

CHAPTER 6

THE DISCIPLINED SERVICES

Introduction

6.1 The disciplined services occupy a special place within the civil service, in our opinion justifiably so. While their duties and responsibilities vary widely they all have an important role to play in the security, safety and well-being of Hong Kong and its people. They are subject to strict disciplinary codes and their work can be dangerous, distasteful and unpopular. Other civil servants claim that their work is dangerous, distasteful and unpopular and that they are of equal value to the community. We consider, however, that the extent to which the disciplined services are subject to these conditions is of a sufficiently greater degree to warrant their forming a separate group within the civil service and we propose to treat them as such in this review.

Composition of the disciplined services

6.2 At present the disciplined services comprise the Customs and Excise Service, the Fire Services, the Immigration Service, the Prisons Service and the Royal Hong Kong Police Force. One of our first considerations has been whether or not there should be any changes in the composition of the disciplined services. It has for example been suggested to us that the duties of the Immigration Service are more closely allied to those of the clerical and executive grades than to a disciplined service. We are not in a position at this stage to make such a judgement and a detailed study will be needed before we could consider changing its present status. For the purpose of this review we have therefore continued to treat the Immigration Service as a disciplined service. We have also received requests for grades to be added to the disciplined services but we recommend no change in their composition in this review.

6.3 The Hawker Control Force, formerly a disciplined service, has been disbanded and is dealt with in Chapter 18.

General considerations on pay

6.4 The existing arrangements whereby the rank and file of the disciplined services are paid from a number of separate scales and the officer ranks from the Master Pay Scale are, in our opinion, unsatisfactory. From the representations we have received it is clear that the attempt to establish differences between the disciplined services at the rank and file level by paying them on different scales with varying incremental steps has not resolved internal relativity arguments. Rather it has

/ provided

provided grounds for further argument over the size and number of increments. Furthermore, the factors which justify affording the disciplined services special treatment apply in large part, if not equally, to the less senior officer ranks. Thus the circumstances which warrant a separate pay scale for the rank and file also merit a separate scale for those less senior officers.

6.5 We therefore propose that in future the disciplined services should have their own consolidated pay scale. The very real differences between the services would then be reflected by assigning appropriate pay levels to the various ranks within a single scale, just as the differences between grades in the rest of the civil service are reflected within the framework of the Master Pay Scale.

6.6 Our recommended Disciplined Services Pay Scale, divided into scales (R) and (O) for rank and file and officers respectively, is set out in the Tables B and C at the end of this chapter. (1) As will be seen, the top six points on the officers' scale are identical with the equivalent points on our proposed Master Pay Scale. At this level we consider that the duties of officers in the disciplined services are more administrative in nature and thus more comparable with those of other civil servants. In the case of the Police, we were asked to consider extending the pay scale beyond the maximum of the Master Pay Scale. But to accede to this request would have involved us in exercising a judgement to the effect that a Senior Superintendent merited a higher pay scale than say a Senior Medical and Health Officer, a judgement we are not prepared to make. Among the higher ranks of the civil service we believe the principle of broadbanding should be applied to all sectors of the service, including the disciplined services.

Factors affecting pay

6.7 The existing pay scales of the rank and file in the disciplined services were established by means of the so-called "Willink" formula. This formula, an adaptation of the one used by the 1960 Royal Commission on the U.K. Police chaired by Sir Henry Willink, established the pay scales of the entry ranks by taking points on Model Scale 1 and applying percentage increases for a number of factors. The pay scales for higher ranks including the officer ranks are built on to the entry rank scales taking account of relative levels of responsibility.

6.8 In commenting on the disciplined services in our First Report we gave notice of our intention to abandon the "Willink" formula and to adopt the approach of more recent U.K. Commissions of Inquiry into disciplined services' pay. The approach of these Commissions has been to depart from any precise formula for determining pay and instead, as expressed in the Edmund-Davies Report on the U.K. Police, to review all the relevant factors and to make the best judgement they could.

(1) Referred to in later paragraphs as DPS (R) and DPS (O).

6.9 While we have abandoned the "willink" formula we have continued to take account of the factors used in that formula. In addition we have had regard to the variety and complexity of duties, the individual responsibility at each rank level, general working conditions, recruitment and retention difficulties and any other factors which we consider relevant to the particular disciplined service concerned. We have then exercised our best judgement in determining the pay scales which should be applied to the various ranks.

Starting pay

6.10 We consider that formal educational qualifications, while important for ensuring a satisfactory standard of recruit both to the rank and file and to the officer ranks, are nevertheless a secondary consideration in setting the overall pay scales for the disciplined services. At the same time we believe it necessary to give recognition to recruits who possess higher educational qualifications than the minimum as a means of encouraging a high standard of recruit to the disciplined services. We therefore propose there should be multiple entry points for recruits to the disciplined services both at the rank and file and officer levels.

6.11 At present additional increments are granted to rank and file recruits with higher qualifications in the Royal Hong Kong Police Force, the Prisons Service and the Customs and Excise Service but not to those in the Fire Services and Immigration Service. We now recommend that provision should be made in all the disciplined services for recruits who have completed a full five years of secondary education to enter at the second point in their scale; for those who have obtained a minimum of three "E"s in the Hong Kong Certificate of Education to enter at the third point of their scale; and for those who have obtained a minimum of five "E"s in the Hong Kong Certificate of Education, including English, to enter at the fourth point in the scale.

6.12 In the case of the officer ranks existing entry points already vary widely according to educational qualifications. While the system of multiple entry points for the officer ranks of the disciplined services should continue, we consider that the present arrangements should be simplified. We therefore propose that apart from the Immigration Service the basic entry points for officer ranks should be set on the assumption that matriculation should be the normal entry qualification. Officers with qualifications below matriculation with other exceptional qualities should enter the scale two points below the basic entry point. Officers with educational qualifications above matriculation, e.g. with a degree, should enter the scale two points above the basic entry point.

/ 6.13

6.13 We regard the Immigration Service as different from the other disciplined services insofar as entry to the officer ranks is concerned. Although the Immigration Service attracts a number of matriculants the duties of the entry rank are more commensurate with a school certificate education. The unusual situation in this service whereby degree holders enter at the Immigration Officer level rather than as Assistant Immigration Officer is, in our view, unsatisfactory. In this case, therefore, we have set the entry point for Assistant Immigration Officer at a level which we consider appropriate for school certificate holders. Recruits with higher educational qualifications should then be accorded incremental credit as in the other disciplined services. That is to say matriculants should enter the scale two points above the entry point for school certificate recruits and degree holders at a further two points above the entry point for matriculants.

6.14 In accordance with the recommendations contained in our First Report on Principles and Practices, our proposed scales make no provision for incremental jumps on confirmation or following training. We have nevertheless taken account of the removal of the incremental jumps in setting the pay scales.

Royal Hong Kong Police Force

6.15 The wide discretionary powers including the use of arms entrusted to the rank and file and junior officers when added to the other factors of special application to the disciplined services justify placing the Police in a separate category within the disciplined services. We have taken due account of this in our proposed pay scales.

Rank and file

6.16 We accept the view that the duties and responsibilities of the rank and file are today such that recruits should have received a good general education. Ideally the minimum educational standard should be completion of five years' secondary education with three "E"s in the Hong Kong Certificate of Education. We appreciate however that to introduce such a minimum educational requirement at this point in time would unduly restrict the field of recruits. In the circumstances we have continued to provide for good candidates with lower educational qualifications and entry points should therefore be determined in accordance with paragraph 6.11. In the longer term we would hope that the need to provide entry points for less well educated recruits can be dispensed with and as standards improve there will be more opportunity for promotion from the rank and file to the officer ranks.

6.17 Recruits who have satisfactorily completed training at the Police Cadet School should be regarded as equivalent to

/ candidates

candidates with a minimum of three "E"s in the Hong Kong Certificate of Education.

6.18 Our proposed pay scales for the rank and file are as follows :

	<u>Existing</u>	<u>Proposed</u>	<u>Long Service Increment</u>
Constable	PF 1-13	DPS (R) 8-21	22, 23
Sergeant	PF 14-21	DPS (R) 22-29	-
Station Sergeant	PF 22-29	DPS (R) 30-37	-

Officer ranks

6.19 We consider the present arrangements for advancement between the overlapping Inspector and Senior Inspector ranks should be retained. However we recommend that the Senior Inspector rank should be assigned specific points in the scale. Inspectors who qualify for early promotion to Senior Inspector should advance to the minimum point of the Senior Inspector's scale while an Inspector who is promoted after reaching the minimum point of the Senior Inspector's scale should receive the normal one increment on promotion.

6.20 The present arrangements whereby the Chief Inspector has a three-point scale and the Superintendent has a six-point scale are considered unsatisfactory and we recommend that these structures be reversed. The Senior Superintendent rank is broadbanded with other senior ranks of the civil service including other disciplined services senior ranks.

6.21 Our proposed pay scales for the officer ranks are :

	<u>Existing</u>	<u>Proposed</u>
Inspector	MPS 23-36	DPS (O) 10-23
Senior Inspector	-	DPS (O) 19-23
Chief Inspector	MPS 37-39	DPS (O) 24-28
Superintendent	MPS 40-45	DPS (O) 29-31
Senior Superintendent	MPS 46-48	DPS (O) 32-34

6.22 Our attention has been drawn to the problem of the recruitment and retention of expatriate police officers. We do not believe that pay scales for Hong Kong public servants should take account of pay awards overseas which have been made against a completely different background. We consider that pay in Hong Kong should be related to Hong Kong's

/ circumstances

circumstances. We do recommend, however, that to assist in recruitment increments should be awarded for previous relevant experience. Such incremental credit should not, of course, be restricted only to expatriate recruits.

Fire Services

6.23 We are aware of the significant degree of danger to which members of the Fire Services are exposed during their attendance at fires and when engaged on rescue duties. The Fire Services also require the highest physical standards for entry. We have taken due account of these factors in our proposals for this service.

Rank and file

6.24 The introduction of a consolidated disciplined services pay scale results in some changes to the number of pay-points in the rank and file scales. Beyond this we have improved the scale in line with those of the disciplined services as a whole.

6.25 Our proposed pay scales for the rank and file are :

	<u>Existing</u>	<u>Proposed</u>	<u>Long Service Increment</u>
Fireman	FS 1-15	DPS (R) 5-19	20, 21
Senior Fireman	FS 16-23	DPS (R) 20-28	-
Principal Fireman	FS 24-29	DPS (R) 29-33	-

Officer ranks

6.26 The present situation whereby Station Officers on probation are appointed as Assistant Station Officers is, in our opinion, misleading and counter-productive to recruitment. We therefore propose that the two ranks should be combined. Station Officer recruits will, of course, still have to fulfil the necessary requirements applicable to the existing Assistant Station Officer rank before they can be confirmed in their appointment.

6.27 We also recommend provision should be made for a new Senior Station Officer rank within the overall pay scale for Station Officers, on the same basis as the Police Inspector/Senior Inspector combined rank. That is to say requirements should be laid down which would allow Station Officers to be promoted to Senior Station Officer in the same manner as Police Inspectors are promoted to Senior Inspector.

6.28 For senior ranks at present on the Master Pay Scale we recommend that the pay scales for Assistant Divisional Officer and Divisional Officer be revised in line with the pay scales proposed for Chief Inspectors and Superintendents in the Police Force.

6.29 We have been advised that there is a change in the officer ranks in the Fire Services in that a rank of Senior Divisional Officer has been created to replace the rank of Assistant Chief Fire Officer. We have seen no details of this revision but the rank at present attracting MPS Points 46-48 should be paid from the top three points of our proposed disciplined services pay scale. We have shown the rank as Senior Divisional Officer.

6.30 Our proposed pay scales for the officer ranks are :

	<u>Existing</u>	<u>Proposed</u>
Assistant Station Officer	MPS 19-23	-
Station Officer	MPS 27-36	DPS (O) 8-23
Senior Station Officer	-	DPS (O) 19-23
Assistant Divisional Officer	MPS 37-39	DPS (O) 24-28
Divisional Officer	MPS 40-45	DPS (O) 29-31
Senior Divisional Officer	MPS 46-48	DPS (O) 32-34

Ambulance Command

6.31 The Ambulance Command is part of the Fire Services and the pay scales for both the rank and file and the officer ranks are at present identical. In the case of the rank and file we propose no change in these arrangements. The Ambulancemen work very closely with Firemen and have similar duties and working conditions which justify, in our opinion, their continuing to be paid at the same rate as Firemen.

6.32 We do not consider however that there is the same requirement for parity between the officer ranks. The Ambulance Officers are largely engaged in administration and the factors which justify the scales accorded to Fire Officers do not in the main apply to Ambulance Officers. We therefore propose that the starting pay and the ranking structure of Ambulance Officers be brought into line with those of the Customs and Excise and Prisons Services.

Rank and file

6.33 Our proposed pay scales for the rank and file are :

	<u>Existing</u>	<u>Proposed</u>	<u>Long Service Increment</u>
Ambulanceman	AM 1-15	DPS (R) 5-19	20, 21
Senior Ambulanceman	AM 16-23	DPS (R) 20-28	-
Principal Ambulanceman	AM 24-29	DPS (R) 29-33	-

Officer ranks

6.34 Our proposals for pay scales for the officer ranks take account of the position at the time we commenced our review. Subsequently we have been made aware of the upgrading of the Chief Ambulance Officer to Directorate level and to changes in the titles and responsibilities of the officer ranks in the Fire Services. These changes may or may not warrant some modification to the structure we have proposed for Ambulance Officers but we have been unable to examine the new position at this time.

6.35 For the time being our proposed pay scales for the officer ranks are :

	<u>Existing</u>	<u>Proposed</u>
Ambulance Officer	MPS 19-36	DPS (O) 6-18
Senior Ambulance Officer	MPS 37-39	DPS (O) 19-23
Superintendent (Ambulance)	MPS 40-42	DPS (O) 24-28
Assistant Chief Ambulance Officer	MPS 43-45	DPS (O) 29-31

Customs and Excise Service

6.36 The Customs and Excise Service plays a key role in revenue protection and measures against smuggling. It is subject to many of the factors applicable to the other disciplined services and although the duties and responsibilities differ widely we consider in total they justify comparable pay to the Fire and Prisons Services.