinder the efficient use of land resources (R85);
- (xvi) access to the permitted burial ground at Kiu Tai Wai and Hung Uk Tsuen is zoned “GB” on the OZP and will not be affected by the NDA development. Compensation for the graves affected will be arranged according to the prevailing policy (R34 and R84 to R86);
- (xvii) to allow residents’ car parking use in “V(1)” zone will defeat the purpose of reprovisioning of the affected village houses eligible under the VRT and is considered inappropriate (R12);

*Internal road layout*

- (xviii) the TTIA has confirmed that the proposed road network in the NDA will be able to cope with the future traffic demand. The proposals for additional access to the Town Centre are technically infeasible or will affect the land use layout or pedestrian connectivity within the Town Centre (R1, R3, R5, R6, R87 and R109);
- (xix) speed limit to the vehicles will be imposed on the “cul-de-sac” road to ensure a safe driving speed (R6);

*Opposition to the deletion of Tin Ying Road*

- (xx) re-planning of Tin Ying Road will release land for a more efficient land uses pattern and a better integration between TSW New Town and the NDA, as well as reduce the noise and air pollutions to the

neighbouring residents. The transport arrangement in the NDA will be sufficient to cope with the traffic demand after the replanning of Tin Ying Road (R34, R84 and R87);

*Provision of Environmentally Friendly Transport Services (EFTS)*

(xxi) the TTIA has revealed the need for EFTS to cope with the traffic demand of the NDA. The form, detailed design, mode of operation, etc. of the EFTS are subject to an on-going feasibility study. Stakeholders will be duly consulted in due course upon availability of study findings (R6, R7, R15 and R16);

*External road network and capacity of the West Rail*

(xxii) the WR carrying capacity would be enhanced. The anticipated patronage of WR in 2031 has included the existing population and the additional population brought by the developments in Hung Shui Kiu, Yuen Long South, Kam Tin South, etc. Additional highway linkages, including the Tuen Mun Western Bypass and Route 11 connecting North Lantau and Yuen Long to NWNT, are under planning. The feasibility to provide additional railway linkages in the NWNT in the long run will be further studied (R5, R15, R16, R19 to R29, R34, R84 and R117);

(xxiii) the proposed HSK Station is essential to developing the NDA as a “Regional Economic and Civic Hub” and meeting the railway passenger demand arising from the NDA development (R19);

(xxiv) the TTIA has indicated that the proposed transport network in the NDA is feasible. There is no ground to withhold the implementation of the NDA for traffic reason (R20 and R29);

*Provision of GIC Facilities*

- (xxv) the GIC facilities in the NDA are proposed with reference to the HKPSG, advice of the concerned bureaux/departments and public views received from CE of the HSK NDA Study. In general, there will be no shortfall in the major GIC facilities for the NDA development, except hospital beds, library and swimming pool, the provision of which will be monitored by relevant bureaux/departments (R30 and R87);
- (xxvi) the undesignated “G/IC” sites reserved on the OZP is to allow flexibility to cater for any unforeseeable need in the future (R32 and R33);
- (xxvii) three new markets are proposed within the NDA to cater for the daily needs of the future residents. The management and mode of operation however fall outside the scope of the OZP (R102);

*Environmental and Ecological Considerations*

- (xxviii) the EIA report approved under the EIAO, including an Ecological Impact Assessment, concludes that the NDA development would be environmentally acceptable with mitigation measures implemented. Mitigation measures are proposed to protect the San Sang San Tsuen Egrettry, including the provision of a 100m wide building-free eco-corridor to protect the majority of the flight paths and a lower building height for sites near the eco-corridor (R8 and R117);
- (xxix) the Government is exploring re-provisioning arrangement for the affected brownfield operations to avoid their proliferation to the rural areas. Any unauthorised development would be subject to planning enforcement action. There is no strong planning

justification for allowing brownfield operations in the rural areas in Pak Nai and Deep Bay area (R15, R16, R17, R34 to R83 and R117);

*Coverage and Naming of OZP*

(xxx) the planning scheme area of the OZP is drawn up having regard to the boundary of the HSK NDA development and considered appropriate (R6, R17 and R34);

(xxxii) the name of the OZP is to reflect the geographical coverage and not necessarily have to align the name with the administrative demarcation of the area (R34);

*Miscellaneous*

(xxxiii) comprehensive technical assessments have been conducted to confirm the feasibility of the NDA development (R17);

(xxxiiii) there is no justification to withhold the processing of the OZP pending the outcome of the ICAC's investigation (R18);

*Location of RCP between Hung Yuen Road and Hung Ping Road*

(xxxv) the proposed FEHD office cum RCP development near Hung Fuk Estate is to replace the existing village type design RCP at Hung Tai Road. The subject site is the only available and suitable site for the purpose. The site swapping proposal is found not feasible. The operation of the RCP will meet the relevant hygiene standard and will not create unacceptable impacts on the surrounding areas (R95 to R101);

*Expansion of “V” zone*

(xxxv) the boundaries of the “V” zones are drawn around existing village clusters with regard to the village ‘environs’, local topography, existing settlement pattern, site characteristics, approved applications for Small House development, outstanding Small House applications, as well as the estimated Small House demand; and are considered appropriate. There is no strong planning justification to enlarge the “V” zones or the “O” zone as these proposals will affect the public housing production, planned GIC development and/or the planning concept in the NDA (R84 to R89, R92 and R93);

*Individual Sites*

(xxxvi) the Regional Park is located at the heart of the NDA to serve the future residents. There is no strong planning justification to relocate the Regional Park site to the west and develop the site for mixed commercial/residential development. The proposal is also not substantiated by any technical justifications or assessments to ascertain the feasibility or impacts (R6);

(xxxvii) Planning Area 27A is reserved for public housing development. To allow private residential or residential/commercial development on this site will affect the proposed housing mix and public housing flat production in the NDA and also constrain the development flexibility of the future public housing development in the area (R103);

(xxxviii) the development layout of the HSK NDA is the outcome of a comprehensive planning and technical assessment exercise and an extensive public consultation process. There is no strong planning justification to adjust the zoning boundary in order to align with

individual land ownership pattern (R104);

(xxxix) the proposals to implement the planned RCHE in Planning Area 8 and the local rehousing development in Planning Area 10 by private initiatives is a matter of implementation not related to the land use proposals on the OZP (R107);

(xl) there is no strong planning justifications to excise a part of the proposed hospital site in Planning Area 20 for RCHE use as this will constrain the development flexibility of the future hospital development (R113);

(xli) the possibility of retaining those developments/structures locating at the fringe of the planned development sites could be explored at the detailed design stage (R10, R11, R13, R32, R33, R93, R112 and R116);

(xlii) there is no strong planning justification for the proposal to extend the "Conservation Area" zoning to cover the concerned house in Planning Area 36 as the area does not have any significant ecological value deserving a conservation zoning (R116);

(xliii) the existing Kiu Tai Wai industrial area needs to be replanned so as to achieve the intended District Commercial Node around TSW WR Station (R110);

(xliv) the distribution of the "O" zones in the NDA has taken into account relevant planning considerations such as the catchment population and the surrounding land uses (R114 and R115);

(xlv) the "G/IC" and "O" zonings for the concerned lots in Planning Area 34C are to provide education and recreational facilities to serve the residential developments in the area. The "O" zone

covering the existing mature trees in Planning Area 34 represents an opportunity to preserve them (R89, R90, R91 and R93);

*Other Views/Proposals not directly related to the OZP*

- (xlvi) the matters on the criteria of the ECNTA, compensation and relocation package, and proposals on implementation arrangement are not directly related to the OZP which is to show the broad land use framework of the NDA (R1, R3, R5 to R7, R14, R32 to R83, R87, R91, R92, R94, R106, R108, R109, R111, R114 and R117);
  - (xlvii) the statutory planning control under the OZP does not appear inconsistent with the protection of lawful rights and interest of indigenous inhabitants of the New Territories under the Basic Law (R19, R20, R27, R30, R87 and R94);
  - (xlviii) feasibility studies have been commissioned to consolidate brownfield operations in a land-efficient manner and relevant stakeholders would be consulted in due course (R6, R31 and R34 to R83);
  - (xlix) extensive public consultation had been conducted for the HSK NDA Study and the HSK OZP has also gone through the statutory public consultation process under the Ordinance (R87); and
  - (l) detailed urban design studies at the Town Centre, the District Commercial Node and the riverside promenade near the existing TSW Main Channel would be conducted during the design and construction stages (R1, R7 and R109).”
- (c) agreed to revise the ES of the OZP to elaborate the Board’s views concerning the development intensity and public-private housing mix, having regard to the discussion in this meeting, as appropriate.

67. There being no other business, the meeting was closed at 12:40 p.m..