

1. The meeting was resumed at 9:15 a.m. on 24.11.2014.
2. The following members and the Secretary were present at the resumed meeting:

Mr Thomas T.M. Chow	Chairman
Mr Stanley Y.F. Wong	Vice-chairman
Mr Roger K. H. Luk	
Professor S.C. Wong	
Professor P.P. Ho	
Dr C. P. Lau	
Dr W.K. Yau	
Professor K.C. Chau	
Mr Sunny L.K. Ho	
Mr Dominic K.K. Lam	
Mr H. F. Leung	
Mr Stephen H.B. Yau	
Mr F.C. Chan	
Mr Francis T.K. Ip	
Mr Peter K.T. Yuen	
Deputy Director of Lands (General)	
Mr Jeff Y.T. Lam	
Assistant Director (2), Home Affairs Department	
Mr Eric K.S. Hui	
Principal Environmental Protection Officer (Strategic Assessment), Environmental Protection Department	
Mr Victor W.T. Yeung	
Chief Traffic Engineer/New Territories East, Transport Department	
Mr K.C. Siu	

Director of Planning
Mr K.K. Ling

Presentation and Question Sessions

(Open Meeting)

3. The following government representatives, representers and representers' representatives were invited to the meeting at this point:

Ms Maggie M.Y. Chin	District Planning Officer/Fanling, Sheung Shui and Yuen Long East, Planning Department (DPO/FS&YLE, PlanD)
Mr Otto K.C. Chan	Senior Town Planner/Fanling, Sheung Shui 1, PlanD
Mr Kevin C.P. Ng	Senior Town Planner/Fanling Sheung Shui 2, PlanD
Dr K. K. Liu	Assistant Director (Agriculture), Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AD(Agriculture), AFCD)
Dr K.W. Pau	Senior Agricultural Development Officer, AFCD
Mr K.W. Cheung	Senior Nature Conservation Officer (North), AFCD

FLN-R4530, KTN-R4080 – Ernest Choy

Mr Ernest Choy - Representer

FLN-R11706, KTN-R11255 – Yip Fu Wing

Mr Yip Fu Wing - Representer

FLN-R11822, KTN-R11371 – Y.S. Lau

FLN-R11913, KTN-R11462-Wong Ting Kit

FLNR11915, KTN-R11464-Wong Tin Man

FLN-R11923, KTN-R11472– Wong Siu Yin

FLN-R17533, KTN-R17082 –Ho Ka Wui

Mr Chow Sung Ming (東北城規組) - Representers' representative

4. The Chairman extended a welcome and explained the procedure of the hearing.

He said that the meeting would be conducted in accordance with the “Guidance Notes on Attending the Meeting for Consideration of the Representations and Comments in respect of the Draft Kwu Tung North Outline Zoning Plan No. S/KTN/1 and the Draft Fanling North Outline Zoning Plan No. S/FLN/1” (Guidance Notes) which had been provided to all representers/commenters prior to the meeting. In particular, he highlighted the following main points:

- (a) in view of the large number of representations and comments received and more than 3,400 representers/commenters had indicated that they would either attend in person or send an authorised representative to make oral submission, it was necessary to limit the time for each oral submission;
- (b) each representer/commenter would be allotted a 10-minute speaking time. However, to provide flexibility to representers/commenters to suit their needs, there were arrangements to allow cumulative speaking time for authorised representatives, swapping of allotted time with other representers/commenters and requesting an extension of time for making the oral submission;
- (c) the oral submission should be confined to the grounds of representation/comment in the written representations/comments already submitted to the Town Planning Board (the Board) during the exhibition period of the Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) or the publication period of the representations; and
- (d) to ensure a smooth and efficient conduct of the meeting, the representer/commenter should not repeat unnecessarily long the same points which had already been presented by others earlier at the same meeting. Representers/commenters should avoid reading out or repeating statements contained in the written representations/comments already submitted, as the written submissions had already been provided to Members for their consideration.

5. The Chairman said that each presentation, except with time extension allowed,

should be within 10 minutes and there was a timer device to alert the representers and the representers' representatives 2 minutes before the allotted time was to expire and when the allotted time limit was up.

6. The Chairman said that the proceedings of the hearing would be broadcast on-line, and the video recording of the presentation made by the representative of PlanD on the first day of the Group 4 hearing (i.e. 13.10.2014) had been uploaded to the Board's website for the meeting and would not be repeated at the meeting. He would first invite the representers/representers' representatives to make their oral submissions, following the reference number of each representer who had registered with the Board's Secretariat on the day. After all registered attendees had completed their oral submissions, there would be a question and answer (Q&A) session at which Members could direct enquiries to any attendee(s) of the meeting. Lunch break would be from about 1:00 p.m. to 2:00 p.m. and there would be one short break each in the morning and afternoon sessions, as needed.

7. The Chairman then invited the representers and representers' representatives to elaborate on their representations.

FLN-R4530, KTN-R4080 – Ernest Choy

8. Mr Ernest Choy made the following main points:

- (a) The North East New Territories New Development Areas (NENT NDAs) were proposed to meet the future demand of land for development. However, according to the data provided by Associate Professor Yiu chung-yim of the Chinese University of Hong Kong, there should be adequate land supply in Hong Kong from 2017 to 2021 for providing 100,000 domestic units with a total of 575 ha, including 35 ha from Kowloon East, 90 ha from property developments above MTR stations, 391.5 ha from abandoned and vacant land to be rezoned and 90 ha from industrial land to be rezoned for residential development. On the other hand, the NDAs could only provide 76.5 ha of land for various types of residential zonings. Only 13.3% of the total area of the NDAs would be developed for residential use. From

2021-2041, there would also be adequate land supply of 2,250 ha for 450,000 domestic units comprising 50 ha from urban renewal, 800 ha from brownfield sites, and 1,400 ha from industrial land to be rezoned to residential use. After 2041, there would be 600 ha from undesignated land, 300 ha from short term tenancy (STT) sites including those from private clubs, and 2,750 ha from military land, making a total of 3,650 ha;

[Professor P.P. Ho returned to join the meeting at this point.]

- (b) in 2012, the Secretary for Development (SDEV) explained that out of 2,400 ha of unleased/unallocated land, 1,200 ha were reserved for village type development to meet the demand of about 10,000 villagers on the waiting list for small house applications. On the other hand, the number of applicants on the waiting list for public housing was about 100,000 and yet only part of the 395.5 ha of land in the NDAs would be used for public housing. Such proportion should be suitably adjusted to release more land for public housing. The Government was requested to seriously review the approach to deal with the indigenous villagers' right for building small houses in the long run and consider a change in the Small House policy for allowing small houses to be built higher;
- (c) about 2,200 ha of land were under STT such as car park. The Government was strongly requested to list out the details of those sites including their location, areas, current uses and tenancy to facilitate the public to participate in the discussion of the long-term use of these sites;
- (d) no detailed records of brownfield sites such as location, area and current uses were available. Transparency and openness of these records were required. The Board or the Government should assign annually a proportion of the brownfield sites for housing development similar to the practices in some overseas countries;

- (e) about 10,000 local residents and their farming activities would be affected by the NENT NDAs. Agriculture was important to the health of people and the economy of Hong Kong. Locally produced food was important from food safety perspective and farming activities could also help to recycle food waste. It was noted that many farmlands near Ng Tung Ho were fenced off by developers for residential developments and it was a wastage of precious farmland;
- (f) town planning in Hong Kong aimed to promote the health, safety, convenience and general welfare of the community through the process of guiding and controlling the development and use of land, and to bring about a better organized, efficient and desirable place to live and work in. A desirable place to live and work in hinged on the provision of a good farming and harmonious environment; and
- (g) the Government should withdraw the NENT NDAs. A good agricultural system should be developed with conservation of water resource and farmland, provision of support and assistance to farming activities and the related industry as well as raising the self-sufficiency ratio in food supply of Hong Kong. Most important of all, food safety should be secured.

[Actual speaking time: 16 minutes]

FLN-R11706, KTN-R11255 – Yip Fu Wing

9. Mr Yip Fu Wing made the following main points:

- (a) he objected to the KTN and FLN NDAs on three grounds;
- (b) the necessity of the NDAs to meet the housing needs of Hong Kong people was doubtful. As pointed out by the Local Research Community (本土研究社), a non-government organisation, the

Government in the past used to overestimate the population growth. Whilst the actual population growth in 2013 was 0.14%, the forecast in 2012 was 0.79%; i.e. the actual population increase was 30,000 persons but the forecast was 57,300 persons. He doubted if a major development project could be justified by the overestimated population made by the Government;

- (c) inadequate housing supply was not due to the shortage of land but because the Government had sold most of the land to developers for private housing developments and not to use them for public or subsidised housing. The Government had favoured the developers who would only build large-scale private housing not affordable by the Hong Kong people. Moreover, the developers were sometimes hoarding private units for speculation resulting in a high vacancy rate. In that regard, the Government should change the policy by building more public housing instead of releasing more land for private development;
- (d) the Government should explore other alternatives which would have less impact on the villagers such as the Fanling Golf Course. The Fanling Golf Course was about 170 ha in area which was not used by most of the Hong Kong people and there were no living quarters. As compared with the NENT NDAs where there were existing residents and agricultural activities, the impact of developing the golf course for residential development was much less. According to the Development Bureau (DEVB), about 40 out of 300 ha of developable land in the NDAs were reserved for public housing. Hence, the Fanling Golf Course could contribute more to the public housing. The Government could also first make use of the brownfield sites which were currently used for container yards, recycling yards, vehicle stripping yards in Yuen Long instead of the land in NENT currently occupied by villagers and under cultivation;
- (e) according to DEVB, there were about 1,000 households in the NENT NDAs being affected and most of them were non-indigenous villagers

and farmers from the Mainland in the past. They rented farmland from indigenous villagers and provided Hong Kong people with lots of fresh vegetables and meat as well as contributed greatly to the social development of Hong Kong. It was unjust that the Government now proposed to relocate them because of the diminishing value of the local farming with the food supply of Hong Kong mainly relying from the Mainland. It would also be inhuman to relocate those elderly people who had established close connection with the local community. Similar to the elderly people living in Dills Corner Garden, the relocation would impose pressure to their health and psychological well-being. That could not be addressed by compensation and reprovisioning. Development should be people-oriented. Moreover, social network and unique local economy which were difficult to rebuild should be preserved; and

- (f) the NENT NDAs would affect 228 ha of land under cultivation. According to AFCD, there were about 298 ha of arable farmland. The NDAs would imply that arable farmland was getting less. It was important that Hong Kong could produce vegetables locally. The safety of vegetables imported from the Mainland was not certain as they were sometimes polluted by excessive use of fertilisers or heavy metals. The local vegetables were fresher and their sources would be more easily traced and monitored by the Government and thus their safety could be ensured. Due to pollution and development pressure, the farmland in the Mainland was diminishing and the Mainland cities might also need to ensure their self-sufficiency ratio in food supply. In the long term, it would be a risk for Hong Kong to heavily rely on farm products from the Mainland. In case of natural hazards in the Mainland, Hong Kong might be prone to the risk of food shortage. Moreover, the farmland and green belt would serve as a buffer between Hong Kong and Shenzhen and should be retained. For vegetables produced locally, they did not need to travel long and hence the carbon footprint would be less. That was in line with the principle of sustainable development. The Government should retain the active

farmland and review the agricultural policy, protect the livelihood of farmers and promote rehabilitation of abandoned farmland so as to raise the self-sufficiency ratio in food supply of Hong Kong.

[Actual speaking time: 10 minutes]

FLN-R11822, KTN-R11371 – Y.S. Lau

FLN-R11913, KTN-R11462-Wong Ting Kit

FLNR11915, KTN-R11464-Wong Tin Man

FLN-R11923, KTN-R11472– Wong Siu Yin

FLN-R17533, KTN-R17082 –Ho Ka Wui

10. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation entitled ‘Tin Shui Wai Wetland Park of Two Types of People’, Mr Chow Sung Ming made the following main points:

- (a) the Government’s decision on the NENT NDAs, which would be fully completed over 20 years, was important to the next generation. In that regard, the real concerns of the young generation should be addressed. He doubted if the objective of the NDAs was to let the young generation to be able to purchase their own homes, given the current employment pattern in which the young generation was unable to earn a stable income to pay the mortgage;
- (b) as shown on the plan placed on the visualiser, Tin Shui Wai North was occupied mainly by public housing estates except for a private residential development, Vianni Cove. The proportion of public housing in the area was over 90%. It was difficult to find jobs in Tin Shui Wai North as there were generally no economic activities except for the shopping malls managed by Links. Two years ago, Tin Sau Hui was developed to promote local economic activities and to provide employment opportunities for the grassroots. Tin Shui Wai with an area of 300 ha had a population of 300,000 persons and 80% were living in public housing. To place extra emphasis on public housing developments had generated social problems. However, for the

NENT NDAs, the ratio of public to private housing was set at 60:40, which was in line with the Long Term Housing Strategy. It was still questionable if the NDAs had already addressed the planning errors of the third generation new towns. The increase in private housing by itself would not result in a balanced and sustainable development in the area and would not bring more employment opportunities, shopping and recreational activities to the residents in public housing so as to bring improvement to their quality of life. A well-planned new town should be supported with infrastructure facilities, taking into account the population distribution and their background, that would cater for their needs including the employment need;

- (c) it was not clear how much land out of 612 ha in the NENT NDAs would be designated for public housing and Home Ownership Scheme. According to the document submitted to Finance Committee in June 2014, there would be 46 ha for public housing. On the plan submitted to the Board in October 2014, no figures for public housing and private housing were provided. Some had estimated that less than 6% of the land was for public housing. It was clarified by DEVB in “information kits for normal people” (“常人包”) that about 90 ha of land would be for residential use; half for private housing and half for public housing. In any case, there was less than 7% of the total land area that would be used for public housing. Whilst there was 30% of the land in Tin Shui Wai for housing, it was estimated that for all the new towns developed after Shatin, the proportion of the land for residential use should be around 17%-25% and not as low as 13% in the NDAs;
- (d) as stated in the public engagement documents for Enhancing Land Supply Strategy by DEVB in 2011, the future shortage of land supply was estimated with reference to the population estimate from the Census and Statistics Department (C&SD). It was estimated that in 2039, there would be 8.9 million population. As compared with the current population of 7.1 million, there would be an additional

population of 1.8 million which would require extra land to accommodate. In July 2012, C&SD promulgated a revised population estimate of 8.4 million in 2039, which was not included in the 2nd public engagement of Enhancing Land Supply Strategy by DEVB. Clarification was sought but no response had yet been provided;

[Professor P.P. Ho left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

- (e) it was also stated in the public engagement documents on Enhancing Land Supply Strategy in 2011 that an additional 2,000 ha of land for residential use and 2,400 ha of land for supporting facilities (i.e.1.4 times of land for residential use) would be required for the projected 8.9 million population. Based on that ratio, if about 90 ha of land were required for residential use in the NDAs, the supporting land should be 130 ha, making a total of 220 ha;

[Professor P.P. Ho returned to join the meeting at this point.]

- (f) Wang Chau near Yuen Long Industrial Estate occupied a total area of about 40 ha. About 20 ha were planned for public housing and the remaining 20 ha for supporting facilities such as education, medical facilities and other government, institution or community (G/IC) facilities for a planned population of 50,000. For Kai Tak development, out of 320 ha of land, about 8.9 ha were designated for two housing estates which were completed and accommodated about 40,000 population. For the NENT NDAs, if no low density residential developments (i.e. “Residential (Group C)”) were built, about 70 to 80 ha of land (with a plot ratio of 5 or 6) would be required to accommodate a population of 170,000 and, if with supporting facilities, it would require another 100 ha land. The Fanling Golf Course, with an area of about 170 ha, would therefore be adequate to cater for the residential developments and supporting facilities to replace the NDAs;

- (g) it was not clear why the total area of the NENT NDAs was 612 ha whilst in the 'information kits for normal people', DEVB had stated that the developable land was about 300 ha. Out of the 300 ha, apart from the essential land uses, most of the land were used for greening, recreational and amenity use. It was noted that most of the land in Tin Shui Wai North were used for greening, recreational and amenity uses. As reflected from the plan shown on the Powerpoint, there was a large piece of greening and recreational land including a large piece of vacant government land and Tin Sau Road Park near Tin Sau Bazaar. What the residents in Tin Shui Wai really needed was land for economic activities and not such a large amount of land for greening and recreation bearing in mind that there were already a wetland park, rural land and green land in Mong Tseng Tsuen and Tsim Bei Tsui and fish ponds nearby. In the NDAs, a large amount of land (i.e. 300 ha) were reserved for greening, recreational and amenity uses. It was questionable that future residents in the NDAs really needed such a large area;
- (h) the problems faced by Tin Shui Wai residents were a lack of employment opportunities, means to maintain livelihood and space for economic development. It had a total population of 300,000, but only about 20,000 employment opportunities. The proposed Business and Technology Park of 12 ha was mainly to meet the industrial and commercial development needs for the residents within the area. Pak Shek Kok Science Park (with a total area of about 20 ha) would provide less than 10,000 employment opportunities. He doubted the number of employment opportunities that would be provided by the proposed Business and Technology Park in KTN. According to the planning documents, the NENT NDAs would provide 37,000 employment opportunities, but there were no concrete proposals except the proposed Business and Technology Park. It was possible that some 30,000 employment opportunities might come from commercial trade activities between Hong Kong and China including activities in various control

points nearby such as Liangtong, Lo Wu and Lok Ma Chau. That issue which had been kept silent was worth to be explored;

[Dr W.K. Yau and Mr F.C. Chan left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

- (i) the tax payers would need to pay \$120 billion for the development of 200 ha of land in the NENT NDAs including 90 ha residential land for a population of 170,000 as well as land for other industry and supporting facilities. The cost of Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge was \$30 billion whilst that of Express Rail Link was about \$80 billion. He queried how the cost-effectiveness of spending \$120 billion could be measured to address housing problems and future industrial development. There should be a clear indication on the cost-effectiveness of the NDAs. Whilst the financial reserve of the Government was \$750 billion, a total of \$710 billion would be spent on the major infrastructure projects including the NDAs. He queried why they should be all funded by the Government and not by the private sectors. The long-term economic benefits and the impact on the competitiveness of Hong Kong upon completion of those projects were questionable.

[Total speaking time : 50 minutes]

[Mr F.C. Chan returned to the meeting and Dr C. P. Lau left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

11. As the representers and their representatives had completed their presentations, the Chairman invited questions from Members.

12. The Chairman reminded that the audio recordings of the hearings had been uploaded to the Board's website and the representers could refer to those recordings for information.

13. The Chairman asked DPO/FS&YLE to advise on (a) the percentage of the

different land uses in the KTN and FLN NDAs; and (b) the distribution of developable land and land not to be developed in the NDAs. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation, Ms Maggie M.Y. Chin, DPO/FS&YLE, made the following main points:

- (a) the Plan and the Explanatory Statement (ES) of the two OZPs had clearly specified the land area and distribution of various land uses in the NDAs. While land parcels intended for private housing development were indicated, flexibility was allowed for the provision of public rental housing or HOS development to cater for future market needs. The planning intentions of the “Green Belt” (“GB”) and “Conservation Area” (“CA”) zones were also clearly indicated in the Notes of the OZPs;

- (b) there were about a total of 300 ha of developable land in the two NDAs. It was intended to fully utilize the planned or existing infrastructure and the precious land resources. High density development would be located within walking distance from the planned Kwu Tung Station on the Northern Link (NOL), while G/IC uses such as school, community hall, clinic would be provided at the outer part of the town centre. The peripheral area was mainly zoned “GB”. In addition to the existing rural and green areas such as Fung Kong Shan and feng shui woodlands, the natural habitat along the riverside of Ma Tso Lung River would also be conserved. Also, about 100 ha of land were zoned “Agriculture” (“AGR”), which included a Nature Park, the area to its north and south, as well as 12 ha of agricultural land in FLN. The “Open Space” (“O”), “GB”, “CA” and “AGR” zones had a total area of about 300 ha. Taking advantage of the planned and developed infrastructures at the current Fanling/Sheung Shui New Town, the developable land would be located around the train station at KTN and the two public transport interchanges (PTIs) at FLN. It was intended that the train station could serve as the town centre of the KTN NDA. It was also clarified that about 90 ha of land would be designated for housing development, which constituted about 30% of the developable land. That figure was specified in the ES of the OZPs.

14. The Vice-chairman asked DPO/FS&YLE and representatives of AFCD to respond to the queries raised by Mr Chow, in particular, (a) whether the provision of about 300 ha of land for “O” and “GB” areas had taken into account the lessons learnt from Tin Shui Wai and how the planning of “O” and “GB” areas had signified the characteristics of the area; (b) the cost for the provision of the 300 ha of “O” and “GB” areas; and (c) whether there was a holistic or local agricultural policy in the NENT NDAs to preserve and develop agriculture and how it could be realised in the planning process; how the rehabilitation of farmland would be implemented and would there be any successful cases; how the farming characteristics which were diminishing in Hong Kong could be protected and preserved. In response, Ms Chin made the following points:

- (a) PlanD had conducted an independent study in 2008 to review the problems in Tin Shui Wai, such as employment opportunities and the provision of community facilities. It was concluded that a new town development should provide balanced housing mix, supporting facilities and community facilities to achieve a balanced community and social fabric. Given the experience of Tin Shui Wai, due consideration should be given to the development schedule of the NDAs, the provision of employment opportunities for different skill sets, and the timely provision of community facilities according to the population structure to meet the needs of the community. As mentioned by the representers’ representative, Tin Shui Wai had a higher proportion of public housing in that about 80% of the housing units were public housing. In the two NDAs, the public and private housing ratio would be 60:40. The provision of public rental housing or HOS development would be subject to the market needs to be assessed by the Housing Authority. Nevertheless, it was intended to provide the public housing at close proximity to PTIs or train station, so that the residents could be well served by public transport. As regards new employment opportunities, it was estimated that the “business and technology park” could provide about 17,000 job opportunities, whilst the retail, commercial and service sector as well as the G/IC facilities at the town centres of the two NDAs could provide about 20,000 job

opportunities. There would also be further study with the relevant departments such as Leisure and Cultural Services Department and Social Welfare Department on the provision of community facilities to strengthen the social services, especially for elderly, children and teenagers. It was also hoped that the public housing for rehousing the affected residents could be implemented in the first phase of the NDAs.

[Mr Victor W.T. Yeung left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

- (b) there was no information on the detailed breakdown of the public expenses of \$120 billion on the NDAs. However, the Advanced Works Package would cost about \$10 billion for the provision of infrastructure such as road widening and site formation, as well as some public housing units. There would be a public housing site each in both FLN and KTN for early rehousing of the affected residents.

15. Dr K. K. Liu, AD(Agriculture), AFCD, made the following points:

- (a) according to the current agriculture policy, the Government would assist agricultural development through the provision of basic infrastructure on the farmland and technical assistance. The basic infrastructure would include consolidation of farmlands, irrigation system and marketing channels whilst the technical assistance would focus on increasing the productivity of farming skills and species. The policy was to back up the farmers to increase their competitiveness and productivity;

[Mr K. C. Siu left the meeting temporarily and Mr Victor W.T. Yeung returned to the meeting at this point.]

- (b) taking into account the small scale and intensive nature of the farmland in Hong Kong and market demand, the Government had assisted the farmers to operate organic farming since 2010. Now there were about 200-300 organic farmers and a total of 7 metric tons of organic

agricultural produce could be supplied to the market every day. New skill such as water irrigation method was introduced for diversification whilst a variety of species of fruits were introduced;

- (c) the Government also helped the farmers to explore more markets to promote their sales. The farmers could sell their produce direct or in the farmers' markets arranged by the Government. The annual farmfest would introduce new species of farm produce to the public and farmers' produce to the consumers. Traditionally the Government would assist the farmers to sell their products in wholesale market and the Accredited Farm Scheme could help the farmers to build their brand name of 'Good Farmer' through the management of the horticulture practice and control of use of pesticides and insecticides. The Vegetables Marketing Organisation would also help farmers to supply their produce to the restaurants and institutes. Moreover, a mobile application had been launched to facilitate the public to order and pay through mobile phone for farm produce with direct delivery for purchase over \$100. Currently, the local farm produce could compete with those imported;

[Mr K. C. Siu returned to join the meeting at this point.]

- (d) owing to the small scale of farms in Hong Kong and the high population of Hong Kong, much of the demand for the farm produce would still need to be met by imports from different countries, rather than relying on a single origin. Whilst Hong Kong people were used to consume conventional vegetables from South China, western style vegetables were also imported from other countries. Through the operation of a free market system, the supply of vegetables, the stability of price and food safety would be secured;
- (e) the Government was carrying out a comprehensive review of agricultural policy in 2014 as pointed out in 2013 Policy Address. The review and public consultation would cover aspects on the

effectiveness and direction of agriculture; and

- (f) AFCD, in collaboration with the Lands Department and PlanD, had identified suitable farmland in Kwu Tung South which had potential to accommodate the affected farmers. It was a large-scale farming district with sufficient water source. Though some farmland had been abandoned for a long time, they could be easily rehabilitated. The affected farmers could consider moving to the farmland in Kwu Tung South.

[Professor P.P. Ho left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

16. The Vice-chairman said that previous rehabilitation scheme had been considered not very successful. For the case of Choi Yuen Tsuen, although there was a scheme to relocate the farmers, there were few cases in which the farmers were able to continue farming after relocation. Some representers had claimed that the soil was not suitable in Kwu Tung South even if farmland were provided to them. They could not grow the same produce as the soil was different. The Vice-chairman asked Dr Liu to advise on: (a) whether there were any successful examples of the rehabilitation scheme; and (b) whether the scheme was technically feasible on the aspect of soil nutrients.

17. The Chairman added that some representers had claimed that the farmland in Kwu Tung South was being cultivated and could not be made available to the affected farmers. He asked Dr Liu to advise on: (a) the matching mechanism for the farmland with the farmers under the rehabilitation scheme; and (b) how much land under active cultivation would be affected by the NENT NDAs and how much abandoned agricultural land was available in Kwu Tung South.

18. In response, Dr Liu made the following main points:

- (a) a total of 12 ha farmland in the past three years had been successfully rehabilitated. During the rehabilitation process, AFCD would liaise with the farm owners and tenants. Subsequently, AFCD would assist the farmers to plow, carry out soil and water tests, and examine the

production mode taking into account the farmers' experience and intention. There were many cases in which farmers successfully set up farms. As the market for organic farming had been developed in recent years, the farmers would be able to earn better to re-invest in building up their farms. It would normally take 2 to 3 years for a farm to become fully operational after plowing;

- (b) for Kwu Tung South, the conditions were suitable for farming including good water source, flat land, and large plots. Now only 1/3 of the land was under cultivation and there would be scope for other farmers to join. No other uses were designated for the farmland in Kwu Tung South. After rehabilitation, the farmers would benefit from organised production and sale. Given that Hong Kong was a small area, there could not be marked difference in the soil quality and climate within Hong Kong. The critical factor was whether the soil was fertilised enough. In Kwu Tung South, the potential for organic farming was high as the fertility and nutrient of the soil had not been much affected as the land was not used for cultivation for a long time and was not subject to any other polluting source. For renting of the farmland, AFCD would arrange the owners and the tenants to liaise with each others; and
- (c) a preliminary estimate revealed that about 28 ha of land in the NDAs under active cultivation would be affected whilst in Kwu Tung South, there were 34 ha farmland that could be rehabilitated. Therefore, it would be able to accommodate the affected farmers.

19. The Chairman asked DPO/FS&YLE to advise on: (a) what the impact would be on the land zoned "GB" and "AGR" after implementation of the NENT NDAs; (b) the distribution of private and public housing in NDAs and what types of private housing were; (c) the latest population estimate adopted for in formulating of the OZPs; and (d) whether many brownfield sites and STT sites had not been utilised; and (e) whether the Fanling Golf Course could be an alternative to the NDAs. In response, with the aid of Powerpoint slides, Ms Chin made the following points:

- (a) the major land uses in the developable area of the NDAs were residential, G/IC and commercial uses. Apart from Long Valley Wetland which would be resumed for conservation and agriculture, the “AGR(1)” zone near Ho Sheung Heung, the “AGR” zone to the south of Long Valley Nature Park and “GB” zone were also incorporated in the OZP to serve mainly as a buffer. Land would not be resumed in “AGR”, “GB” or “CA” zones and the existing agricultural activities could continue. There were also 12 ha of land zoned “AGR” in FLN. Housing supply in the two NDAs was mainly high-density in nature. In order to optimise utilization of the precious land resources, about 80% of the population of KTN would reside within 500m from the train station. As in FLN, the public and private housing ratio was 60:40, providing about 37,000 public housing units and 23,000 private housing units, so as to achieve a balanced community and to meet the different housing needs of Hong Kong in future. It was anticipated that the first phase of advanced works could commence in 2018 for the first intake of population in 2023. Among the 16,000 new units, 13,000 would be public housing units;

[Mr Roger K.H. Luk returned to join the meeting and Mr H.F. Leung left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

- (b) some representers had mentioned that the NENT NDAs would affect 10,000 households. It should be clarified that the baseline review in 2009 and 2010 of the NENT NDAs Planning and Engineering Study (the NENT Study) revealed that about 2,500 population from 600 households in KTN and 1,250 population from 400 households in FLN, i.e. a total of about 4,000 persons, would be affected. For population estimates, the population forecast was based on 2012 population projection. There would be an increase of 1.4 million in the next 30 years. Whilst the updated population projection had been adopted, it should also be noted that the decrease in the persons per household should also be taken into account. In 2001, there were 3.1

persons/household whilst in 2012, it had decreased to 2.9 persons/household. The Long Term Housing Strategy Steering Committee set the housing supply target for future 10 years at 470,000 units. It should be recognised that the number of general applicants on the waiting list of public housing was about 125,000 and the Government would endeavour in the short, medium and long term to find land for housing developments;

[Mr H.F. Leung returned to join the meeting at this point.]

- (c) the Government would endeavour to seek appropriate sites for housing development in the short, medium and long term. Various alternatives such as the Fanling Golf Course with an area of 170 ha, brownfield sites and vacant government land were also being examined. The Fanling Golf Course would be investigated in other development studies such as the 'Preliminary Feasibility Study on Developing the New Territories North' commenced in 2014. Similar to the NENT Study, public consultation and technical studies on the aspects of infrastructure, G/IC facilities, employment opportunities, transport and traffic impact would be required. Therefore, it could not replace the NDAs in terms of implementation timetable. In fact, the NDAs had gone through three stages of extensive public engagements and years of study before formulation of the OZPs;

- (d) the brownfield sites were mainly port back-up uses, such as recycling yards and open storage. As they were often remotely located, transport and other infrastructure facilities were not readily available. However, their contribution to the economic development of Hong Kong should also be recognized. Moreover, many residential structures were also located amongst the brownfield sites. In fact, there were on-going detailed studies on brownfield sites at various locations such as Yuen Long South and Hung Shui Kiu. However, rezoning of these sites for housing development would also involve land resumption, removal and clearance of existing industries and residents as in the NENT NDAs.

Also, the environmental nuisance and soil contamination issue by the open storage uses had to be examined ;

- (e) as regards the vacant government land, many unleased or unallocated government land in the urban areas were in fact man-made slopes, back lanes and narrow strips of land alongside existing roads. PlanD had endeavoured to review these sites together with other suitable sites and to rezone them, as appropriate, for residential development. For each of the sites, aspects such as compatibility with surrounding areas, potential air ventilation, visual and traffic impacts and infrastructural requirements were fully considered. Suitable sites would be recommended to the Board for rezoning; and
- (f) the private housing developments in the two NDAs were mainly high-density in nature. For the sites located near to rural areas or along the riverside, a plot ratio of 3.5 was designated, which was different from low-density residential developments such as Valais in Kwu Tung South which had a plot ratio of 0.4. Also, the ratio of land requirement of housing development to supporting facilities as mentioned by the representers' representative was only a reflection of the existing condition.

20. The Chairman supplemented that it had been clarified in the previous sessions that although the total area of the unleased or unallocated government land might be great, they were scattered and many of the sites could not be utilized. Regarding the concern raised by Mr Chow Sung Ming that excessive amount of land was reserved as "GB", the Chairman said that currently many farming activities were found in the areas zoned "GB" on the two OZPs. Even though only some of the existing farmland would be resumed, the reaction of some farmers had been strong. In this regard, if more "GB" sites were used for other developments, it might create more adverse impact on the farmers. Moreover, the proposed Nature Park was well supported by the green groups who opined that the area of the Nature Park should be further increased. As such views were contrary to that of Mr Chow, the Chairman asked whether Mr Chow would like to respond further on this aspect.

[Mr Peter K.T. Yuen left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

21. In response, Mr Chow said that the main problem of Tin Shui Wai was not purely related to the provision of “O” or “GB” but that the planning did not meet local community needs. For example, in Tin Shui Wai North, only one retail mall operated by the Link that could survive. The locals did not have the means to promote the economic vibrancy of their local community. There were existing diversified economic and community activities including small scale industries and long established life style in Kwu Tung North and Fanling North. Instead of improving or making minor adjustment to the existing developments, it was now proposed that the existing developments be removed and the land uses and activities of the area be comprehensively replanned. Whilst even if new town developments should exist in Hong Kong, it would require a refined approach. Otherwise, it would repeat the same mistakes of Tin Shui Wai.

[Mr Peter K.T. Yuen returned to join the meeting at this point.]

22. In response to the points made by Ms Chin and Dr Liu, Mr Ernest Choy made the main following points:

- (a) it was mentioned that the residential land of the NENT NDAs was about 90 ha, representing 30% of the total area. However, the figures should be 70 ha, representing only 13.3%. Even if the total area were 90 ha, the percentage should only be about 17-18%;
- (b) it was stated in Sing Tao Daily on 6.8.2014 that the number of applicants on the waiting list of public housing was 255, 800 up to end June 2014. There was another figure of 125,400 applicants on the waiting list. He did not know which figure was correct;
- (c) a list of brownfield sites should be provided;
- (d) it was not fair to reserve 1,200 ha for the 10,000 indigenous villagers but only about 50% out of 395 ha were reserved for the applicants on the waiting list of public housing;

- (e) a list of STT sites, which occupied 2,200 ha of land, should be provided (with the address, area and existing use of each site);
- (f) the Government should preserve or increase farmland to meet the needs of the community apart from providing technical assistance; and

[Mr Sunny L.K. Ho left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

- (g) the failure of the rehabilitation scheme in Choi Yuen Tsuen had been mentioned. Since the farmland in Kwu Tung South was privately owned, even though the soil environment might be similar to that in KTN, it was questionable that if the rehabilitation scheme would be secured and could be arranged; and

[Mr Sunny L.K. Ho returned to join the meeting at this point.]

- (h) AFCD should provide figures on the changes in farmland in the past 10 years and advise the direction of farmland supply with justifications. The agriculture policy should be related to supply of agricultural land to meet the public needs.

23. The Chairman said that many issues mentioned by Mr Ernest Choy were related to policies other than planning and were also not directly related to the two OZPs. In response to the Chairman's invitation, Ms Chin made the following main points:

- (a) considering that the two NDAs were located at NENT which was rural in character with villages nearby, it was intended to provide clearly a buffer area between the new town and its peripheral area, and to provide some agricultural land in response to the public aspiration. To allow the continuation of agricultural activities, 95 ha of agricultural land were designated on the two OZPs. The peripheral area was mainly zoned "GB" to preserve the existing hills, rivers, feng shui woodlands and mature woodlands. About 300 ha of land would be used for

development of roads, housing, economic activities and supporting facilities like schools. The area of each land parcel was also detailed in the ES of the OZPs. Among the 300 ha of developable land, about 90 ha would be used for housing development, which was equivalent to about 30% of the developable land; and

- (b) there was no clear definition for brownfield sites, but they were mainly abandoned land or damaged agricultural land, used for rural industries, warehouse and open storages. Applications for those uses were often received by the Board. They were often located in remote locations and were temporary in nature. PlanD had been closely monitoring the suitability of those sites for comprehensive development. Yuen Long South and Hung Shui Kiu were some examples of the larger brownfield sites. Similar to the NENT NDAs, clearance of existing developments would still be involved before brownfield sites could be developed. In addition, supporting facilities like transportation, economic activities, education and healthcare facilities would need to be provided. The NENT NDAs had been studied for years to enable better utilization of the planned railway and other infrastructure facilities. They would form a natural extension of the existing Fanling/Sheung Shui New Town. Compared with the brownfield sites, the NENT NDAs were appropriate locations to meet the development needs of Hong Kong.

[Professor S.C. Wong left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

24. Dr Liu supplemented the following main points:

- (a) the farmland, though privately owned, were zoned “AGR” on the OZPs and they were not easily converted for other uses. To bring the farmland back to agricultural activities, AFCD had provided assistance by matching those owners who were willing to rent out their land with the farmers. The Government would respect the intention of the farmers and provide advice to farmers; and

- (b) the Government would find new directions through the interactive process with farmers.

[Mr Eric K.S. Hui left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

25. A Member made the following points:

- (a) the Government was being criticized for lacking an agricultural policy to secure a certain percentage of farm produce from local supply, to maintain a certain amount of farmland in different locations and to protect the 'no-go' areas. These issues should be considered in the agricultural policy review. Whilst noting that 12 ha of farmland were rehabilitated, many farmers had indicated that it was difficult to find land for rehabilitation and there was problem on the supply of organic fertilizers. Even if the farmers from Ma Shi Po accepted the proposal to move to Kwu Tung South, despite the rehabilitation potential of the abandoned land and the assistance from AFCD, it was not guaranteed that the Ma Shi Po farmers could find land to continue farming in Kwu Tung South; and

- (b) in considering the future layout around railway stations, Shatin would be a good reference case for a more balanced development. The existing Fanling new town, which was surrounded by public housing estates, was not vibrant and Sheung Shui, with the Landmark North, was better;

26. This Member asked Mr. Chow to explain : (a) how the two NDAs should be enhanced; and (b) what the most important design concept for the extension of the two new towns.

27. In response, Dr Liu made the following main points:

- (a) the public views on the need and the direction of the agricultural policy would be comprehensively examined and analysed through the process

of public consultation of the policy review at the end of 2014; and

[Mr K.C. Siu left the meeting temporarily and Professor S.C. Wong returned to join the meeting at this point.]

- (b) in the case of Ma Shi Po, the Government would assist the affected farmers by matching the farmland owners and the farmers regarding the tenancy, rent and their intention. Whilst it would be difficult to guarantee, it should be noted that Kwu Tung South was planned to be a large-scale farming district and that would provide incentives to the farmland owners who would be more willing to rent out their land. Due to the synergy effect, it would also be helpful to the farmers in their production and marketing. Under the existing system, if the farmers were relocated, they could rebuild houses on their farmland.

28. In response to the Member's enquiry above, Mr Chow Sung Ming made the following main points:

- (a) if the objective of the two OZPs was only to solve the housing shortage, instead of about 600 ha of land, 200 ha would be already adequate to accommodate a population of 170,000 based on his own calculation; and

[Mr Eric K.S. Hui returned to join the meeting at this point.]

- (b) the economic and industrial structure in the NDAs had not been carefully considered. In KTN, it was questionable if the proposed technology and innovative industry would match with the employment needs of the residents in the public housing. If the residents would need to travel to urban areas for work, he doubted if the transport and railway network could cater for the future development of the New Territories North, including Hung Shui Kiu NDA, which might bring about an addition of one million population. The transport and infrastructure should be planned to match with the impacts brought by

the China-Hong Kong Integration and the future development of New Territories North.

[Mr F.C. Chan left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

29. The Chairman remarked that the issues on traffic aspect had been discussed in the previous session of Group 1 representations. It was possible for Mr Chow to make reference to the audio recordings of that session on the web site of the Board if he wished. He further said that there were about 300 ha of developable land in the NDAs excluding areas zoned “GB” and “AGR”.

30. A Member asked which areas of Ma Shi Po in FLN, KTN or Kwu Tung South had more productive soil; and if a farmer was willing to move to Fu Tei Au or Kwu Tung South, whether he would be willing to invest if the tenancy was a short term of 3-5 years. This Member also wondered if the Government could guarantee that a farmer would be able to find farmland with agreeable terms.

31. In response, Dr Liu made the following main points:

- (a) the land in Kwu Tung South had not been cultivated for a long time, and the pressure on soil productivity was therefore not great and there would be a fuller range of natural elements in the soil. If fertilisers were applied appropriately, the productivity of Ma Shi Po and Kwu Tung South would be similar. AFCD would provide advice to farmers on the soil fertility; and

[Mr Francis T.K. Ip and Mr Stephen H.B. Yau left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

- (b) the future development or planning of the farm district in Kwu Tung South would provide incentives to both the farmland owners and the farmers. For the farmland owners, since farming would be the main development option of the area in the foreseeable future, they would be motivated to promote the area as a farming district and to continue to rent out their farmland. In turn, their expectation for using the land for

other developments would be correspondingly reduced. For the farmers, a large-scale farming district would have the advantage of synergetic effect in production and marketing which would provide them with incentives to continue farming.

[Professor S.C. Wong left the meeting temporarily at this point and Mr Stephen H.B. Yau returned to join the meeting at this point.]

32. A Member enquired if there was synergy effect in organic farming and whether Government could take the lead to develop and provide financial support to the organic farm district in Kwu Tung South, KTN and Fu Tei Au. In response, Dr Liu said that the farmers had been encouraged to carry out organic farming specifically in Kwu Tung South which had the potential to be developed into a 'organic farming district', thus further enhancing the synergy effect.

[Mr Sunny L.K. Ho left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

33. A Member said that many representers had expressed the views that it would be difficult for the farmers to continue farming after they were relocated. This Member enquired if AFCD would brief the affected farmers about the plan on Kwu Tung South. Given that it would normally take 2-3 years for successful relocation, if there were successful cases in which the farmers had relocated to Kwu Tung South by 2018, those successful farmers could explain to other farmers on the process and the development of the NDAs would be more pleasant and harmonious. The Chairman remarked that it might take several years after the approval of the OZPs before the farmers would be required to relocate under the Government's arrangement.

[Professor S.C. Wong and Mr Sunny L.K. Ho returned to join the meeting at this point.]

34. In response, Dr Liu made the following main points:

- (a) AFCD would consider more channels to communicate with farmers. During the review of agricultural policy at the end of the year, the farming organisations would be consulted; and

- (b) the 2-3 years mentioned above referred to the time required for a farm to go from plowing to a stable farm operation.

35. A Member asked : (a) if there were about 300 applicants on the waiting list for rehabilitation scheme; (b) the number of applicants catered for by the 12 ha of rehabilitated farmland; and (c) if the affected farmers in the NENT NDAs would be given priority for using land with rehabilitation potential in Kwu Tung South.

36. In response, Dr Liu said that the farmland in Kwu Tung South could provide rehabilitation opportunities for farmers affected by the NENT NDAs. For other rehabilitation scheme, there were 270 applicants and the average size of land they required was different. The 12 ha of rehabilitated farmland were arranged for 40 applicants with different backgrounds and their requirements for farmland would be different from the farmers affected by the NDAs who were operating on a production basis. The current intention under consideration was to plan the whole farming district in Kwu Tung South for commercial farm production.

[Mr Victor W.T. Yeung and Mr H.F. Leung left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

37. A Member asked DPO/FS&YLE if there was any information on sites currently granted under STT. The Member further said that many brownfield sites were supporting many important industries with lower production costs, e.g. temporary storage of manufactured industrial parts, heavy vehicles and containers. For the existing industrial buildings in Hong Kong, there was only about a 3% vacancy rate and the Member asked Mr Ernest Choy to explain why it was possible to demolish industrial buildings for housing development. Similar to any urban renewal development, it might take a long time to resolve the relocation issues. It was questionable how the above suggestion could help meet the urgent need for housing land.

[Mr Victor W.T. Yeung returned to join the meeting at this point.]

38. In response, Ms Chin explained that the information on vacant sites had been uploaded to the web site of the Development Bureau whilst that on STT sites in North

District was included in a document submitted to the District Council. In response to the Chairman's invitation, Mr Jeff Y.T. Lam, Deputy Director of Lands supplemented that many sites were let on a short-term basis because their long-term uses had yet to be implemented. For those sites to be let by public tender, the information on their tenancy and the tender results would be publicized. However, there was no complete and consolidated set of information on all the STTs.

[Mr H.F. Leung returned to join the meeting at this point.]

39. In response to the member's enquiry above, Mr Choy made the following points:

- (a) he doubted if there was shortage of industrial land with supporting figures. It was observed that many industrial premises had been converted to non-industrial uses such as restaurants and residential use. The Government should not allow such illegal uses. On the other hand, there was not much industrial production being carried out in the industrial buildings; and
- (b) the Government should review the suitability of utilizing the brownfield sites for the current uses such as container storage and if there was a need to regulate those uses. Similar to other countries, Hong Kong would require the formulation of a policy, e.g. by specifying an annual ratio of brownfield sites to be developed for residential or commercial uses in the long run.

40. The Chairman remarked that the Buildings Department had been carrying out patrol and taking enforcement action against residential uses in industrial buildings. It should, however, be noted that the industrial buildings were not only for manufacturing. A Member also pointed out that the vacancy rate was low in existing industrial buildings and, in fact, there was a general shortage of land for various uses in Hong Kong.

41. As all the representers and representers' representatives attending the meeting had completed their presentations and Members had no further question to raise, the

Chairman thanked the representers, representers' representatives and the government representatives for attending the meeting. They all left the meeting at this point.

42. The meeting was adjourned at 12:35 p.m.