

## CHAPTER 5

### REVIEW OF CATEGORIES OF ALLOWANCES

5.1 After considering the general principles which should govern eligibility for allowances, and the rates for them, we examined the broad issues and common problems relating to individual categories of allowances including Extraneous Duties Allowances, Hardship Allowances and Special Allowances. Shift Duty Allowances were not included as the relevant issues had already been dealt with in our Report No. 10. In our review of the various categories of allowances, we did not examine individual payments because we considered that this task called for the detailed examination of jobs by the Administration and departmental managements in accordance with the general principles recommended in this Report.

#### Extraneous Duties Allowances

5.2 Extraneous Duties Allowances are allowances granted to officers who are regularly required to perform duties outside the scope of those normally performed by members of their ranks or grades. We note that these allowances are paid in a variety of circumstances in different departments and that there is no precise definition of what should be regarded as extraneous duties. An illustration of the current distribution of Extraneous Duties Allowances is at Appendix VI.

#### Definition of Extraneous Duties

5.3 We have considered whether it would be feasible and desirable to define extraneous duties more clearly, but we concluded that it would be impracticable to draw up precise job descriptions or guides to appointment for posts and then define extraneous duties on this basis without loss of flexibility and efficiency.

5.4 We therefore recommend that no formal definition should be laid down for "extraneous duties" but that Heads of Department should regularly update the duties and responsibilities of posts for which they are responsible and ensure that their staff understand and accept the most up-to-date requirements of their jobs.

Number of Levels and Rates for Extraneous Duties Allowances  
(Supplementary Duties)

---

5.5 Standard Extraneous Duties Allowances (Supplementary Duties) are paid in three levels depending on the extent of skills required : Level 1 for extra duties which require little or no skill, Level 2 for extra duties which require some skill or the passing of a test, and Level 3 for extra duties which require specialised skill or the passing of an advanced test. The standard rates are 5% of MPS 1 for Level 1, 7.5% of MPS 1 for Level 2 and 10% of MPS 1 for Level 3.

5.6 Respondents to the Consultative Document expressed different views on the appropriate number of levels of Extraneous Duties Allowances (Supplementary Duties). We consider that, given the variety of situations under which Extraneous Duties Allowances (Supplementary Duties) are paid, levels of payments must continue to be broadbanded and that it would not serve any useful purpose to introduce additional levels of payment.

5.7 As regards a possible reduction in the number of levels of Extraneous Duties Allowances (Supplementary Duties), we consider that the payment of Extraneous Duties Allowances at Level 1 is difficult to justify as little or no additional skill is called for. We accordingly recommend that this level of payment should be abolished.

5.8 As regards the payment of Extraneous Duties Allowances at Levels 2 and 3, we are not convinced, on the information available, that the current division is necessarily correct. We noted, for example, that Extraneous Duties Allowances (Supplementary Duties) at Level 2 accounted for over 80% of the Extraneous Duties Allowances paid and that there may be a case for splitting this level into two.

5.9 We therefore recommend that the Administration should review individual items of Extraneous Duties Allowances at this level and then refer its findings to us to consider whether there is a case for splitting these payments.

Payment of Extraneous Duties Allowances for Driving Duties

5.10 As over half of all Extraneous Duties Allowances are presently paid for driving duties at Extraneous Duties Allowances (Supplementary Duties) Levels 2 and 3, we considered in detail whether these payments are justified. There are strong arguments both for and against their retention, as circumstances have changed tremendously since the 1940s when the driving allowance was first introduced.

5.11 After taking the various factors into consideration, we concluded that the abolition of allowances for driving duties should not be adopted as a general policy because officers who drive on duty do take on additional responsibility for a vehicle and its passengers. We therefore recommend that the Administration should carry out a critical review of individual payments for driving duties to ensure that : -

- (a) such duties are not part of the inherent duties of a grade; and
- (b) allowances are only paid if the officers concerned are required to drive on duty reasonably often and, in so doing, take on significant additional responsibility.

#### Payment of Extraneous Duties Allowances to Staff of the Disciplined Services

5.12 We also considered whether the large proportion of payments of Extraneous Duties Allowances made to members of the disciplined services is justified. For practical reasons we recommend that the payment of Extraneous Duties Allowances to the disciplined services should continue for the time being but should be re-examined when the Disciplined Services Pay Scales are next reviewed.

5.13 We also considered whether the number of payments of Extraneous Duties Allowances to the disciplined services could be reduced by arranging for special civilian grades to take over certain civilian duties performed by rank and file members of the Police Force. In this connection we note that the Commissioner of Police has proposed the creation of a new grade of Police Cook and that the proposal is under preliminary consideration by the Administration. In general, however, we accept that for practical, operational and costing reasons, it may be desirable to employ policemen on duties that could otherwise be performed by civilians, particularly where the staff concerned may be required to carry out these duties during emergencies or internal security situations.

#### Non-standard Extraneous Duties Allowances

5.14 There are two types of Extraneous Duties Allowances which do not have standard rates : the Extraneous Duties Allowance (Responsibility) and the Extraneous Duties Allowance (Non-standard). Both have been introduced to cover specific circumstances with rates varying from case to case.

5.15 To streamline the job-related allowance system, we recommend that the two non-standard Extraneous Duties Allowances and a few Extraneous Duties Allowances (Supplementary Duties) at Level 3 which do not follow the standard rate should be transferred to a new category of "Non-standard Allowances" and this is discussed in paragraph 5.24.

### Hardship Allowances

5.16 Hardship Allowances are defined under Civil Service Regulations as allowances granted to officers who are required to perform duties of a particularly obnoxious nature, or to perform these duties in dangerous or particularly unpleasant conditions. An illustration of the current distribution of Hardship Allowances is at Appendix VII. However, whether or not a particular type of duty contains elements of hardship has so far been determined subjectively, having regard to the circumstances of each case.

5.17 We consider that whether or not a particular duty should be regarded as involving hardship should continue to be determined by reference to the circumstances of each case and recommend that no formal definition of hardship should be laid down.

### Payment of Hardship Allowances for Duties Inherent in the Rank of a Grade

5.18 We note that Hardship Allowances are currently paid to certain grades even though the duties they perform are specifically implied in their titles. In accordance with the principle set out in paragraph 3.11 of Chapter 3, the payment of Hardship Allowances cannot be justified in these cases unless the pay structure of these grades is such that the duties which attract the payment of allowances are not reflected in their pay scales.

5.19 We therefore recommend that the Administration should review the justification for all existing payments of Hardship Allowances in accordance with the general principles set out in Chapter 3.

### Hardship Allowances (Obnoxious Duties)

5.20 We have examined the working rules used by the Civil Service Branch to determine eligibility for the payment of Hardship Allowances (Obnoxious Duties). Whilst we feel that it is not feasible to lay down a general definition of obnoxious duties, we recommend that the decision whether or not duties should be regarded as obnoxious should take into account : -

- (a) the general duties of the grade and the nature of its work. For example, for most menial jobs, it may not be appropriate to regard duties which are only slightly obnoxious as so obnoxious as to justify the payment of an allowance; and
- (b) the latest mode of operation of the jobs concerned, as technological developments and improvements in methods may have reduced the obnoxious nature of some menial jobs.

### Hardship Allowances (Dangerous Duties)

5.21 We consider that it would be neither appropriate to limit eligibility for Hardship Allowances (Dangerous Duties) by specifying a minimum percentage of an officer's working time for which dangerous duties should be performed, nor practicable to lay down a general definition of dangerous duties. We recommend however that the Administration should review individual payments of Hardship Allowances (Dangerous Duties) in accordance with the general principles stated in Chapter 3 with particular reference to the principle that job-related allowances should not be paid to officers unless extra or unusual duties take up a substantial part of their time.

### Hardship Allowances (Management Considerations)

5.22 Hardship Allowances (Management Considerations) are paid in specific situations and they involve non-standard rates. To streamline the job-related allowance system, we recommend that these allowances should be transferred to a new category of "Non-standard Allowances", after they have been critically reviewed by the Administration to ensure that their payment is justified and that their rates are appropriate.

### Special Allowances

5.23 Special Allowances were introduced for use in exceptional situations which are not covered by other allowances. The circumstances under which Special Allowances are paid vary and there are no standard rates, the amount to be paid depending on the merits of each case. An illustration of the distribution of Special Allowances is at Appendix VIII.

### Non-standard Allowances

5.24 While we consider that some of the existing Special Allowances could be incorporated into other categories, there is still a need to make provision for their payment. To streamline the system, we recommend that these allowances should be transferred to a new category of "Non-standard Allowances", incorporating Extraneous Duties Allowances (Responsibility), Extraneous Duties Allowances (Non-standard), Hardship Allowances (Management Considerations), Shift Duty Allowances (Non-standard), Special Allowances and all the other allowances with special rates which are at present included in different categories and accorded different names.

5.25 We recommend that all existing Non-standard Allowances should be critically examined by the Administration in accordance with the principles recommended in this Report in order to establish that their retention is justified and their rates are appropriate. To discourage a proliferation of Non-standard Allowances, we further recommend that the creation of any new

types of "Non-standard Allowances" should be subject to the advice of the Standing Commission.