

**Minutes of 1054th Meeting of the
Town Planning Board held on 14.3.2014**

Present

Permanent Secretary for Development
(Planning and Lands)
Mr Thomas Chow

Chairman

Mr Stanley Y.F. Wong

Vice-chairman

Professor S.C. Wong

Mr Maurice W.M. Lee

Professor Eddie C.M. Hui

Ms Julia M.K. Lau

Mr Clarence W.C. Leung

Mr Roger K.H. Luk

Ms Anita W.T. Ma

Dr W.K. Yau

Professor K.C. Chau

Mr H.W. Cheung

Mr Ivan C.S. Fu

Mr Sunny L.K. Ho

Mr Lincoln L.H. Huang

Ms Janice W.M. Lai

Mr Dominic K.K. Lam

Ms Christina M. Lee

Mr Stephen H.B. Yau

Mr F.C. Chan

Deputy Director (1), Environmental Protection Department
Mr C.W. Tse

Director of Lands
Ms Bernadette H.H. Linn

Assistant Director (2), Home Affairs Department
Mr Eric K.S. Hui

Director of Planning
Mr K.K. Ling

Deputy Director of Planning/District
Miss Ophelia Y.S. Wong

Secretary

Absent with Apologies

Mr Timothy K.W. Ma

Professor Edwin H.W. Chan

Mr Rock C.N. Chen

Professor P.P. Ho

Dr C.P. Lau

Mr Laurence L.J. Li

Ms Bonnie J.Y. Chan

Dr Wilton W.T. Fok

Mr Patrick H.T. Lau

Mr H.F. Leung

Principal Assistant Secretary (Transport)
Transport and Housing Bureau
Miss Winnie M.W. Wong

In Attendance

Assistant Director of Planning/Board
Ms Brenda K.Y. Au

Chief Town Planner/Town Planning Board
Ms Lily Y.M. Yam

Senior Town Planner/Town Planning Board
Mr Raymond H.F. Au

Agenda Item 1

[Open Meeting]

Confirmation of Minutes of the 1052nd Meeting held on 28.2.2014

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese.]

1. The minutes of the 1052nd meeting held on 28.2.2014 were confirmed without amendments.

Agenda Item 2

Matters Arising

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese.]

- (i) Consideration of the Draft Tai Po Kau Development Permission Area Plan No. DPA/NE-TPK/B and the Draft Cheung Sheung Development Permission Area Plan No. DPA/NE-CS/B

[Open Meeting]

2. The Secretary said that on 28.2.2014, the Town Planning Board (the Board) gave consideration to the draft Tai Po Kau Development Permission Area (DPA) Plan No. DPA/NE-TPK/B and the draft Cheung Sheung DPA Plan No. DPA/NE-CS/B and agreed that these two draft DPA Plans and their Notes were suitable for exhibition for public inspection under section 5 of the Town Planning Ordinance. Upon detailed checking, the following amendments to the Notes of the draft DPA Plans were required:

- (a) deletion of “and boundaries between zones” at paragraph 6 of the Notes of the two draft DPA Plans;
- (b) deletion of “within the same zone” at paragraph 8 of the Notes of the two draft DPA Plans;
- (c) updating of paragraph 7 of the Notes of the draft Cheung Sheung DPA Plan;

- (d) deletion of paragraphs 7(h) and (i) of the Notes of the draft Cheung Sheung DPA Plan; and
- (e) deletion of “or any diversion of stream or filling of pond within “V” zone” in paragraph 8.4 of the Explanatory Statement of the draft Cheung Sheung DPA Plan.

3. These proposed amendments were marked on the amendment pages tabled at the meeting for Members’ consideration. These proposed amendments were noted and agreed by Members.

(i) New Town Planning Appeal Received

Town Planning Appeal No. 1 of 2014

Proposed School (Supporting Activity Rooms for Extension of a Primary School) in “Residential (Group C)1” zone, 15 Kent Road, Kowloon Tong

(Application No. A/K18/301)

[Open Meeting]

4. The Secretary reported that an appeal was received by the Appeal Board Panel (Town Planning) on 25.2.2014 against the decision of the Town Planning Board (the Board) on 24.1.2014 to reject on review an application for a proposed school (supporting activity rooms for extension of a primary school) at 15 Kent Road, Kowloon Tong. The appeal site was zoned “Residential (Group C)1” (“R(C)1”) on the draft Kowloon Tong Outline Zoning Plan No. S/K18/18. The application was rejected by the Board for the following reasons:

- (a) the proposed development was located near the junction of Kent Road and Somerset Road and Kowloon Tong MTR Station with busy traffic. The proposed activity rooms at the application site would induce additional student intake for the adjoining campus of Yew Chung International School (Primary Section) and the related increase in loading/unloading activities of vehicles and passengers would aggravate the traffic congestion in the area. There were uncertainties on the

implementability and enforceability of the traffic mitigation measures proposed by the applicant; and

- (b) the traffic congestion problem in the area was already serious. The approval of the application without a satisfactory and effective measure to address the possible traffic impact would set an undesirable precedent for similar applications in the area. The cumulative effect of approving such similar applications would aggravate the traffic congestion problem of the area.

5. The hearing date of the appeal was yet to be fixed. The Secretary would represent the Board on all matters relating to the proceedings of the Appeal Board Panel (Town Planning) in the usual manner.

Appeal Statistics

6. The Secretary reported that as at 14.3.2014, 15 appeal cases were yet to be heard by the Appeal Board Panel (Town Planning). Details of the appeal statistics were as follows:

| | |
|-----------------------------|------------|
| Allowed | : 31 |
| Dismissed | : 131 |
| Abandoned/Withdrawn/Invalid | : 177 |
| Yet to be Heard | : 15 |
| <u>Decision Outstanding</u> | <u>: 1</u> |
| Total | : 355 |

[Ms Christina M. Lee, Mr Ivan C.S. Fu and Mr F.C. Chan arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

West Kowloon Cultural District Authority

Agenda Item 3

[Open Meeting]

Design Concepts of Xiqu Centre and M+ of the West Kowloon Cultural District
(TPB Paper No. 9558)

[The meeting was conducted in English and Cantonese.]

7. The following Members had declared interests in this item:

- | | | |
|---------------------|---|---|
| Professor S.C. Wong | - | Member of Development Committee of the West Kowloon Cultural District Authority (WKCDA) |
| Dr W.K. Yau | - | Member of Consultation Panel of WKCDA |

8. As the item was a briefing to Members on two developments in WKCD, Members agreed that the above Members could stay in the meeting and participate in the discussion. Members noted that Dr W.K. Yau had not arrived to join the meeting.

9. The following representatives of WKCDA and the design teams of Xiqu Centre and M+ were invited to the meeting at this point:

WKCDA

- | | | |
|-----------------|---|--|
| Dr M.W. Chan | - | Executive Director, Project Delivery, WKCDA |
| Mr Derek Sun | - | Head, Planning and Development, WKCDA |
| Ms Wendy Lam | - | Head, Communications and Public Affairs, WKCDA |
| Mr Patrick Chan | - | Senior Architect, WKCDA |
| Ms Man Sze Lau | - | Manager, Destination Development, WKCDA |
| Mr Y.M. Fu | - | Planner, WKCDA |

Design Team of Xiqu Centre

Mr Bing Thom - Bing Thom Architects
Mr Eugene Ching - Ronald Lu & Partners

Design Team of M+

Mr Edman Choy - Herzog & de Meuron
Mr Felix Li - TFP Farrells
Mr Gavin Erasmus - TFP Farrells

Presentation Session

10. The Chairman extended a welcome and invited the representatives of WKCD and the design teams to brief Members on the design and development of Xiqu Centre and M+.

11. Dr M.W. Chan gave a brief introduction of Xiqu Centre and M+, which were identified as city landmarks and earmarked for iconic design under the WKCD Development Plan. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation, Mr Eugene Ching and Mr Bing Thom made the following main points on Xiqu Centre:

Site Planning

- (a) occupying a prime site at the eastern edge of WKCD on the corner of Canton Road and Austin Road West, Xiqu Centre would provide a gateway of access to WKCD;
- (b) the Xiqu Centre site fell within the “Other Specified Uses” annotated “Arts, Cultural, Entertainment and Commercial Uses (5)” (“OU(ACECU)5”) sub-zone on the approved WKCD Development Plan No. S/K20/WKCD/2 (Development Plan). Development within this sub-zone was subject to a maximum gross floor area (GFA) of 29,900m² and a maximum building height (BH) of 70mPD;

- (c) as the existing Tsim Sha Tsui Fire Station was yet to be relocated upon completion of Xiqu Centre, access to the Avenue in the south would not be available then. A separate vehicular access from Austin Road West and a temporary car park were therefore proposed for Xiqu Centre;

[Ms Julia M.K. Lau arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

Design Concept

- (d) Xiqu Centre would be a unique performing arts venue built specifically for xiqu performances, and a centre for production, education and research of the art form;
- (e) the core design principles of Xiqu Centre were mainly derived from the philosophies of xiqu and Chinese culture, namely garden/city, courtyard/market place, gateway/pavilion and transition/flow. The essence of xiqu had been embodied in the design of Xiqu Centre, which blended theatre, arts education and public space together;
- (f) Xiqu Centre would provide a platform to preserve and reinvent Cantonese opera and Chinese traditional theatre for Hong Kong and beyond, and would showcase different xiqu styles, nurture new artists and build new audiences for this art form. The challenge of the architectural design was therefore to maintain the core traditional values of the art form while allowing for its evolvement beyond the future;
- (g) the exterior façade design of the Xiqu Centre building was greatly influenced by the idea of change, transition and translucency. A curtain-like façade was designed to convey the idea of show and performance, and to signify the festive atmosphere of xiqu. The weather-proof curtains would present a soft and light feeling for the permanent building;

Urban Design and Landscaping

- (h) as a gateway to WKCD, connectivity was one of the primary functions of Xiqu Centre. As there were a number of new and old infrastructure works near the Xiqu Centre site, the building design of Xiqu Centre would provide an opportunity to reorganise and improve the pedestrian and vehicular traffic movements of the area;
- (i) multi-level circulation paths were provided in Xiqu Centre to capture the pedestrian flow from Austin Road West, Canton Road and the adjoining sites;
- (j) the design of Xiqu Centre would allow for separation of pedestrian and vehicular traffic. Xiqu Centre would provide a safe and secure alternative route for pedestrian in lieu of the footpath along the heavy traffic of Canton Road;
- (k) the soft and hard landscapes of Xiqu Centre would be coherent with the local Hong Kong environment and expressed in the form of an orderly and rectilinear pattern;
- (l) the landscape treatment would align with the pedestrian flow patterns to and from adjacent roads. Tactile guide paths would be provided and integrated into the landscape paving design;
- (m) planters would be provided around the Xiqu Centre site to act as noise and visual buffers from adjacent roads and buildings. Native plant species would be used for the landscaping;

Architectural Design Concept

- (n) Xiqu Centre would serve different functions from commissioning performances to collaborative projects, and provide training and educational facilities as well as public leisure space for public enjoyment;

- (o) under the current design, Xiqu Centre would house a 1,100-seat main theatre and a 200-seat tea house with a performance stage. Arts education facilities, rehearsal rooms, back-of-house facilities, administration office, café and restaurants, and retail facilities would also be provided within the building;
- (p) visitors could enter the Xiqu Centre building from its door-less corners. The concept of gateway and pavilion had been embodied not only in the siting of the building but also the openness nature of the design;
- (q) a generous covered plaza would be created on the ground level, which served as an urban stage for informal and spontaneous performance. The use of curved planes, arched openings and circular paths would resemble the concept of flow;
- (r) there would be box offices, retail facilities, café and restaurants, and an amphitheatre on the upper and lower ground levels. Ample circulation space and seating areas would be provided for people passing through or visiting the building;
- (s) the main theatre, tea house, arts education facilities, rehearsal rooms and back-of-house facilities would be located on the upper floors of the Xiqu Centre building. In contrast to the design of tea house which would be expressed in traditional Chinese courtyard style, the main theatre would be designed in a fluid form to reflect the contemporary aspect of the art form;

Sustainability Measures

- (t) sustainability measures of Xiqu Centre mainly included the use of natural ventilation strategies for the covered plaza, common circulation space and theatre foyer to reduce dependency on air conditioning, and the introduction of a rainwater recycling system to reduce water

consumption;

Compliance with Development Plan

- (u) the building footprint of Xiqu Centre fell entirely within the “OU(ACECU)5” sub-zone on the Development Plan;
- (v) the proposed total GFA of Xiqu Centre was about 28,250m², slightly lower than the permitted maximum GFA of 29,900m² under the “OU(ACECU)5” sub-zone and hence allowing room for future extension;
- (w) the proposed BH of Xiqu Centre was about 65mPD, which was within the permitted maximum BH of 70mPD under the “OU(ACECU)5” sub-zone; and
- (x) the building was set back from the Avenue in the south and a non-building area had been allowed on the western side of the site.

12. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation, Mr Edman Choy and Mr Felix Li made the following main points on M+:

Background

- (a) the M+ museum, focusing on the 20th and 21st century visual culture, would accommodate exhibition spaces and create interdisciplinary exchange between visual arts and performing arts in WKCD. M+ would provide and present multiple and flexible platforms for multidisciplinary programming, exploring art, design, architecture and moving image;
- (b) the M+ site fell within the “OU(ACECU)2” sub-zone on the Development Plan. The proposed M+ building complied with all the planning requirements and development parameters on the Development

Plan and the urban design framework of WKCD;

- (c) situated at the eastern edge of the Park of WKCD, M+ would create an iconic presence on a landmark site overlooking Victoria Harbour. M+ would itself be a destination as well as a connection point to other places in and around WKCD including the Park, the Central Avenue and the waterfront promenade;

Site Setting

- (d) during the design competition stage, the M+ design team had proposed to improve Artist Square to the north-east of M+ in terms of size, function and sense of enclosure. As a result, the building masses around Artist Square had been reorganised with increased number of buildings fronting onto the square, and ground floor setbacks would be provided in these buildings to improve spatiality and usability of the square. A more gentle gradient from Artist Square towards M+ was also allowed to improve accessibility of the museum;
- (e) the size of the reorganised Artist Square was comparable to that of Centre Pompidou in Paris and about twice of the event space in front of Times Square in Hong Kong;

Architectural Design

- (f) the design concept of M+ was shaped around the museum's core values. It was the intention to adopt a simple and memorable architectural form for M+ so that the architecture could be easily understood by the public at large;
- (g) the schematic design of M+ composed of a slim and semi-transparent vertical tower centred on a horizontal podium of galleries and exhibition spaces, fused into the shape of an upside down 'T';

- (h) a main feature in the architectural design was making use of the existing Airport Express train tunnel to provide an excavated 'found space' at the basement level of M+. The 'found space' would be a special exhibition space shaded by the tunnel to be used by artists, curators, designers and architects for displaying their arts, designs and installations;
- (i) the main pedestrian entrance to M+ would be on the ground level where connections to the Park, Artist Square and other facilities in WKCD would be provided. When approaching from Artist Square, visitors would be welcome by the comfortable canopy and transparent main entrance of the M+ building;
- (j) the central atrium would be the main focus and orientation of the M+ building, providing a visual connection between the 'found space' at the basement level and the vertical tower above;
- (k) exhibition galleries arranged in a flexible manner would be provided at the podium levels for holding different kinds of display and exhibition;
- (l) the roof of the horizontal podium structure would be used as a terrace garden integrated with various activity and event spaces. The vertical tower would be elevated from the podium to allow uninterrupted connections between the southern and northern parts of the terrace garden. The terrace garden would also be physically linked to the lower floors of the podium structure by escalators and through a garden gallery;
- (m) the vertical tower would house art education facilities and museum office, with cafés and restaurants on the upper floors. The vertical surface of the tower would have LED elements integrated into the sun-shading system, serving as a media screen to broadcast the art works and exhibitions inside M+ to people outside the building; and
- (n) vehicular and pedestrian traffic of M+ would be totally separated. With the re-arranged carriageway, vehicles would arrive at the back of the

building at the basement level. Drop-off areas would be provided along the carriageway while other transport requirements had been satisfied.

Question and Discussion Session

13. The Chairman invited Members to give their views on the Xiqu Centre and M+ development. Members had the following questions and comments:

General

Sustainability Measures

- (a) what were the sustainability measures on energy-saving and waste recycling that would be adopted in the two developments?

Landscaping

- (b) whether the landscaping requirements of the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Report, in particular the use of grass species, had been addressed;

Xiqu Centre

Building Design

- (c) it was difficult to relate the building outlook to xiqu or Chinese culture. Key characteristics of xiqu, i.e. colours, vibrancy and the use of bamboos, and an atmosphere for the art form, should be reflected and incorporated into the building design;
- (d) whether any museum element would be incorporated into the building design, for example, showing exhibits relating to past practices of xiqu;

User Friendliness

- (e) consideration should be given to the user friendliness of the building especially for female and elder audiences. Ample spacing between rows of seats, adequate rest areas, wheelchair platforms and toilet facilities should be provided;

Landscaping

- (f) what were the rationales for planting tall trees around the Xiqu Centre building?

M+

Building Design

- (g) the form of the building appeared to be too simple, imposing and unattractive. The relevant authorities should ensure that the building design was acceptable in the interest of Hong Kong people;
- (h) the provision of observation decks on the podium and roof levels of the building would not be meaningful as M+ would be dwarfed by the skyscrapers in the surroundings;
- (i) lighting and humidity control were important design considerations for museums and should be adequately addressed in the building design;
- (j) the main entrance of M+ should be in proportion to the scale of the building;
- (k) sufficient space should be provided in the building for displaying outdoor art installations which was a stronghold of local arts and for workshop use for assembling purpose;
- (l) adequate café and restaurant facilities should be provided in the building

for use by visitors;

Vertical Tower

- (m) what were the dimensions of the typical floor plate for the vertical tower and what were the uses and facilities to be accommodated therein?
- (n) the design concept of transparency and the use of glass panels for the tower was not in line with conventional building design for museums. The materials used should be conducive to the environment, minimising glare and reflection of sunlight;

Media Screen

- (o) the purpose of the media screen on the vertical tower was unclear and appeared to be contradictory to the design concept of transparency;
- (p) substantial costs might be involved in maintaining and up-keeping the screen;
- (q) LED screen would only be useful for broadcasting computer-generated media but not for projection media;
- (r) the broadcasting might create nuisance and light pollution at night time;

Access and Loading/Unloading Arrangements

- (s) details of vehicular access arrangement for the museum building should be provided;
- (t) the transport and loading/unloading of art pieces and artifacts to the museum should be entirely hidden from the sight of visitors; and

Cooling Facilities

- (u) how would the development programme of M+ tie in with the construction of the district cooling system which was scheduled for completion by end 2017?

14. In response, Dr M.W. Chan, Mr Bing Thom, Mr Eugene Ching, Mr Edman Choy and Mr Felix Li made the following main points:

General

Sustainability Measures

- (a) it was a mandatory requirement to attain a minimum of BEAM Plus Gold rating for all art and cultural buildings in WKCD. The design of both Xiqu Centre and M+ was based on sustainable building design;
- (b) sustainability measures adopted in Xiqu Centre included:
 - (i) the covered plaza would mainly be naturally ventilated without the need for air-conditioning as Xiqu Centre was open at its three corners to facilitate public access; and
 - (ii) spatial and structural provisions had been allowed in the building design for the provision of rainwater recycling, solar water heating and waste recycling systems;
- (c) sustainability measures adopted in M+ included:
 - (i) the form and orientation of the building were designed with energy-saving objectives. With a north-south facing vertical tower, heat gain from east and west directions would be minimised;
 - (ii) the vertical tower was elevated above the horizontal podium so as

to facilitate natural ventilation through the podium level and the surrounding areas;

- (iii) louvres and sun-shading devices would be installed on the building facades to minimise heat gain in particular during the summer season. Heating system might be considered to maintain the comfort level of office environment during the winter season;
- (iv) a water cooling system would be introduced for basement levels and the conservation and storage facilities;
- (v) greening areas and landscaping at roof levels would serve as buffer to protect the building from sun heating; and
- (vi) insulated glass panels would be installed on the vertical tower. Relevant requirements on energy efficiency of the Electrical and Mechanical Services Department would be complied with;

Landscape Design

- (d) in the context of the whole WKCD, the landscaping requirements under the EIA report had been relayed to the consultants for following up;
- (e) the landscape design of M+ was still at the preliminary stage. Landscape treatments that were suitable for Hong Kong, and the use of native species would be considered in the design process;

Xiqu Centre

Building Design

- (f) it was one of the design objectives to attract the younger generation to participate in and enjoy xiqu in order to help sustain the art form. Hence, contemporary elements had been integrated in the building

design;

- (g) the distinctive architectural design concept of Xiqu Centre was to dress up the permanent building with a layer of curtain that could be adapted to change. The Chinese elements of flow or 'qi' had been embodied in the design of the building, the plaza and the landscape garden in the holistic manner;
- (h) Xiqu Centre would be defined as a museum or an art gallery by itself. There would be artifacts and show-pieces relating to xiqu performances such as photographs and costumes exhibited inside the building;

User Friendliness

- (i) there had been on-going discussions between the Xiqu Centre design team and performers/stakeholders regarding the user requirements of the building. The needs and requirements of the future audience would be adequately addressed in the building design;

Landscape Design

- (j) the purpose of landscaping with tall trees around Xiqu Centre was to strengthen the sense of scale of the building in particular for visitors approaching from the adjoining roads and pathways;

M+

Building Design

- (k) the design team of M+ had vast experience in museum building design around the world. In working out the schematic design, the design team had maintained close liaison with the M+ curatorial group to ensure that all the needs and requirements of the curatorial group, future users and visitors would be met. It was a common goal to provide a welcoming

and enjoyable museum at M+;

- (l) M+ was designated as a landmark building with iconic quality in WKCD. The outlook and form of landmark buildings were often controversial in the beginning. Famous examples were the Opera House in Sidney and Eiffel Tower in Paris;
- (m) M+ would be a building for public use. It was the principal design concept to adopt a simple geometry and orientation for the architecture so that the building and its spaces could be used, entered and moved freely by the public at large. Opportunity had also been taken to make the whole building, including the roof levels, accessible to the general public;
- (n) a total floor area of about 14,000m² of exhibition galleries would be housed in the podium of the building, where a wide range of lighting scenarios and ceiling heights would be provided to cater for the exhibition of different kinds and sizes of artifacts and art pieces;
- (o) café and restaurant facilities would be provided at various locations of M+ including the entrance level, the podium terrace garden and near the waterfront promenade to serve visitors and the general public;

Vertical Tower

- (p) the vertical tower, with a typical floor plate of 10 metres x 110 metres, would house mainly three types of uses and facilities, i.e. art education facilities including visual centre, classrooms and seminar rooms on the lower floors; museum office on the middle floors; and retail, dining and entertainment facilities on the upper floors;
- (q) the vertical tower would be installed with glass panels to optimise views and natural daylight for its users and visitors. The type of glass panels to be used would be specially oriented for cultural development projects;

- (r) the sun-shading devices on the vertical tower would help reduce direct reflection of sunlight. Low reflective glass materials would be used to enhance transparency of the building;

Media Screen

- (s) the media screen on the vertical tower would be distinguished from other typical advertising screens currently used in the office and commercial developments around Victoria Harbour. The broadcasting content and frequency would be driven by art and cultural considerations;

Access and Loading/Unloading Arrangements

- (t) the loading/unloading and logistic requirements of museums had been fully taken into account in the planning and design of M+, in consultation with the M+ curatorial group. Separate access arrangements would be provided for transportation of art pieces and for visitors; and

Cooling Facilities

- (u) it was anticipated that the cooling system for M+ would be completed before end 2017 given its proximity to the water intake point of the district cooling system.

15. The Chairman thanked Members for their views on the design of the Xiqu Centre and M+ in WKCD and requested WKCD and the design teams to take into account the views expressed by Members in the design process. The Chairman thanked the representatives of WKCD and the design teams for attending the meeting. They all left the meeting at this point.

[The meeting was adjourned for a break of 5 minutes.]

[Dr W.K. Yau and Mr Dominic K.K. Lam arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

Special Duties Section

Agenda Item 4

[Open Meeting]

Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island - Feasibility Study: Stage 2 Community Engagement and Draft Recommended Outline Development Plan

(TPB Paper No. 9589)

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese.]

16. Professor S.C. Wong had declared interests in this item as he had business dealings with Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Limited (ARUP) which was the consultant of the subject study.

17. As the item was mainly to solicit views from the Town Planning Board (the Board) on the draft Recommended Outline Development Plan (RODP) for the Ex-Lamma Quarry (ELQ) site, Members agreed that Professor S.C. Wong could stay in the meeting and participate in the discussion.

18. The following representatives from the Government and the consultants were invited to the meeting at this point:

| | | |
|------------------|---|--|
| Miss Elsa Cheuk | - | Chief Town Planner/Special Duties, Planning Department (CTP/SD, PlanD) |
| Mr David Lo | - | Chief Engineer/Islands, Civil Engineering and Development Department (CE/Is, CEDD) |
| Ms Theresa Yeung |] | |
| Ms Polly Mok |] | |
| Ms Jonial Wong |] | ARUP |
| Mr Barton Leung |] | |

Mr Lee Wai Lam]
Ms Betty Ho - PlanArch Consultants Ltd.

Presentation Session

19. The Chairman extended a welcome and invited the study team to brief Members on the Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island - Feasibility Study (the Study).

20. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation, Ms Teresa Yeung made the following main points as detailed in the Paper:

Background

- (a) the Study was jointly commissioned by PlanD and CEDD in January 2012;
- (b) the overall objective of the Study was to examine the future land use and explore the development potential of the ELQ site (Study Site), including residential development and other compatible uses. Technical assessments were also included to confirm the feasibility of the preferred land use option;
- (c) the Study Site was located in the northern part of Lamma Island and north of Sok Kwu Wan. It had an area of approximately 34.3 hectares which included about 20 hectares of platform area, 9 hectares of woodland, one kilometre of shoreline and a 5-hectare man-made lake. The Study Site was currently covered by the approved Lamma Island Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/I-LI/9 and was zoned “Undetermined”;
- (d) the Study Area covered a wider area including the Study Site, the adjacent “Comprehensive Development Area”, “Green Belt” and “Coastal Protection Area” zones with a total area of about 60 hectares. It was bounded by slopes in the northwest and the coastline in the southeast;

- (e) the findings and recommendations of the Study would serve as a reference for subsequent amendments to the Lamma Island OZP to guide the future development;
- (f) the Study included a 2-stage community engagement (CE). Stage 1 CE, which aimed at soliciting public views on the initial land use options formulated under the Study, was held from 7.12.2012 to 6.2.2013. During Stage 1 CE, a series of activities including a community workshop, a community forum and a public forum were conducted which were attended by over 250 participants. Briefing sessions to the statutory/advisory bodies including the Board, Legislative Council Panel on Development, Planning Sub-committee of the Land and Development Advisory Committee, the Islands and the Southern District Councils (DCs), and the Lamma North and South Rural Committees (RCs) were held. Several focus group workshops were organised for the professional institutes, green groups, local concern groups and tourism sector. Roving exhibitions were staged at different locations during the CE period;
- (g) during Stage 1 CE, three initial land use options (i.e. Options 1a and 1b under “Housing” theme and Option 2 under “Housing plus Tourism” theme) had been formulated for public consultation;

Major Public Views in Stage 1 CE

- (h) during Stage 1 CE, more than 500 written submissions were received. The major public comments collected were summarised as follows:

Need for Development

- (i) the Study Site should be developed to benefit the local economy and community in Sok Kwu Wan and enhance its economic vibrancy;

Demand for Government, Institution or Community Facilities

- (ii) necessary Government, institution or community facilities (G/IC) should be provided to support the community;

Urban Design

- (iii) the car-free environment on Lamma Island should be retained and the future developments should be within walking distance. The man-made lake should be protected and preserved in totality to enhance the local character of ELQ. The landscape, visual character and natural resources at the Study Site should be preserved;

Development Theme

- (iv) the 'Housing plus Tourism' theme could help meet the imminent housing need of Hong Kong and enhance the local economy and vibrancy. A diversity in land use should be included;

Development Scale / Intensity

- (v) the population density should be increased. However, high density development would be incompatible with the local and rural characters of Lamma Island;

Land Uses

- (vi) apart from residential and tourism uses, recreational and leisure uses should be provided. Marina development was not supported since there were concerns about the potential impact on water quality and the fish culture zones (FCZs) nearby;

Environmental Impacts

- (vii) consideration should be given to the potential environmental and ecological impacts on the natural environment and the adjoining

FCZs;

Connectivity

- (viii) connectivity of the Study Site with existing local community and the enhancement of both external and internal transport for the existing and future residents should be taken into account. Ferry services should be enhanced to cater for the increased traffic demand arising from the existing and future community in Sok Kwu Wan; and

Implementation

- (ix) there was strong aspiration for an early implementation of the Study Site and the future facilities should be affordable and accessible;

Draft Recommended Outline Development Plan

- (i) having regard to the public comments received during the Stage 1 CE, the draft RODP was formulated based on the “Tourism plus Housing” theme under Initial Option 2;
- (j) taking into account the planning objectives and guiding principles, such as the preservation of coastal protection area and ridgeline, findings of technical assessments and the existing infrastructure and environmental constraints, a Preferred Option had been formulated to further optimise development potentials of the Study Site by providing additional housing flats and recreational uses;

Planning and Design Concepts

- (k) the draft RODP was formulated based on the following planning and design concepts:
 - (i) to avoid disturbance to the area by confining developments at the

existing three platforms, residential developments would be concentrated on the central and western platforms while the northern platform would be reserved for tourism and recreational uses. The man-made lake and the woodland would be wholly preserved;

- (ii) major supporting G/IC facilities including sewage treatment works, refuse transfer facility and its associated pier, refuse collection point and fire station would be located at the north-eastern end of the Study Site with a view to minimising potential nuisances to the residential neighbourhood in the southern portion of the site;
- (iii) low-rise commercial uses within the 'Lamma Hub', located in front of the proposed ferry pier, would be the anchor point of the Study Site to promote a strong sense of arrival to the future residents and visitors;
- (iv) necessary G/IC facilities serving the community, such as library, social welfare facilities, community health centre and police post, were planned at convenient locations within the central platform;
- (v) apart from a resort hotel and an Outdoor Recreation Centre (ORC), a water sports centre at the lakeside was proposed to make good use of the lake and to enhance the recreational opportunities of Lamma Island as a leisure destination;
- (vi) a stepped building height (BH) profile descending from the hillslope to the waterfront for the residential sites was adopted to respect the natural surroundings. Height restrictions were imposed to preserve the ridgeline and the natural backdrop; and
- (vii) pedestrian footpaths and a continuous cycle track network would be provided to encourage walking and cycling as the main transport modes within the Study Site;

Land Use Budget

- (l) in terms of land use, the major components of the draft RODP were green belt (about 9 hectares), recreation (about 7 hectares), residential (about 6 hectares) and open space (about 4 hectares);

Key Features

- (m) the key features of the draft RODP were as follows:

Optimising Development Potentials to Satisfy Long-term Housing Needs

- (i) there were four residential sites in the central and south-western platforms. The overall plot ratio (PR) for the residential developments had increased from 0.84 in Initial Option 2 to 1.92 in the Preferred Option;
- (ii) the Study Site would provide about 1,900 residential units, including 1,200 private housing flats and 700 subsidised housing flats and accommodating about 5,000 persons;
- (iii) the increased population would make it more justifiable for provision of new G/IC services and more viable for enhancement of transport services;
- (iv) the proposed development parameters were optimised for the rural setting, without backfilling the man-made lake and the provision of new submarine fresh water pipe system from Hong Kong Island;

Enhancement of the Recreational and Tourism Potentials

- (v) the hotel site, with a proposed BH of 6 storeys and a PR of 1, would provide about 260 hotel rooms;

- (vi) a 'Tourism and Recreation Hub' was introduced in the northern platform. Apart from the proposed hotel, an ORC of about 2 hectares was proposed, offering a wide range of facilities including eco-tourism, organic farming, sports and recreation, camping grounds, etc. A water sports centre was located at the north-eastern edge of the lake as part of the ORC;
- (vii) a tourist information centre was proposed near the new ferry pier;
- (viii) the 'Lamma Hub' would be the anchor point of the Study Site. With a PR of 0.5, the Lamma Hub would provide a commercial gross floor area of about 6,000m² including an open-air entrance plaza for holding festive events;

Preserving Existing Woodland and Man-made Lake

- (ix) development would be confined to the existing three platforms without affecting the adjoining woodland and man-made lake. The woodland would be preserved as green belt and the existing trees would be retained as far as possible;

Developing a Green and Sustainable Community

- (x) the Preferred Option was characterised by a mixture of land uses, including housing, recreation/tourism uses, landside open space and waterfront promenade, which would enhance the character of the place;
- (xi) cycling and walking would be promoted as the major transport modes, together with environmentally friendly transport modes as ancillary services. All developments within the Study Site were within walking distance;

- (xii) sustainable initiatives such as green building design, efficient use of energy and water resources, and installation of waste recycling facilities, might be implemented in the new residential community;

Respecting Existing Character and Urban Design Principles

- (xiii) a stepped BH profile would be adopted. BHs of private housing blocks would range from 4 storeys on the waterfront to 11 storeys in the inland, while subsidised housing would have a maximum BH of 13 storeys;
- (xiv) view corridors were planned to protect the long-range views towards the green backdrop and other natural scenery;

Enhancing Transport Network

- (xv) a new ferry pier would be located towards the centre of the Study Site, which would accommodate the extension of existing licensed ferry services serving Sok Kwu Wan to the site. Landing steps would be reserved for public and hotel uses respectively; and
- (xvi) a comprehensive pedestrian walkway and cycle track network with supporting facilities was proposed;

[Ms Anita W.T. arrived to join and Ms Bernadette H.H. Linn left the meeting temporarily at this point.]

- (n) the proposed developments under the draft RODP were broadly feasible without insurmountable planning and engineering problems subject to appropriate improvement and mitigation measures;

Implementation

- (o) a detailed engineering design study would be undertaken after completion of the Study;
- (p) PlanD would prepare the necessary amendments to the OZP for submission to the Board upon finalisation of the RODP;
- (q) upon completion of the required statutory and funding approval procedures together with the site formation and infrastructure works, the first population intake would be around 2021;

Stage 2 CE Programme

- (r) public comments on the draft RODP were being sought under Stage 2 CE which started on 14.3.2014 and would last until 17.5.2014. Consultation with relevant statutory/advisory bodies, including the Islands and the Southern DCs, the relevant RCs, the Legislative Council Panel on Development and local concern groups would be conducted. A focus group meeting and a public forum would be held on 23.4.2014 and 3.5.2014 respectively; and
- (s) public views received during the Stage 2 CE would be taken into account in refining the recommended development proposals.

Question and Discussion Session

21. The Chairman thanked the study team for giving the presentation and invited Members' views on the Study. Members had the following questions and comments:

Planning Concept

- (a) given the planned self-contained community and the unique setting of the Study Site, a more visionary approach on sustainable development could be considered and incorporated in the general planning intention to govern

the future development of the area. For example, the proposed developments could be promoted under the concept of 'Eco-town' and targets could be set for minimising carbon emission and waste production, and saving energy, etc.;

- (b) in view of the relatively small scale of the proposed developments with a design population about 5,000 people, a new approach could be adopted for planning the Study Site. Opportunities for introducing experimental schemes in terms of environmental protection and sustainable development should also be explored;
- (c) consideration should be given to the economic development of Hong Kong as a whole. Given the location of the Study Site on an outlying island with a unique setting, it would be more appropriate to develop the site solely for tourism-related uses;

Transport Arrangement

- (d) what was the proposed external traffic arrangement to serve the future population at the Study Site in particular during peak hours?
- (e) since subsidised housing was proposed at the Study Site and affordable transport would be a relevant consideration for future residents, whether any assessment on the level of transportation cost had been undertaken in the Study;
- (f) whether the financial viability and intention of operators in providing ferry service to the Study Site had been considered in the Study;
- (g) in view of the improved accessibility of Hong Kong Island South after completion of the MTR South Island Line (East), consideration should be given to enhancing the ferry service between the Study Site/Sok Kwu Wan and Aberdeen/Ap Lei Chau;

Impact on FCZs

- (h) whether the FCZs in Sok Kwu Wan would be adversely affected by the future ferry operations serving the Study Site;

Provision of G/IC Facilities

- (i) what kind of G/IC facilities would be provided to serve the future population at the Study Site?
- (j) whether the planning and design of the Study Site had taken in account the needs of elderly people;
- (k) provision of educational facilities at the Study Site should be considered;

[Ms Bernadette H.H. Linn returned to join the meeting at this point.]

Tourism Facilities

- (l) Hong Kong was lacking in tourist and recreational attractions. Opportunity should be taken to make the best use of the Study Site to provide tourist facilities for overseas and Mainland visitors such as hotels and attractions with local character;
- (m) the Study Site provided good opportunity for tourist and recreational facilities such as landscaped gardens with seasonal flora themes, cycle tracks with supporting facilities and jogging trails;
- (n) the development potential of the existing tourist attractions near Sok Kwu Wan such as the seafood restaurants and 'Cave Kamikaze' (神風洞) should be optimised;

Housing Mix

- (o) the planning and design concept for the Study Site was similar to that of Discovery Bay and Ma Wan which were mainly for private residential developments. The proposed housing mix under the draft RODP could be further reconsidered as there might not be sufficient jobs within the Study Site for the future subsidised housing residents and high level of external transportation cost would be become a financial burden to them; and
- (p) the proportion of subsidised housing development under the draft RODP was appropriate as the residents would offer labour force to take up jobs provided within the Study Site.

22. In response, Miss Elsa Cheuk and Ms Theresa Yeung made the following main points:

Planning Concept

- (a) various sustainable development and design principles, including preservation of natural and landscape resources, retention of a 'car-free' environment, provision of cycle tracks and landscaped boulevard, confinement of developments in the existing platforms, and adoption of low to medium development intensity, had been applied in formulating the draft RODP to enhance living quality within the Study Site. Other environmental protection measures such as the provision of efficient water supply installations, and new refuse recycling, compression and transfer systems, would also be considered in the next stage of the study process;
- (b) the relevant Government bureaux and departments would be consulted on the feasibility of promoting the Study Site as an 'Eco-town' or under other sustainability development themes after Stage 2 CE;
- (c) the 'Housing plus Tourism' theme was favoured by the consultees during Stage 1 CE as it could help meet the imminent housing need of Hong Kong and enhance the local economy and vibrancy. A proper balance had to be

struck between different development needs;

Transport Arrangement

- (d) preliminary traffic assessment conducted for the Study revealed that ferry would be the most suitable transport mode to serve the future population at the Study Site;
- (e) the preliminary transport proposal was to extend the existing ferry service between Sok Kwu Wan and Central by adding an additional stop at the new ferry pier at the Study Site;
- (f) Yung Shue Wan in the north-western part of Lamma Island had a population of about 5,500 people, which was about the same as the total of the design population for the Study Site and the population of Sok Kwu Wan. By making reference to the existing ferry service between Yung Shue Wan and Central, it was envisaged that ferry service to Central with frequencies of about 30 minutes during peak hours and about one hour during other times of the day would be feasible to serve the future population of the Study Site and Sok Kwu Wan. The findings of the preliminary traffic assessment were accepted by the relevant Government departments;
- (g) the existing ferry route serving Sok Kwu Wan and Central was running at a relatively low frequency. By extending this ferry service to the Study Site and increasing its frequency upon completion of the proposed developments, the increased patronage would render enhancement to the ferry service more viable;
- (h) based on the experience of people living and working on outlying islands, the use of monthly tickets might be helpful to improve the affordability of ferry tickets for the future living and working population;
- (i) implementation of appropriate ferry service for the Study Site to serve the

future population would be considered in consultation with the relevant Government departments and the ferry operators;

Impact on FCZs

- (j) the FCZs were located away from the existing ferry route to and from Sok Kwu Wan. As the proposed new ferry pier at the Study Site was located along the existing route, the FCZs would not be adversely affected by the extended ferry service for the Study Site;

Provision of G/IC Facilities

- (k) G/IC facilities at the Study Site were planned in accordance with the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines;
- (l) under the draft RODP, a community health centre, a library, social welfare facilities and a police post would be provided at the platform near the new ferry pier. Land was also reserved for the development of other G/IC facilities such as social welfare facilities and kindergartens to meet the future needs of the local community;
- (m) given that sufficient school facilities had been provided on Lamma Island, and taking account of the views of Lamma residents received during Stage 1 CE that they preferred to commute to Hong Kong Island South for schooling, no educational facilities were proposed under the draft RODP;

Tourism Facilities

- (n) under the draft RODP, a resort hotel and an ORC including a water sports centre at the lakeside were proposed to make good use of the lake and to enhance the recreational opportunities of Lamma Island as a leisure destination. There were also footpaths connecting the Study Site with other tourist attractions on Lamma Island such as Yung Shue Wan. Opportunities to further enhance the tourism potentials of the Study Area

would be explored in the next stage of the study process;

Housing Mix

- (o) in response to the aspiration of Lamma residents for the provision of affordable housing within the Study Site as indicated during Stage 1 CE, the planning of about 700 subsidised housing units had been provided for in the draft RODP; and
- (p) the proposed subsidised housing units would be provided under the Home Ownership Scheme. The proposed ratio between subsidised housing and private housing developments was considered suitable for the Study Site.

23. The Chairman thanked Members for their views on the Preferred Option and the draft RODP for the Study Site and requested the study team to take into account the views expressed by Members at the next stage of the Study. The Chairman thanked the representatives of the Government and the consultants for attending the meeting. They all left the meeting at this point.

[Dr W.K. Yau left the meeting at this point.]

Fanling, Sheung Shui & Yuen Long East District

Agenda Item 5

[Open Meeting]

Request for Deferment of Review of Application No. A/YL-KTS/616

Temporary Open Storage of New Coaches and New Vehicle Parts with Ancillary Workshop for a Period of 1 Year in “Other Specified Uses” annotated “Rural Use” zone, Lots 560 (Part), 563 (Part), 564 (Part), 565 (Part), 618 S.C (Part), 618 RP (Part) in D.D. 106, Kam Sheung Road, Pat Heung, Yuen Long
(TPB Paper No. 9557)

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese.]

24. The Secretary reported that on 27.2.2014, the applicant wrote to the Secretary of the Town Planning Board (the Board) requesting the Board to defer making a decision on the review application for a period of two months to allow time for the applicant to prepare the fire service installations proposal to address the Fire Services Department's comments. This was the first request from the applicant for deferment of the review hearing.

25. Members noted that the justifications for deferment met the criteria for deferment as set out in Town Planning Board Guidelines No. 33 on Deferment of Decision on Representations, Comments, Further Representations and Applications (TPB PG-No. 33) in that the applicant needed more time to prepare further information to address the relevant departmental comments on the review application, the deferment period was not indefinite and the deferment would not affect the interest of other relevant parties.

26. After deliberation, the Board agreed to defer a decision on the review application as requested by the applicant pending the submission of further information by the applicant. The Board also agreed that the review application should be submitted for its consideration within three months upon receipt of the further submission from the applicant. If the further information submitted by the applicant was not substantial and could be processed within a shorter time, the application could be submitted to an earlier meeting for the Board's consideration. The applicant should be advised that the Board had allowed two months for preparation of submission of further information, and no further deferment would be granted unless under very special circumstances.

[Mr Clarence W.T. Leung and Mr Eric K.S. Hui left the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Items 6 to 9

[Closed Meeting]

27. These items were recorded under confidential cover.

Agenda Item 10

[Open Meeting]

Any Other Business

28. There being no other business, the meeting closed at 12:05 p.m.