

CONFIDENTIAL

(Downgraded on 17.9.2010)

**Minutes of 425th Meeting of the
Metro Planning Committee held on 27.8.2010**

[Mr. Eric C.K. Yue, District Planning Officer/Kowloon (DPO/K), Miss Annie K.W. To, Senior Town Planner/Kowloon (STP/K) and Ms. Una Wang, Air Ventilation Assessment (AVA) Consultant were invited to the meeting at this point.]

Agenda Item 7

[Closed Meeting]

Proposed Amendments to the

Approved Wang Tau Hom & Tung Tau Outline Zoning Plan No. S/K8/19

(MPC Paper No. 18/10)

1. The Secretary reported that the proposed amendments of the approved Wang Tau Hom & Tung Tau Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/K8/19 involved a redevelopment site of the Urban Renewal Authority (URA), public rental housing, Home Ownership Scheme (HOS) and Private Sector Participation Scheme (PSPS) sites developed by the Hong Kong Housing Authority (HKHA), as well as a Hong Kong Housing Society (HKHS) development, i.e. Kai Tak Garden. The following Members had declared interests for this item:

| | |
|---|---|
| Mr Jimmy Leung as the Director of Planning | } being a non-executive director of the URA, Member of the Strategic Planning Committee and Building Committee of HKHA and Member of Supervisory Board of the HKHS; |
| Mr. Maurice W.M. Lee | - being a former non-executive director of the URA with the term of office ended on 30.11.2008; |
| Mr. Raymond Y.M. Chan | } being a Member of the Home Purchase Allowance (HPA) Appeals Committee; |
| Ms. Maggie M.K. Chan | } |

- | | |
|--|--|
| Ms. Olga Lam as the Assistant Director of the Lands Department | - being an assistant to the Director of Lands who was a non-executive director of the URA and Member of Supervisory Board of the HKHS; |
| Mr. Andrew Tsang as the Assistant Director of the Home Affairs Department | - being an assistant to the Director of Home Affairs who was a non-executive director of the URA and a Member of the Strategic Planning Committee and Subsidised Housing Committee of HKHA; and |
| Mr. H.L. Cheng as the Chief Transport Engineer of the Transport Department | - being an assistant to the Secretary for Transport and Housing who was the Chairman of the Strategic Planning Committee of HKHA and an assistant to the Permanent Secretary for Transport and Housing who was a Member of Supervisory Board of the HKHS. |

2. The Committee also noted that Ms. Maggie M.K. Chan was a district councillor of Wong Tai Sin District Council and had declared an interest for this item.

3. The Secretary said that it was the Board's practice that Members could stay in the meeting for item related to plan-making after interests were declared. Ms. Maggie Chan, Mr. Maurice W.M. Lee, Mr. Raymond Y.M. Chan and Mr. Andrew Tsang had tendered apologies for not attending the meeting. The Committee agreed that the other Members who had declared an interest could stay in the meeting.

Presentation and Question Sessions

4. With the aid of a model, a powerpoint presentation and a 3-Dimensional fly-through, Mr. Eric C.K. Yue, District Planning Officer/Kowloon (DPO/K) and Miss Annie K.W. To, Senior Town Planner/Kowloon, (STP/K) explained the general context of the Area and the proposed amendments to the OZP. The following main points were covered:

Purpose of the Amendments

- (a) the purpose of the proposed amendments to the OZP was mainly threefold. Firstly, building height (BH) restrictions were imposed on development

zones including “Residential (Group A)” (“R(A)”), “Commercial” (“C”), “Government/Institution or Community” (“G/IC”), “Other Specified Use (Cemetery)” (“OU(Cemetery)”) and “OU(Petrol Filling Station)” zones. Secondly, non-building areas (NBA) and building gap were designated in various zones. Thirdly, rezoning proposals were proposed to reflect existing conditions, planning intention and planned infrastructure;

General Context of the Area

- (b) to the east of the Wang Tau Hom and Tung Tau area (the Area) was Tsz Wan Shan, Diamond Hill and San Po Kong area and to its west was Kowloon Tong. To the south of the Area were Ma Tau Kok area and the Kai Tak Development Area. BH restrictions had been incorporated in the relevant OZPs for these areas;
- (c) the existing BH profile of the Area followed the natural topography. The Area was located at the foothill of Lion Rock (site level of about 100mPD) descending towards the east (site level ranging from 5.6mPD to 8mPD) and southeast (site level of about 6mPD) to adjoin the Tsz Wan Hill, Diamond Hill and San Po Kong area and with the green knoll in the west (site level of about 33mPD) next to the Kowloon Tong area;
- (d) a large portion of the Area had already been developed. The predominant land use was residential which consisted mainly of public rental housing estates, HOS and a PSPS. The Area could be divided into three sub-areas: Tung Tau Residential Area, Wong Tai Sin Residential Area and Wang Tau Hom Residential and Commercial Area;

Tung Tau Residential Sub-Area

- (e) Tung Tau was under greater development pressure among the three sub-areas. The sub-area was mainly occupied by medium-rise public housing development of Tung Tau Estate (II) (mostly less than 20 storeys) which were less than 30 years. There were a few old residential developments over 30 years in the sub-area including Mei Tung Estate, Tung Tau Estate (I) and the private residential blocks along Heng Lam

Street (i. e. Luen Hop Building and Kam Kwok Building). The two recently completed residential developments in the sub-area were Le Billionaire and Tung Tau Cottage Area West (Mei Yan House), with BH over 140mPD. Two proposed public housing redevelopment sites - Tung Tau Estate Phase 9 which was under construction with proposed BH of 90mPD to 115 mPD (29 to 38 storeys), and the Tung Tau Cottage Area East Redevelopment with a proposed BH of 120 mPD (35 storeys) were also within this sub-area;

Wong Tai Sin Residential Sub-Area

- (f) Wong Tai Sin sub-area had been developed with mainly a public housing development (Lower Wong Tai Sin Estate) and a Hong Kong Housing Society project (Kai Tak Garden). These housing developments were less than 30 years with BH varying from about 80mPD to 124mPD;

Wang Tau Hom Residential and Commercial Sub-Area

- (g) Wang Tau Hom sub-area had a stepped height profile ascending westward from Fung Mo Street and northward from Heng Lam Street to the foothill area. Buildings in this sub-area were mainly high-rise public and private residential developments of more than 20 storeys with a few reaching 38 to 40 storeys. The building age of developments was generally less than 30 years. These developments included public housing (Wang Tau Hom Estate and Lok Fu Estate), HOS developments (such as Fu Keung Court, Tin Ma Court etc.) and PSPS development (Tsui Chuk Garden);
- (h) the Lok Fu Shopping Centre with an existing height of 51.7mPD was the commercial node zoned “C” and located to the immediate south of Lok Fu MTR Station;

Nga Tsin Wai Village

- (i) Nga Tsin Wai Village (about 4,637m²), which was an old urban village (with structures of 1 to 2 storeys) located in the eastern part of Tung Tau sub-area along Kai Tak Nullah, was zoned “R(A)” on the OZP. It was included in the urban renewal project of URA – Project K1. According to

URA's information, the acquisition of properties and demolition of vacated properties were in progress;

- (j) there were several large scale open spaces within the Area. Stretching from the north to south were Lion Rock Park, Ma Chai Hang Playground, Morse Park, Lok Fu Recreation Ground, Shek Ku Lung Road Playground. The Area also adjoined Kowloon Walled City Park in the south. These open spaces attributed to the good air quality of the area;

Spatial Attributes

- (k) the Lion Rock was an important physical feature providing a unique setting for the Area. As identified under Urban Design Guidelines Study, the Area mainly fell within the view fans of two vantage points, i.e. Quarry Bay Park vantage point and Sheung Wan vantage point. Three local view corridors towards Lion Rock were identified in the Area, namely from the amphitheatre of Morse Park, Lok Fu Fresh Water Service Reservoir in Kowloon Tong, and the proposed open space in Kai Tak;
- (l) Kai Tak Nullah was a local visual corridor and breezeway in the Area. Improvement works of the nullah were currently being undertaken by Drainage Services Department (DSD), which would transform the Kai Tak Nullah into an urban green visual corridor in the built environment, forming an extension of Kai Tak River from the south in Kai Tai;
- (m) Hau Wong Temple and Nga Tsin Wai Village were two important built heritage in the Area. Hau Wong Temple was a Grade I historical building whereas Nga Tsin Wai was an old urban village included in an urban renewal project of URA;

Overall BH Concept

- (n) the BH restrictions were imposed with due regard to a list of urban design principles which included preserving the ridgeline of Lion Rock, respecting the physical terrain and existing BH profile, preserving visual relief and breathing space, compatibility with local character, preserving Kai Tak

Nullah as a major breezeway and a green river corridor and respecting the historical and cultural heritage;

- (o) the BH review had also taken into account the findings and recommendations of the AVA as appropriate. According to the AVA, there was no focus area of concerns in the Area. The existing open spaces were well distributed and linked serving as 'air spaces'. The existing roads/streets together with greeneries and open spaces formed significant air paths. These roads should be rezoned to 'Road'. Nine NBAs and one building gap were recommended while two NBAs were proposed to be implemented upon redevelopment;
- (p) taking into account the spatial attributes and the urban design principles, BH bands in a stepped height profile following natural topography of the Area was adopted for the major development zones while those for the "G/IC" and "OU" zones were mainly to reflect the heights of the existing and planned developments. Eight BH bands from 60mPD to 180mPD were proposed. The proposed BHs ascended from 60mPD and 80mPD next to the open Kai Tak Nullah and Kowloon Walled City Park to 100mPD around Morse Park including the Wong Tai Sin sub-area, and further stepped up to 120mPD next to the knoll close to Kowloon Tong and 140mPD to 180mPD in the foothill area of Lion Rock;
- (q) details of the BH proposals for "R(A)" and "C" zones in the sub-areas were shown in Plan 12 of the Paper;

Tung Tau Residential Sub-area

- (r) this sub-area was mainly occupied by medium-rise to high-rise residential buildings. Taking into account the topography, site levels, the local view corridor and local character as well as to allow a smooth transition of BH stepping down towards nearby areas including San Po Kong Business Area, the Kowloon Walled City Park and Ma Tau Kok area, BH bands of 60 mPD to 120mPD were proposed for the residential developments in this sub-area:

- (i) maximum BH of 60mPD and 80mPD were proposed for Mei Tung Estate to cater for future redevelopment. In order to be compatible with the adjacent Kowloon Walled City Park in the south and the historical remains therein, the BH restrictions of 60mPD and 80mPD were proposed for the eastern and western parts of the site respectively (Plan 14E of the Paper);
- (ii) maximum BH of 80mPD and 100mPD were proposed for Tung Tau Estate. 80mPD was proposed for the estate along the western side of the open Kai Tak Nullah, with a stepping height of 100mPD westward. This was to echo with the BH restrictions of 80mPD for developments on the other side of Kai Tak Nullah in San Po Kong;
- (iii) maximum BH of 100mPD and 120mPD were proposed for Tung Tau Phase 9 Redevelopment which was under construction. The maximum BH descended eastward from 120mPD to 100mPD in order to preserve portion of the ridgeline of Lion Rock from the Kai Tak view corridor and to reflect the height of the redevelopment; and
- (iv) a maximum BH of 120mPD was proposed for the committed redevelopment of Tung Tau Cottage Area East, the newly completed Tung Tau Cottage Area West redevelopment (Mei Yan House), the old private residential areas along Heng Lam Street and a maximum BH of 140mPD for the private residential development of Le Billionaire. This height band was imposed taking into account the site levels and the compatibility with the adjacent medium-rise “R(A)2” developments in Ma Tau Kok area with a maximum BH restriction of 80mPD.

Wong Tai Sin Residential Sub-area

- (s) this sub-area was occupied by the high-rise public housing of Lower Wong Tai Sin Estate and the Housing Society development of Kai Tak Garden. A maximum BH of 100mPD was proposed for the two residential developments taking into account the existing building height profile;

Wang Tau Hom Residential and Commercial Sub-area

- (t) this sub-area was predominantly occupied by high-rise public and private residential developments with shopping facilities. Considering the existing building height profile, the natural topography and local view corridors, a maximum BH of 60mPD was proposed for the “C” zone and maximum BH bands varying from 80mPD to 180mPD for the residential developments in this sub-area. Details were as follows:
- (i) a maximum BH of 60mPD was proposed for the Lok Fu Shopping Centre in the “C” zone in this sub-area to reflect the as-built development;
 - (ii) a maximum BH of 80mPD was proposed for the northern part of Lok Fu Estate (Wang Shun and Wang Tat Buildings) to maintain a stepped height gradation from Lok Fu Shopping Centre;
 - (iii) maximum BH bands of 100mPD to 120mPD were proposed for residential developments in the southern and central part of the Area (mainly south of Lung Cheung Road). These included the public housing developments of Wang Tau Hom Estate, Lok Fu Estate; HOS developments of Hong Keung Court, Tak Keung Court and Fu Keung Court. These height bands were mainly proposed to maintain the existing height profile of the Area and to achieve a stepped height profile from the south; and
 - (iv) maximum BH bands of 140mPD to 180mPD were imposed for residential sites near the foothill of Lion Rock along Chuk Yuen Road and Lung Cheung Road, including Ka Keung Court, Tin Ma Court, Tin Wang Court and Tsui Chuk Garden. This was mainly to follow the sloping topography at the foothill area of Lion Rock, with respect to the as-built height profile of the existing locality. The maximum BH bands of 160 mPD and 180mPD for Tsui Chuk Garden were to preserve the backdrop of the Lion Rock ridgeline from the Morse Park view

corridor.

Nga Tsin Wai Redevelopment (URA Project K1) in Tung Tau Area

- (u) according to the redevelopment proposal of URA in 2007, which was agreed by the Government, the existing gatehouse with the embedded stone tablet of “Hing Yau Yu” (慶有餘) and Tin Hau Temple (天后廟) and eight existing houses along the central spine of the village would be preserved in-situ together with development of a conservation park. In order to preserve the Lion Rock ridgeline from the Kai Tak view corridor, a stepped BH profile, with BH of 134mPD to 100mPD (up to main roof) from west to east for the South Towers, and a height limit of 106mPD (up to main roof) for the North Towers, was proposed for the residential development within the site. The proposed total GFA of the project was about 37,097m², providing 580 flats, 2,319m² commercial GFA as well as 1,400m² open space. In order to reflect the agreed layout which took into account the need to preserve the Lion Rock ridgeline from the Kai Tak view corridor as well as the conservation elements of the project, specific maximum BH restrictions were imposed including 15mPD for the existing houses in the middle of the site, 106mPD for the residential towers in the north, and 100mPD/134mPD for the residential towers in the south (Plan 12 of the Paper);

Proposed BH for “G/IC” and “OU” Zones

- (v) the existing “G/IC” sites, which were mostly low rise and of medium density, served as breathing space and visual relief in the densely built-up area. The BH restrictions for the total 45 “G/IC” sites (including 10 for community uses, 18 for educational uses, 12 for Government uses and 5 for utilities/other uses) and 4 “OU” sites in the Area were proposed mainly to reflect the existing and planned developments in the Area. In general, low-rise developments, normally with a height of not more than 13 storeys, will be subject to BH restrictions in terms of number of storey(s) (excluding basement floor(s)) so as to allow more design flexibility. For taller developments, usually more than 13 storeys, the BH restrictions were specified in terms of mPD to provide certainty and clarity of the planning

intention. Details of the BH proposals for “G/IC” and “OU” zones were shown in Plan 13 and Appendix IV of the Paper ;

- (w) a BH restriction of 64mPD was proposed for the relocation site of Kowloon City Baptist Church at Tung Lei Road in the Tung Tau area;
- (x) a 1-storey BH restriction was proposed for the “OU(Petrol Filling Station)” zone to reflect the three existing 1-storey petrol filling stations along Prince Edward Road East. BH restrictions of 3 storeys, 4 storeys and 6 storeys were proposed for “OU (Cemetery)” zone to reflect the existing and committed building structures on site. Also, a 2-storey BH restriction was proposed along the southern boundary of the cemetery to allow flexibility for future intensification of the columbaria use. The remaining area of the cemetery was subject to a maximum BH of 1 storey;

Non-Building Areas and Building Gap

- (y) the Air Ventilation Assessment (AVA) Study of the Area had recommended some improvement measures to enhance the existing air path network for better air ventilation of the Area. Based on the results of the AVA Study, a total of 9 NBAs, most of which were existing public/internal roads and a building gap in Tung Tau area (Plan 12 of the Paper) were proposed as follows:
 - (i) the small western portion in Tin Ma Court with an area of about 2,100m², which was currently a landscaped area/basketball court, was designated as a NBA to allow better air path connection between the “O” zone of the Lion Rock Service Reservoir in the north-west with Lung Cheung Road and the “O” site in Wang Tau Hom Estate areas;
 - (ii) within Wang Tau Hom Estate, the estate roads of Wang Tau Hom North Road and Fu Yue Road, the open car park and a small strip of slope were designated as NBAs to connect the air paths along existing road network;

- (iii) a small portion of land at the southern corner of the “G/IC” site of Wang Tau Hom Jockey Club Clinic abutting Fu Keung Street, which was currently not occupied by any structure, was designated as a NBA to extend the air path of Wang Tau Hom South Road westward to Junction Road and Lok Fu Park;
- (iv) within Wang Tau Hom Estate, the estate road of Fu Mou Street was designated as a 12m-wide NBA to connect the air path of Wang Tau Hom East Road eastward with Fung Mo Street and Morse Park and provide very useful east-west air ventilation to the public transport interchange within the estate;
- (v) an existing internal road in Lower Wong Tai Sin Estate was designated as a 12m-wide NBA to form an extension of air path from Ching Tak Street to Kai Tak Nullah and Choi Hung Road Playground providing useful air ventilation connectivity to San Po Kong;
- (vi) a 10m-wide NBA which was mainly occupied by emergency vehicle access, Tung Kwong Road, road pavement, and open space/landscaped area, with a small portion intruded into the boundaries of Kai Tak Garden, Tung Tau (II) Estate, SKH Kei Tak School and Lee Kau Yan Memorial School, was designated along the western side of the Kai Tak Nullah within “R(A)”, “O” and “G/IC” zones, so as to improve the wind environment in the district. Kai Tak Nullah, together with the NBA as well as the whole width of Choi Hung Road, would form a 30m to 50m-wide major breezeway in the Area;
- (vii) Likewise, a 10m-wide NBA was designated along the eastern side of the Kai Tak Nullah within “O” and “G/IC” zones, which included Yuk Kwan Road with a small encroachment onto the boundaries of Lok Sin Tong Wong Chung Ming Secondary School and Ng Wah Catholic Primary School, so as to improve the wind environment in the Area;
- (viii) a small patch of area of about 700 m² at the junction of Tung Lung

Road and Lok Sin Road within “R(A)” zone of Tung Tau Estate, which was currently occupied by a sitting-out area and an electricity sub-station (ESS), was designated as NBA to connect the air path from Tung Lung Road to Shek Ku Lung Playground;

- (ix) a NBA of varying width of 12m to 38m was designated in the “R(A)” zone at the southern boundary of Tung Tau Cottage Area East, which would be occupied by landscaped deck and retaining slopes, to connect air path from Tung Tsing Road through the cemetery to Junction Road; and
- (x) a strip of 7-m wide land along the eastern side of the low-rise multi-storey carpark building within “R(A)” zone of Tung Tau (II) Estate and “G/IC” zone of Chi Tak Public School was demarcated as a building gap in a north-south direction and subject to a maximum BH restriction of 17mPD, which was the existing height of the carpark building, in order to allow the connection of air streams between Tung Fat Road in the north to Tung Lung Road in the south.

Rezoning Proposals

- (z) various rezoning proposals (Plans 25A to 32C) mainly to reflecting existing G/IC and open space uses, and also designating existing internal roads within public housing estates as NBAs were proposed and summarised as follows:
 - (i) the existing public roads within Wang Tau Hom Estate, Lower Wong Tai Sin Estate and Tung Tau Estate were rezoned from “R(A)” to areas shown as ‘Road’ to reflect as-built situation and ensure unobstructed air paths;
 - (ii) a site at Tung Tau Tsuen Road which was currently occupied by an ESS and zoned “R(A)” on the OZP. It was proposed to rezoned the ESS from “R(A)” to “G/IC” zone to reflect the as-built situation;

- (iii) a site at Heng Lam Street, which was used as an existing sitting-out area and fell within an area shown as 'Road' on the OZP, was proposed to be rezoned to "O" to reflect the existing situation;
- (iv) a site at Lok Sin Road, which was used as an existing sitting-out area and zoned "G/IC" on the OZP, was proposed to be rezoned to "O" to reflect the existing situation;
- (v) in order to create an enhanced pedestrian environment connecting Tung Tau area with Kai Tak, portions of the existing Shek Ku Lung Road Playground and Prince Edward Road East were rezoned from "O" and area shown as 'Road' to "OU(Landscaped Elevated Walkway)", which would tally with the current zoning of the proposed curvilinear footbridge shown on Kai Tak OZP and Tsz Wan Shan, Diamond Hill & San Po Kong OZP; and
- (vi) a site to the immediate south of Tung Tau Block 22 currently occupied by Po Yan Catholic Primary School and zoned "R(A)" on the OZP was proposed to be rezoned from "R(A)" to "G/IC" to reflect the as-built situation.

Kai Tak Nullah (Plan 33A to E of the Paper)

- (aa) the nullah section between Shatin Pass Road and Tai Shing Street, which was under the project of Reconstruction and Improvement of Kai Tak Nullah – Choi Hung Road section would be decked. On the decked-over portion, sitting-out area, amenity area, feature sculptures, open plaza with trees, green corridor and sidewalk for leisure purpose would be provided. To reflect the intended use of the project, the decked section of the nullah would be rezoned from "G/IC" to "O(1)";
- (bb) the improvement works for the section of the nullah between Tung Kwong Road and Prince Edward Road East was under investigation by DSD. As this section of the nullah would be kept open, the original "G/IC" zoning intended for a decked nullah for abating the environmental problems and

road widening, was no longer appropriate. In parallel, a public engagement exercise would soon be conducted by DSD, CEDD and PlanD for the rehabilitation and revitalization projects of Kai Tak River with an aim to solicit public views on the design of the river and the integration with the surrounding developments. It was therefore proposed to rezone the open water section of the nullah from “G/IC” to “U” pending completion of the public engagement exercise and the results of the land use reviews for the future use of the nullah and its adjoining areas; and

- (cc) the long term planning intention was to revitalise the nullah to form a major green river corridor with appropriate land uses on both sides such as riverside walkway in Wong Tai Sin district as well as to form an integral part of Kai Tak River in the south. Opportunity would also be taken to examine the possibility of linking up the heritage/ cultural spots including the Longin Bridge Archaeological Site in the south, the Kowloon Walled City Park, the historic relics of Nga Tsin Wai Village as well as Wong Tai Sin Folk Culture Area, ex-Tai Hom Village and Nan Lian Garden in the north.

5. In response to a Member’s enquiry, Mr. Eric Yue replied that the existing BH of Le Billionaire were 144.4mPD for Phase 1 and 170mPD for Phase 2 and the proposed BH restriction for the site was 140mPD. The site was allowed to build up to the existing BH upon redevelopment as it was not a site located along waterfront or at major air path and the existing building would not block the view towards the 20% building free zone of the ridgeline.

[Mr. Roger Luk left the meeting at this point.]

6. A Member asked how the Area would be connected to the Kai Tak development. Mr. Yue explained that there were several existing and proposed connections across Prince Edward Road East in the form of footbridge, subway and underground shopping street to connect Kai Tak to the surrounding districts including the Area. The Secretary supplemented that in considering the connectivity of the Kai Tak development, there was previously a proposal to depress Prince Edward Road East. The proposal was subsequently abandoned

owing to serious traffic impact during the construction period and social cost involved.

7. The same Member asked why the part of Kai Tak Nullah between Shatin Pass Road and Tai Shing Street was required to be decked over. Mr. Yue replied that this section of the nullah was proposed to be decked over due to traffic concern and it was also in response to the request of the Wong Tai Sin District Council. He said the decked over area would be provided with landscape and sitting-out areas with water features. The Kai Tak Nullah would become a tourist attraction complementing with the other tourist spots, such as the Longin Bridge Archaeological Site, Nga Tsin Wai Conservation Park, Wong Tai Sin Temple and Chi Lin Nunnery in the surrounding areas.

8. As requested by a Member, Mr. Yue showed a 3-Dimensional fly-through taken at ground level along Kai Tak Nullah. The same Member said that it was important to ensure that public view towards Lion Rock should not be blocked when walking along Kai Tak Nullah. However, this Member noted that part of Lion Rock would be blocked by the Nga Tsin Wai redevelopment at certain point along the Nullah. This Member said that it was also important to enhance permeability of the development at ground level so as to allow better air ventilation and integration with the design of Kai Tak Nullah. Mr. Yue replied that under the BH restrictions recommended, public view towards Lion Rock from Kai Tak Nullah would not be blocked along almost the whole section of the Nullah, except certain spots where the view would be relatively restrictive. Various BH options had been considered for Nga Tsin Wai Redevelopment and the proposed BH was a compromise between conservation and development given that the heritage elements within the central part of the site would be preserved as a conservation park where no residential towers could be built. The same Member further suggested that the ground level design should reflect the character of Nga Tsin Wai as a walled village by imitating the street pattern or marking the boundary of the walled village. The Secretary said that the Explanatory Statement (ES) of the OZP had already stated clearly that the stepped BH profile of the site was to preserve the Lion Rock ridgeline from Kai Tak view corridor. If Members considered it necessary, the Secretary said that the suggestions on improving the permeability and incorporating the previous character of the walled village within the overall design of the development could be conveyed to URA for consideration. The suggestion could also be included in the ES to guide the design of the site. Members agreed.

[Dr. Winnie Tang arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

9. Another Member asked why a BH of 134mPD, which exceeded the BH restriction of 100mPD in the surrounding areas, was proposed for the Nga Tsin Wai Village Redevelopment site. This Member asked if the BH restrictions for the different towers in the site could be more even to avoid the exceptional tall towers. Mr. Yue responded that if the BH of the lower blocks was relaxed, the view towards Lion Rock would be blocked. The BH restrictions of 106mPD for the north blocks and 100 and 134mPD for the south blocks had already balanced the need for conservation and development with due consideration to preserve the Lion Rock Ridgeline. Moreover, the AVA had shown that the proposed BH restrictions and air ventilation at ground level were acceptable.

10. A Member enquired if the NBA on both sides of Kai Tak Nullah could be designated to other zonings such as “O” to allow scope for implementing a continuous pedestrianised area. Mr. Yue replied that such approach had been considered but as some part of NBA had encroached upon private land, it would not be appropriate to rezone them as “O” unless the Government was prepared to resume the land involved. NBA was imposed to ensure that no structure could be built in these areas. Implementation of amenity and landscaped areas were always permitted in all zonings including areas designated as NBAs. The Secretary supplemented that part of the Nullah was rezoned to “U” and whether the area would be used for open space purpose would depend on the results of the public engagement exercise to be conducted by relevant Government departments.

11. A Member asked whether Shatin to Central Link (SCL) would affect the Area and whether rezoning was required. Mr. Yue responded that a ventilation building might need to be built at Ma Chai Hang Playground and the open space area taken up would need to be compensated. The Secretary supplemented that under section 13A of the Town Planning Ordinance (the Ordinance), any scheme authorized under the Railways Ordinance (Cap. 519) should be deemed to be approved under the Ordinance and consequential rezoning might be required. Regarding the SCL, Highways Department would be invited to brief Members on the project once the scheme was gazetted.

12. Referring to Plan 14E of the Paper, a Member asked whether the BH of 60mPD for Mei Tung Estate could be lowered in order to preserve the view from the central axis of

the Kowloon Walled City Park looking northwest. Mr. Yue replied that Mei Tung Estate had an existing BH of 49 to 55mPD (8 to 12 storeys) with a building age of 26-35 years which had a high potential for redevelopment. The proposed BH restrictions was a modest increase. The proposed redevelopment would be partly hidden by the trees in the Kowloon Walled City Park. The proposed BH had already struck a balance between visual impact consideration and flat production target of Housing Department (HD). The Secretary said the footprints of building blocks as shown on the photomontage were only indicative and there was no concrete proposal from HD yet. Members' concern could be conveyed to HD for consideration in their detailed design if the estate was to be redeveloped. Members agreed.

Deliberation

13. After further deliberation, the Committee decided to :
- (a) agree to the proposed amendments to the approved Wang Tau Hom & Tung Tau OZP No. S/K8/19 and that the draft Wang Tau Hom & Tung Tau OZP No. S/K8/19A at Appendix I (to be renumbered to S/K8/20 upon gazetting) and its Notes at Appendix II of the Paper were suitable for exhibition for public inspection under section 5 of the Ordinance;
 - (b) adopt the revised Explanatory Statement (ES) at Appendix III of the Paper as an expression of the planning intentions and objectives of the Town Planning Board (the Board) for the various land use zonings of the OZP and to be issued under the name of the Board; and
 - (c) agree that the revised ES was suitable for exhibition together with the OZP and its Notes.

[The Chairman thanked Mr. Eric C.K. Yue, DPO/K, Miss Annie K.W. To, STP/K, and Ms. Una Wang, AVA Consultant for their attendance to answer Members' enquiries. They left the meeting at this point.]