

1. The meeting was resumed at 9:00 a.m. on 7.2.2018.
2. The following Members and the Secretary were present at the resumed meeting :

Permanent Secretary for Development
(Planning and Lands)
Ms Bernadette H.H. Linn

Chairperson

Professor S.C. Wong

Vice-Chairperson

Mr Lincoln L.H. Huang

Mr H.W. Cheung

Mr Sunny L.K. Ho

Mr Dominic K.K. Lam

Mr H.F. Leung

Mr Stephen H.B. Yau

Dr F.C. Chan

Dr Frankie W.C. Yeung

Mr Peter K.T. Yuen

Mr. Philip S.L. Kan

Dr Lawrence W.C. Poon

Mr Wilson Y.W. Fung

Dr C.H. Hau

Mr Alex T.H. Lai

Professor T.S. Liu

Miss Winnie W.M. Ng

Assistant Director (Regional 3)
Lands Department
Mr Edwin W.K. Chan

Chief Engineer (Works)
Home Affairs Department
Mr Martin W.C. Kwan

Chief Traffic Engineer (NTW)
Transport Department
Mr B.K. Chow

Principal Environment Protection Officer
(Strategic Assessment)
Environmental Protection Department
Mr Raymond W.M. Wong

Director of Planning
Mr Raymond K.W. Lee

Tuen Mun and Yuen Long West District

Agenda Item 1 (Continued)

[Open Meeting]

Consideration of Representations and Comments in respect of Draft Hung Shui Kiu and Ha Tsuen Outline Zoning Plan No. S/HSK/1
(TPB Paper No. 10378)

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese and English]

3. The Secretary reported that the representative of R19 (who was also R20) submitted a letter dated 5.2.2018 to the Chairperson of the Town Planning Board (the Board) providing responses to the comments/answers made by Government departments during the question and answer (Q & A) session on 30.1.2018. The representer stated that he left after making his oral presentation on that day and was not present in the Q & A session. According to s.6(3) of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance), representation made to the Board after the expiration of the plan exhibition period shall be treated as not having been made. Hence, the letter from R19 should be treated as not having been made. Members noted the above.

Presentation and Question Sessions (Continued)

4. The following government representatives and commenters' representatives were invited to the meeting at this point:

Government representatives

Planning Department (PlanD)

Mr David C.M. Lam - District Planning Officer/ Tuen Mun & Yuen
Long West (DPO/TM&YLW)

Mr David Y.M. Ng - Senior Town Planner/HSK NDA

Mr Alvin C.H. Kan - Town Planner/HSK NDA 1 (TP/HSK NDA 1)

Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD)

Mr Tony K.L. Cheung - Chief Engineer/West 3 (CE/W3)

Ms Wilda H.Y. Lee - Senior Engineer/5 (West)

Mr Dennis Y.C. Fung - Senior Engineer/6 (West)

Consultants

Mr Igor W.L. Ho - Executive Director, AECOM

Mr Samuel Y.H. Sze - Associate, AECOM

Commenters and their representatives

C33 - Lam Tsz Ching

C35 - 楊穎姿

C36 - 廖永建

C37 - 李

C38 - Chan P Chu

C39 - 李夢瑤

C40 - 黃駿軒

C41 - 李偉明

C42 - 黃秀香

C44 - 單志良

C45 - Liu Shui Lin

C46 - 林海添

C47 - 林偉強

C48 - 衛文康

C49 - 鄭瑞庭

C50 - 王金湯

C51 - 蔡德成

C52 - 嚴石如

C53 - Chan Yee Han

C54 - 張漢強

C55 - Hajva

C56 - 林海燕

C58 - 黃志豪

C59 - Loog Lam Ho

C60 - 李迎憲

C61 - 陳悅琮

C62 - 周詠珊

C64 - 梁玉珊

C65 - 梁永順

C66 - 麥翌熙

C67 - 鄧錦容

C69 - 黃明珠

C71 - 麥翌樾

C72 - 馮焯康

C73 - 周嘉平

C74 - 何志健

C75 - 麥詩渝

C76 - 馮秋蘭

C77 - Leung Tsz Wing

C78 - 陳俊康

C79 - 胡國君

C80 - 陳思慧

C81 - 關天易

C82 - 袁華

C83 - 何于海

C84 - 許詠麟

C85 - 陳春容

C86 - 黃曉丹

C87 - Tsang Hoi Ying

C89 - 陳雪芬

C90 - Wu Hui Chiu

C91 - 陳惠蘭

C93 - 曾燕琴

C94 - 劉桂紅

C95 - 曾愛香

C96 - 梁愉

C97 - 陳子智

C98 - 張陳笑芳

C99 - 陳生

C100 - Cheung Kwok Wing

C101 - 葉桂齊

C102 - 姜文敏

C103 - 阡卜華

C104 - 關佩鈞

C105 - 李國戈

C106 - 周佩儀

C107 - 葉玉和

C108 - 馮文騰

C109 - 吳細梅

C110 - 何詩晴

C111 - 譚新

C112 - Billy

C113 - 卓嘉豪

- C114 - 黃添發
C116 - 香惠兒
C118 - 黎國泳
C119 - 曾惠賢
C120 - Li Fei
C121 - 郝中
C122 - 李錦嫦
C123 - 楊巧玉
C124 - 肖麗
C125 - 楊春艷
C126 - 何耀鳴
C127 - 盧逢生
C128 - Yip Pui Yan
C129 - 周冬梅
C130 - 葉嘉慧
C131 - 李敏豪
C132 - Lam Pui Suen
C133 - 潘建東
C134 - 楊秀平
C135 - 盧雪有
C137 - 羅紹光
C139 - 胡秀芝
C140 - Ng Chung Lan
C141 - 符馨月
C142 - 宋如嬌
C143 - 楊家兒
C145 - 黃少玲
C146 - Chan Kar Hei
C147 - Chan Ching Yin
C148 - Yeung Wai Fong

C149 - Fan Ka Man

C150 -張偉麗

C151 -雷偉文

C152 -周良偉

C153 -柯詠敏

C154 -莊綺雯

C155 - Luk Sing Ling

C159 -張雪梅

C160 - Hung Ching Wa

C162 - Chiu Po Kam Lucia

C163 - Chan Yiu Ming

C164 -王子都

C165 - Zena

C166 -鄧李嬋

C167 - Katherine Yu

C168 - Lam Sin Lung

C169 -鄧榮芳

C170 - Abu Bar Ar

C171 -甘美蓮

C172 - Umar

C173 - Lau Ching Yan

C176 -文月紅

C177 - Kwok Po Shing

C179 -黃柱平

C180 -廖小姐

C181 -鄭可健

C182 -盧康

C183 -盧國子

C184 -皺煥江

C185 -李帶

- C186 - 陳明霞
C187 - 鄧鳳有
C188 - Lui Ho Yeung
C189 - 胡江霞
C190 - Wu Yujing
C192 - 黃桂梅
C193 - 蔡桂玲
C195 - 周家俊
C196 - 林惜
C197 - 喻浩
C198 - 鄭漢忠
C199 - 董愛妮
C200 - 張文詩
C201 - 朱軒麟
C202 - 歐建興
C203 - 蔡春喜
C204 - Wong Yuk Fan
C205 - Chiu Siu Ching
C206 - Tsang Siu Wo Fletcher
C207 - Chen Yee Lok Eden
C210 - 盧生
C211 - 許生
C213 - 陳生
C214 - 鄧振輪
C215 - 張志雲
C216 - 吳秋洋
C218 - 張錦榮
C219 - 李偉深
C221 - 幸小姐
C222 - 黎芷珊

C224 - 吳生

C225 - Ben Tang

C226 - 冼萍

C228 - 盧德祐

C229 - Abdullooh Khan

C230 - 鐘潤東

C231 - 張智傑

C234 - 陳伯

C235 - Hung Ching Yee

C237 - 文二妹

C240 - 余玉蓮

Hung Shui Kiu Community

Commenters' Representatives

Group]

Ms Chan Kwan Yiu]

Mr Chong Lap Pan]

Mr Leung Tak Ming]

Ms Ho Kit Yee Carol]

Ms Chan Hoi Chi]

5. The Chairperson extended a welcome and briefly explained the procedures of the hearing. She then invited the representatives of PlanD to brief Members on the background to the representations and comments.

6. With the aid of a PowerPoint presentation, Mr David C.M. Lam, DPO/TM&YLW briefed Members on the representations and comments, including the background of the amendments, the grounds/views/proposals of the representers/commenters, planning assessments and PlanD's views on the representations as detailed in TPB Paper No. 10378 (the Paper).

[Messrs Dominic K.K. Lam, H.F. Leung and Philip S.L. Kan arrived to join the meeting during the DPO/TM&YLW's presentation.]

7. The Chairperson then invited the Hung Shui Kiu Community Group, the commenters' representatives, to elaborate on their comments.

8. With the aid of a PowerPoint presentation, Mr Chong Lap Pan made the following main points:

Oversupply of Commercial Land

- (a) there was no explanation provided for the commercial land requirement of 24 ha in Hung Shui Kiu (HSK). According to the "Review of Land Requirement for Grade A Offices, Business and Industrial Uses" conducted by PlanD in January 2017, one of the topical reports of "Hong Kong 2030+: Towards a Planning Vision and Strategy Transcending 2030" (Hong Kong 2030+), the Overall Demand Model was adopted for short-, medium- and long-term forecasts for total employment floorspace. It was questionable why the assumption of the forecast was based on the real GDP growth rates of both Hong Kong and Guangdong Province. As the economic development of Hong Kong was different from that of Guangdong Province, it might lead to an overestimation of commercial land requirement;
- (b) the findings of the above review showed that there would be a surplus of floorspace for Grade A office in non-Central Business District (CBD) areas and for General Business uses, while deficit of floorspace for industries and special industries. However, only 15 ha of land in HSK had been reserved for industrial use, while 24 ha for commercial uses;

Overestimation of Employment Opportunities

- (c) it was unknown why the new employment opportunities were 100,000 during the 2nd stage of community engagement but

increased to 150,000 during the 3rd stage of community engagement. The assumptions for the forecast of new employment opportunities were questionable, which might affect the number of residents who could live and work in HSK;

- (d) in view of various new development areas (NDAs) such as HSK NDA and Yuen Long South Development, it was doubtful whether the carrying capacity of the West Rail Line (WRL) could meet the future travel demands arising from these NDAs;

Co-location of Industrial and Residential Uses

- (e) in view of insufficient industrial land in the territory, PlanD might explore the possibility of providing more industrial land in HSK area by mixing the residential and industrial uses. The industrial activities nowadays were no longer polluting and were not incompatible with the residential uses. For example, in the Draft London Plan 2017, the planning authority was currently exploring the co-location of industrial and residential uses. It was also common in the old urban areas of Hong Kong that the industrial and/or workshop uses locating on the ground floor and residential uses in the upper floors within the same building. While the Government was promoting innovation and technology and “Re-industrialisation”, these policy initiatives should be reflected in the HSK OZP where appropriate; and

Insufficient Affordable Housing

- (f) the ratio of public to private housing units in HSK area was 51:49, which was lower than the ratio of 60:40 as set out in the Long Term Housing Strategy (LTHS). The government should consider whether increasing the supply of private housing units was an effective measure to tackle the continuous increase in property

prices. According to a research paper conducted by academics in Singapore, the increase in private housing units was only a small portion of the overall housing stock and would have only minimal impact on the property prices. The new private housing supply would boost the market expectation and hence lead to the further increase in property prices. The Government might also consider to provide medium-density public housing developments at the fringe of HSK for the local residents who were affected by the NDA.

9. Ms Ho Kit Yee Carol made the following main points:

- (a) the planning of HSK NDA was to provide a New Generation New Town in order to meet the growth of population and number of households as well as the social and economic development. However, it was considered that the planning of HSK NDA was far from the real need of the development of Hong Kong. In the case of Kai Tak Development Area, a prime land in the city centre, even the planning of the development area was in line with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines (HKPSG), most of the land was now owned by those China-affiliated corporations which would not benefit Hong Kong people. There was a need to provide more public housing developments in HSK;
- (b) it was noted that relevant Rural Committees and Yuen Long District Council (YLDC) had been consulted on the draft OZP. She questioned whether PlanD had consulted the 1,600 villagers of the five affected non-indigenous villages in HSK. She queried why PlanD still proceeded with the HSK development even noting that the YLDC opposed to the HSK OZP;
- (c) it was noted that various Government, Institution and/or Community (G/IC) facilities such as schools would be provided in HSK area. However, most of the cross-boundary families would prefer to send

their children back to Hong Kong for education. Given the increase in the number of cross-boundary students, the demand for school places in HSK, which was close to Shenzhen, was rising. It was questionable whether the Government had taken into account these external factors in planning the GIC facilities;

- (d) various commercial facilities were planned in HSK NDA including the Regional Economic and Civic Hub around the HSK Station and the District Commercial Node around the Tin Shui Wai Station. However, the commercial facilities were mainly for retail, office and hotel uses. The need to provide these commercial facilities in the area was doubtful given that many large companies preferred the central locations in Hong Kong Island and Kowloon; and
- (e) the Government should explore the feasibility of developing environmental recycling industry in HSK, as it was close to mainland China and there were already some existing operations scattering in the area. There was no proposal on how to promote the recycling industry in the planning for HSK area. The Government should consolidate these footloose operations in order to facilitate the development of the local recycling industry.

10. With the aid of a PowerPoint presentation, Mr Leung Tak Ming made the following main points:

Land Use Planning for Recycling Industry

- (a) the recycling industry had long been overlooked in Hong Kong. There was a lack of land for development of recycling industry. At present, there were 32 pieces of government land being used for recycling industry under short term tenancy, but the total area had been declining. The EcoPark was one of the Government's initiatives to provide long-term land at affordable rent for the

development of the recycling industry in Hong Kong. However, the recycling companies in Hong Kong, which were mainly small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs), might find it difficult to be admitted to the EcoPark as it involved substantial investment. Even with policy tools such as Recycling Fund and Producer Responsibility Scheme, the recycling industry was still facing difficulties in view of shortage of suitable land for development;

- (b) the HSK NDA offered an opportunity for providing land for recycling industry. It was considered that the Government should support the local recycling industry by reserving land in HSK NDA. Although DPO/TM&YLV mentioned that land zoned as “Other Specified Uses” annotated “Port Back-up, Storage and Workshop Uses” (“OU(Port Back-Up, Storage and Workshop Uses)”) and “Industrial” could be used for local recycling industries, land specifically designated for recycling industry was required as they were less competitive than other brownfield operations. He questioned why there was a specific zoning “OU(Logistics Facility)” for promoting logistics industries but none for recycling industries;

- (c) the Government had been promoting the full utilisation of government buildings by multi-use developments. As such, he suggested the Government to design multi-use refuse collection points (RCPs) cum resource recovery facilities or other community facilities in order to better utilise the land resources. In such multi-use developments, the ground floor could be used for refuse collection with small-scale waste management facilities, which could help integrate the functions of refuse collection and waste management which were currently two separate regimes in Hong Kong. For example, the Government might consider to expand the existing RCP near Hung Fuk Estate by incorporating waste management and community facilities, which helped release land for other uses in the area;

Rehabilitation of Agricultural Land

- (d) since the announcement of planning and engineering (P&E) study for the HSK NDA in 2010, agricultural land in the area had been suffering from illegal dumping activities. Although PlanD indicated that a major cluster of abandoned agricultural land in Lau Fau Shan / Pak Nai area was found suitable for rehabilitation, those areas were currently occupied by warehouses, recycling yards and affected by illegal dumping activities. He doubted whether those agricultural land in Lau Fau Shan / Pak Nai area could be rehabilitated. Although the Central Enforcement and Prosecution Section of PlanD would take action against these unauthorized developments, it was difficult to reinstate those agricultural land which had been covered by concrete. He questioned whether the Government had conducted a freezing survey to register the existing agricultural tenants and a survey to record the good quality agricultural land; and

Compensation for Non-indigenous Villagers

- (e) there were five existing non-indigenous villages in HSK. Most of the non-indigenous villagers had been living in the area for decades as allowing squatters in the rural areas was once regarded as a solution to housing shortage in 1970s. The Government should adopt a standard compensation mechanism and provide more resettlement options such as public housing units for these non-indigenous villagers. The Government should also inform the affected non-indigenous villagers at an early stage; and

Others

- (f) the HSK NDA involved more than 200 ha of land. The Board

should go through a thorough deliberation on the planning of HSK and request the Government to submit more information before reaching a decision.

[Mr Stephen H.B. Yau and Miss Winnie W.M. Ng arrived to join the meeting during the presentation of the commenters' representatives.]

Question and Answer (Q&A) Session

11. As the presentation from government's representatives and commenters' representatives had been completed, the meeting proceeded to the Q&A session. The Chairperson explained that Members would raise questions and the Chairperson would invite the government's representatives and commenters' representatives to answer. The Q&A session should not be taken as an occasion for the attendees to direct questions to the Board, or for cross-examination between parties. The Chairperson then invited questions from Members..

The Carrying Capacity of West Rail Line (WRL)

12. The Chairperson, Vice-chairperson and some Members raised the following questions in relation to the carrying capacity of WRL:

- (a) the future carrying capacity of the WRL taking into account the proposed enhancement measures;
- (b) the change of the standard of persons (standing) per square metre ("ppsm") in train compartment and how to derive the number of ppsm. For example, whether the luggage and baby stroller would be counted as one person;
- (c) the travel pattern of WRL passengers, i.e. the starting locations and destinations as well as the average travelling time; and

- (d) the existing number of passengers per hour and the estimated number of passengers per hour upon full development of HSK NDA.

13. In response, Mr David C.M. Lam, DPO/TM&YLW, indicated that HSK NDA would be an important component in the overall development strategy for Hong Kong in the medium- to long-term. The positioning was to become the Regional Economic and Civic Hub for the whole North West New Territories (NWNT) region. A number of factors had been taken into consideration in the land use planning of HSK including better land utilisation, transport infrastructure and urban design. It was the intention to provide employment opportunities to those who lived in HSK and the NWNT region in future. At present, most of the employment opportunities concentrated in the Metro Area. Providing more jobs in the New Territories would help address the problem of home-job imbalance and hence improve the traffic condition throughout the territory.

14. Mr Tony K.L. Cheung, CE/W3, made the following points in response:

- (a) there were two measures to enhance the capacity of the WRL. First, starting from 2016, the seven-car trains on the WRL had been gradually replaced by eight-car trains by phases. Currently, about 70% of trains in WRL had been upgraded to eight-car trains. When all the eight-car trains had been put into service in 2018, the overall capacity of WRL would be enhanced by about 14%. Second, after the commissioning of the “Tai Wai to Hung Hom Section” of Shatin to Central Link (SCL) in 2019, the signaling system could be upgraded to increase the train frequency from 20 to 24 train trips per hour in each direction and the capacity of WRL could be further enhanced by 37%. Further increasing the train frequencies to 28 at each direction was technically feasible, and on this basis, the overall carrying capacity of WRL would be increased by 60% when comparing with that in 2015. The carrying capacity of WRL would be about 53,000 persons per hour based on accommodating up to 4 ppsm on average;

- (b) the maximum carrying capacity of train compartments was calculated based on an assumption of 6 ppsm on average. The number of ppsm in other major cities ranged from 4 to 6. It had been observed that over the years, passenger riding habits had changed and the carrying capacity of the train and the railway line had been reduced as a whole. In actual operation, trains running during the peak hours on the busiest corridors achieved a passenger density of only around 4 ppsm. Mr Igor W.L. Ho, the consultant of CEDD, supplemented that the carrying capacity of the WRL was derived from dividing the number of passengers per train compartment by the area of each compartment;

- (c) taking into account all major planned developments in the NWNT, it was estimated that the patronage of WRL would be about 59,000 passengers per hour per direction during morning peak hour in 2031. The number of passengers per hour per direction for WRL in 2015 during the peak hours at the busiest section of the WRL (i.e. from Kam Sheung Road Station to Tsuen Wan West Station) was about 36,400; and

- (d) The Government would conduct the “Strategic Studies on Railways and Major Roads beyond 2030” in Q2 2018 with the aim to study the corresponding transport infrastructure for supporting the recommendation on the strategic land use planning as identified in Hong Kong 2030+. The study was tentatively scheduled to be completed in Q3 2021.

Existing Non-indigenous Villagers

15. A Member questioned about the consultation, compensation and resettlement mechanism for non-indigenous villagers. Mr David C.M. Lam, DPO/TM&YLW, responded that non-indigenous villagers had been consulted throughout the three stages of community engagement of the P&E study for the HSK

NDA since 2010 including a number of briefing sessions to the villagers. In May 2015, a team of social workers was engaged to facilitate an effective communication between the affected villagers and the government departments. Two sites within the HSK NDA had also been allocated to the Hong Kong Housing Society for development of subsidised housing for rehousing of eligible affectees affected by the development.

Reserving Land for Recycling Industry

16. Some Members asked the following questions:

- (a) whether the recycling industry could be accommodated on land zoned “OU” in the Logistics, Enterprise and Technology Quarter; and
- (b) how to preserve the recycling industry in the development process.

17. Mr David C.M. Lam, DPO/TM&YLW, pointed out that the proposed refuse transfer station in the west of the area would also accommodate a recycling centre. Also, the “OU(Port Back-Up, Storage and Workshop Uses)” zone could accommodate various brownfield operations including recycling industry, which was always permitted according to the Notes of the OZP. There was no request from relevant bureaux and departments that a specific site was required for the recycling industry. HSK NDA was connected to the strategic transport infrastructure and close to Shenzhen. Given such locational advantages, it was considered that the NDA was suitable for development of modern logistics industry as well as testing and certification. There were other more suitable locations in the territory, such as Tuen Mun, for accommodating the recycling industry.

18. With regard to preserving the recycling industry during the development process, Mr Leung Tak Ming, the representative of Hung Shui Kiu Community Group, advised that it was necessary for the Government to understand the existing profiles and operations of the recycling industry and reserve sufficient land for the

industry. The recycling industry was not as competitive as other brownfield operations and facing problems such as lack of land and high transportation cost.

Location and Design of RCP

19. Some Members asked the following questions:
- (a) the proposal of the commenters' representatives on the design of refuse collection points; and
 - (b) whether the commenters' representatives considered the location of RCP near Hung Fuk Estate was appropriate.
20. Mr David C.M. Lam, DPO/TM&YLW, indicated that as shown in the proposal of the commenters' representative, a ramp was required for heavy duty vehicles, which might take up more space and might not be accommodated in the reserved "G/IC" zones on the OZP.
21. Regarding the location of the RCP near Hung Fuk Estate, Mr Leung Tak Ming indicated that the residents considered it unfair to relocate the proposed RCP to a site near Hung Fuk Estate as the RCP was to serve the nearby private residential developments. As such, the representers proposed to relocate the RCP site to the opposite side of Hung Tin Road. He queried why the RCP could not be subsumed in the future private residential developments. As a compensatory measure, he suggested that the Government should consider the feasibility of a multi-use RCP development providing community facilities in the upper floors.
22. Mr David C.M. Lam, DPO/TM&YLW, supplemented that the concerned RCP was for relocating the existing RCP at Hung Tai Road and incorporating office uses of the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD). The existing RCP at Hung Tai Road was a village type design RCP and had been the subject of public complaints. According to the FEHD, the existing RCP was considered insufficient to cope with the increasing demand due to the growth of population in

the area. However, there was no land available to expand/improve the existing RCP in-situ. The concerned FEHD's office cum RCP site was the only available and suitable Government land in the area to facilitate an early relocation.

New Employment Opportunities

23. In response to the enquiry from the Chairperson and a Member about the estimated 150,000 new employment opportunities, Mr David C.M. Lam, DPO/TM&YLW, said that the estimation of the employment opportunities in the HSK NDA Study had taken account of the proposed GFA for various economic, residential and GIC uses, as well as employment assumptions adopted from the HKPSG. Among the estimated 150,000 employment opportunities, 75,000 were in commercial sector, 61,000 were in special industry, and 14,000 were in community services sector. For the employment opportunities in special industry, the estimation would make reference to the advice from relevant government bureaux and departments and relevant cases. The new employment opportunities were not solely for those living in HSK and it was expected that some residents in HSK would still need to travel to other districts for work.

24. Mr Tony K.L. Cheung, CE/W3, supplemented that a traffic and transport impact assessment (TTIA) under the HSK NDA Study had been conducted to assess the future transport demand to be generated by the proposed NDA development and the traffic impact on the strategic and local road networks. The TTIA was carried out by adopting traffic models which had taken into account assumptions such as job opportunities, income levels, population distribution etc. Among the 150,000 new employment opportunities, it was assumed that about 35% to 40% of them would be taken up by people living in NWNT including Yuen Long and Tuen Mun and the remaining by people in other districts. Also, it was estimated that about half of the people living in HSK NDA would commute to other districts for work.

Commercial Land Requirement

25. A Member questioned about the weighting of economic development of

Guangdong Province in the assumption of the forecast for commercial floor space. Mr David C.M. Lam, DPO/TM&YLW, responded that the forecast of the total required commercial floor space was part of the topical report of Hong Kong 2030+ on reviewing the land requirement for Grade A Offices, business and industrial uses. The NDA fell within the Western Economic Corridor as recommended in the strategic planning of Hong Kong 2030+, which was with a view to increasing economic activities and employment in the area. As such, it was necessary to provide sufficient economic floor space in the NDA in order to generate a critical mass for stimulating economic development in the area.

26. The Chairperson enquired whether the commenters' representatives considered commercial land would not be required by other businesses operating in HSK if the big companies normally preferring a CBD location could not be attracted to HSK. Ms Ho Kit Yee Carol, the representative of Hung Shui Kiu Community Group, clarified that the Government should diversify the economy by providing the commercial land for other industries such as creative industry and sports industry, instead of focusing on retail uses.

Heritage and Cultural Preservation of Village Traditions

27. A Member raised the following questions:

- (a) from heritage conservation point of view, how to preserve the traditions (such as Tai Ping Ching Chiu) of Ha Tsuen, which was one of the earliest village settlements in Hong Kong;
- (b) how to reflect the oyster culture in Deep Bay and the seafood market in Lau Fau Shan and whether there would be any cycle track network connecting to these areas;
- (c) the provision of columbarium and burial grounds in the area; and
- (d) the design of the 'fung shui lanes'.

28. Mr David C.M. Lam, DPO/TM&YLW, made the following responses:
- (a) one of the planning principles was to integrate the new developments with the existing cultural resources in planning and design, such as preserving the ‘fung shui lanes’ (or view corridors) and the provision of a heritage trail and “Open Space”, which would facilitate the preservation of the village traditions and cultural activities;
 - (b) Lau Fau Shan and other rural areas were outside the boundary of the OZP. Having said that, the development scale descended towards the Lau Fau Shan and Deep Bay areas which were more rural in order to preserve the rural landscape. With the improvement of the transport network, people could go to Lau Fau Shan and other areas for enjoyment more easily. While a comprehensive cycle track system was planned in the NDA, the provision of cycle tracks to Lau Fau Shan and surrounding areas would be subject to detailed design;
 - (c) there was no planned columbarium in the area. The Government had planned to provide a public columbarium in Tsang Tsui of Tuen Mun. A number of permitted burial grounds were found in the area, which were zoned “GB” on the OZP; and
 - (d) two ‘fung shui lanes’ were designated in Ping Shan and Ha Tsuen and proposed to be retained as view corridors on the OZP. Future development along and/or falling within the view corridors should maintain and incorporate the corridors in their design. The design of the ‘fung shui lanes’ would be further enhanced under the urban design study.

Housing Mix

29. The Chairperson and a Member raised the following questions:
- (a) noting that the ratio of public to private housing units as set out in LTHS was 60:40, what the planning considerations were for taking into account Tin Shui Wai when determining the ratio for HSK area, which was 51:49 with more land provided for private housing; and
 - (b) noting that HSK NDA was a long-term planning, how the OZP could respond if the ratio of public to private housing units as set out in LTHS changed in future.
30. Mr David C.M. Lam, DPO/TM&YLW, made the following responses:
- (a) the ratio of public to private housing units would be determined in the context of each district. Tin Shui Wai was in close proximity to HSK and the two areas could be integrated and considered as a large community with better pedestrian connectivity. More private housing units in HSK would therefore help provide a more balanced social mix in the area including Tin Shui Wai, which was currently dominated by public housing; and
 - (b) “Residential (Group A)” (“R(A)”) was usually designated for high density residential developments, regardless of public or private housing, which would provide flexibility for future change in the ratio of public to private housing units.

Loss of Active Farmland

31. Some Members raised the following questions:
- (a) the progress of registration of the existing agricultural tenants; and

- (b) noting that the amount of arable land was decreasing in view of various new developments in the rural areas, whether there would be any policy to compensate for the loss of arable land.

32. Mr David C.M. Lam, DPO/TM&YLW, made the following responses:

- (a) the registration for the existing agricultural tenants would usually be conducted close to the phase of resumption and clearance; and
- (b) some 7 ha of active agricultural land would be affected by the HSK NDA. The Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD) would assist those who wish to rent private land for farming through the Agricultural Land Rehabilitation Scheme (ALRS) and serve as a middleman by matching landowners with prospective tenants in order to help facilitate agreements on tenancy.

Provision of Utility Facilities in Cavern/Underground

33. Noting that a number of sites had been designated specifically for utility facilities such as “OU(Sewage Pumping Station)” and “OU(Sewage Treatment Works)”, a Member asked whether these facilities could be relocated to cavern or underground for better land utilization.

34. Mr David C.M. Lam, DPO/TM&YLW, responded that the flood retention facilities had been planned under the open space for better land utilisation. Mr Tony K.L. Cheung, CE/W3, supplemented that the Drainage Services Department was conducting a study to review the feasibility of moving those sewage treatment facilities to cavern or underground. Subject to the findings of the study, the Government would further explore the feasibility of relocating those facilities to the cavern/underground in future.

35. Mr Leung Tak Ming requested the Board to disclose all relevant

documents on the website of the Board and to all representers and commenters. In response, the Chairperson indicated that the documents provided to Members were mostly available in the public arena and there was no need to send those documents to individual representers and commenters.

[Dr Frankie W.C. Yeung arrived during the question and answer session.]

36. As Members did not have any further questions, the Chairperson said that the Q&A session was completed. She thanked the government representatives as well as the commenters' representatives for attending the meeting. The Board would deliberate the representations/comments in closed meeting and would inform the representers/commenters of the Board's decision in due course. The government representatives as well as the commenters' representatives left the meeting at this point.

37. The meeting was adjourned at 11:55 a.m.